



CITY OF HAMILTON
PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT
Environmental Services Division

TO:	Chair and Members Public Works Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	December 4, 2023
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED) Recommendation Report (PW23075) (City Wide) (Outstanding Business List Item)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	City Wide
PREPARED BY:	Shauna Hasselman (905) 546-2424 Ext. 7734
SUBMITTED BY:	Cynthia Graham Director, Environmental Services Public Works Department
SIGNATURE:	

RECOMMENDATION

- (a) That the recommended actions in Appendices “A”, “B”, “C”, “D”, and “E” to Report PW23075 be supported approved and that all capital or operational financial enhancements, \$254,500 operational and \$165,000 capital be referred to the 2024 budget process for consideration; and
- (b) That the Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design study for the City owned escarpment stairs be identified as complete and removed from the Public Works Committee Outstanding Business List.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

On February 13, 2023 at the Public Works Committee meeting, staff were directed to conduct a Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design review of the five City-owned escarpment staircases and report back on recommendations to improve the safety of escarpment staircase use, specifically to prevent sexual violence, including any considerations to be referred to the 2024 budget process for consideration.

There are five sets of stairs along the Niagara Escarpment linking the lower city to the upper city. These staircases at Chedoke, Dundurn, James Street, Kenilworth/Margate,

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

and Wentworth streets are managed by the Parks and Cemeteries section of Public Works.

At the February 13, 2023 Public Works Committee meeting, council recognized the need to ensure resident safety in these spaces. Sexual assault cases are on the rise in the City of Hamilton. In 2022, Hamilton Police Services counted 605 sexual assault cases. This is up 4.1% from 2021's 580 cases. The City's Sexual Assault Centre has seen a dramatic increase in calls to their 24-hour support line over the past three years. Many residents of Hamilton who have experienced sexual violence on the escarpment stairs have asked the City of Hamilton to provide safer pathways for both commuting and exercise.

Public Works Parks and Cemeteries Section along with Hamilton Police Services completed a Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design review in June of 2023. The focus of the recommendations from the Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design report were on the ability to 'see and be seen'. The focus of the report speaks to ensuring the current lighting is adequate and in good working order, and that the vegetation in and around the stairs is maintained to allow sight lines. These recommendations will allow residents to see within their surroundings and to reduce criminal activity.

This Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design review and the recommendations will be used to create a safer environment for all residents, as outlined in Appendices "A", "B", "C", "D", and "E" to Report PW23075.

Alternatives for Consideration – Not Applicable

FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: In order to implement the recommendations of the Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design review as outlined in the Appendices of Report PW23075, an estimated operating budget increase of \$254,500, and an estimated capital budget increase of \$165,000 are required and will be referred to the 2024 Budget process.

Staffing: N/A

Legal: N/A

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Originally, the City had seven stairs – Chedoke Park, Dundurn Street, Ferguson Avenue, James Street, John Street, Ottawa Street, and Wentworth Street. When the

Jolley Cut was rebuilt, the steps at John and Ferguson Streets were incorporated in the walkways at Sam Lawrence Park. Currently, the City has five sanctioned staircases that connect

the upper and lower city along the Niagara Escarpment. These stairs allow City residents to commute to work without driving and are popular exercise locations. The Wentworth Stairs built in 1903 were the first stairs in Hamilton. These wooden steps were located next to the Eastend Incline railway (closed in 1936). Following a rockslide, these steps were rebuilt using metal in 1983 and now follow the path of the Incline railway. They connect with the Rail Trail as well as the Bruce Trail. The Dundurn Stairs were wooden until the 1990's when they were replaced with metal. These stairs are within one kilometre of the Chedoke Stairs, and both are often used together for exercising.

The Chedoke Stairs were built to accommodate two pedestrian lanes and two bike troughs. These are widely known as the busiest stairs in the City. In 2022, Hamilton Pedestrian and Cyclists Counts reported more than 710,000 visitors, with a daily average of just under 2,000 visitors. The Kenilworth Stairs (also known as the Kimberly Drive Stairs) in combination with the Margate Stairs are the most popular stairs this year to date. Hamilton's Pedestrian and Cyclists Counts have calculated a running total of 631,256 visitors (as of October 11, 2023). The stairs were built to connect the East Mountain to the Escarpment Rail Trail. The James Street Stairs are located on the former site of Hamilton's first Incline Railway. The stairs were first built using wood but were replaced with metal stairs in 1987.

In December 2021, an unknown man approached a resident and attempted to sexually assault her during her morning daylight workout on the James Street escarpment stairs. Before and after this date there have been other sexual assaults while on the stairs in Hamilton. In 2022, the Sexual Assault Centre (SACHA) received more than 2,000 calls regarding sexual assaults from across the City. This is up by 22% from 2021. Hamilton Police Services received over 600 sexual assault calls from across the city. Due to a lack of specific addresses, it is not possible to aggregate the numbers of sexual assault cases on the stairs themselves.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

Below are policy implications for the subject report:

The City of Hamilton vision to be the best place to raise a child and age successfully. To meet that standard, it's important for the City to prioritize the health and safety of its residents.

**SUBJECT: Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED)
Recommendation Report (PW23075) (City Wide) – Page 4 of 8**

United Nations Gender Policy and Plan: United Nations-Habitat Policy and Plan for Gender Equality and the Rights of Women in Urban Development and Human Settlements. This report urges cities to become safer by applying a gender-responsive approach to urban planning.

United Nations report Cities Alive: Designing Cities That Work for Women published in October 2022, it is stated that “without a gender-responsive approach to urban planning, cities often compound gender inequalities that restrict women’s social and economic opportunities, health and wellbeing, sense of safety and security, and access to justice and equity”

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

Hamilton Police Services, Crime Prevention Unit completed a Crime Prevention through Environmental Design report for five escarpment stairs and provided input regarding all policing aspects.

Facilities Department, Corporate Security Management staff provided input on all security aspects.

ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

Many recommendations in the Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design reports (Appendices “A”, “B”, “C”, “D”, and “E”) were similar, with vegetation overgrowth and lighting concerns being the main issues.

A recommendation not reflected in the table below refers to consideration for widening the stairs at Dundurn, James Street, and Wentworth to accommodate two pedestrian lanes and bike troughs. Specifically, the recommendation requests that this would be completed at the end of the respective stairs’ life cycle.

Operating Budget		
Recommendations	Estimated Costs	Comments
Increase the number of times stairs get inspected	\$3,000.00	Current operational budget is for one visit per year. One additional visit is reflected in this estimated cost.
Increase the number of times vegetation in and around the stairs are pruned/trimmed/removed	\$25,000.00	Current operational budget is one vegetation trim and removal per year. One additional vegetation trim

**SUBJECT: Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED)
Recommendation Report (PW23075) (City Wide) – Page 5 of 8**

		and removal is reflected in this estimated cost based on recommendations from one additional inspection.
Continue converting halogen lights to LEDs for better visibility	\$0.00	The final light replacement was completed in August 2023 and this item is deemed complete.
Complete light audit for Dundurn, Kenilworth, and Wentworth Stairs	\$7,500.00	\$2,500 per staircase
Update addresses for stairs for easier emergency services response and police analytics	\$0.00	The work for this is being completed and city records and website will be updated.
Hiring additional security staff (staff or contractor) to patrol the areas during after hours	\$219,000	Security recommends a dedicated security presence is implemented. As an alternate, a random security patrol program could be considered but would require additional dedicated contract resources. Costing reflects this recommendation.
Increase community involvement by way of a neighbourhood watch program, community gardens, and fitness programs to increase use of stairs and access points to prevent criminal activity		A community garden is managed by the City through Neighbourhood Development. A neighbourhood watch program would be led by the Hamilton Police. Fitness programs could be led by both Hamilton Rec and outside organizations
Continue with a collaborative relationship between Hamilton Police Services, the City's Security departments, and Parks and Cemeteries departments to share information and statistics that affect the overall safety of the stairs	\$0.00	Create a subcommittee to the Parks Security to discuss stair safety, to meet twice a year to share ideas and work with partners in the community to implement activations on/near the stairs.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

**SUBJECT: Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED)
Recommendation Report (PW23075) (City Wide) – Page 6 of 8**

Total Operating Budget	\$254,500	
------------------------	-----------	--

Capital Budget		
Recommendations	Estimated Cost	Comments
Installation of more lights in areas of low visibility, as per light audit	TBD	Costs will be confirmed when light audit is completed, and costs will be reflected in a future capital budget ask.
Installation of a section of James Street Stairs to mitigate a 'blind corner'	\$90,000.00	Expand platforms to connect with newly proposed Pedestrian Pathway.
Installation of signage identifying the location's address for quicker response from emergency services – Green archway sign (Parks standard). One at each main access to the stairs	\$70,000.00	New sign installation at the bottom and top of each stairway access. (14 signs x \$5,000 each)
Install signage along the stairs that provide information on how to report deficiencies to the City of Hamilton to ensure safety related items are mitigated in between stair inspections	\$5,000.00	Cost includes signs and installation (\$1,000 per location)
Choose one stair location to pilot a one-year pilot initiative to install motion-activated, self-recording, unmonitored security cameras for the purpose of identifying suspects in the event of an assault. This pilot will include signage identifying the cameras and a statistical analysis to prove its effectiveness.	TBD	The required infrastructure to support this type of project will need to be determined through support by electrical cabling and networking contractors. The deployment of CCTV systems would require the frequency of 1 camera per staircase run section up to 50 feet in length. A rough estimate to support a resilient installation may exceed an estimate of \$15,000 per camera, including the backend

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.
 OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.
 OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

**SUBJECT: Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED)
Recommendation Report (PW23075) (City Wide) – Page 7 of 8**

		<p>infrastructure. A typical for budget calculation used in a building environment is \$3,000 per camera. The use of CCTV will provide a recording of the activities that are captured within its view abilities; however it is unlikely to provide identifiable features of suspects. Disguises and means of preventing identifiable features of an individual from being viewed are practiced frequently in criminal behaviour. The use of CCTV cameras may be supportive for investigative measures by law enforcement, but they do not appear to be a deterrent to criminal behaviour in general. The installation of a CCTV system can be supportive to an overall program, where it compliments other elements such as physical presence and other deterrent and good use behaviours that are identified in this report.</p>
<p>Total Capital Budget</p>	<p>\$165,000</p>	

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

N/A

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix “A” to Report PW23075 – Chedoke Stairs

Appendix “B” to Report PW23075 – Dundurn Stairs

Appendix “C” to Report PW23075 – James Street Stairs

Appendix “D” to Report PW23075 – Kenilworth Stairs