

CITY OF HAMILTON PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT Planning Division

то:	Chair and Committee Members Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	January 26, 2024
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Recommendation to Designate 380-386 Wilson Street East, Ancaster (Former Ancaster Hotel and Coach House), under Part IV of the <i>Ontario Heritage Act</i> (PED24025) (Ward 12)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	Ward 12
PREPARED BY:	Scott Dickinson (905) 546-2424 Ext. 7167 Alissa Golden (905) 546-2423 Ext. 1202
SUBMITTED BY:	Shannon McKie Acting Director, Planning and Chief Planner Planning and Economic Development Department
SIGNATURE:	

RECOMMENDATION

That the City Clerk be directed to give notice of Council's intention to designate 380-386 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, known as the former Ancaster Hotel and Coach House, shown in Appendix "A" attached to Report PED24025, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, in accordance with the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED24025, subject to the following:

- (i) If no objections are received to the notice of intention to designate in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, City Council directs staff to introduce the necessary by-law to designate the property to be of cultural heritage value or interest to City Council;
- (ii) If an objection to the notice of intention to designate is received in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, City Council directs staff to report back to Council to allow Council to consider the objection and decide whether or not to withdraw the notice of intention to designate the property.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 380-386 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, (Former Ancaster Hotel and Coach House) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED24025) (Ward 12) - Page 2 of 7

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This Report recommends designation of the significant built heritage resources located at 380-386 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The subject property, known as the former Ancaster Hotel and Coach House, constructed originally circa 1832, is currently listed on the City's Municipal Heritage Register. Staff have completed an evaluation of the subject property using *Ontario Regulation 9/06* and determined that is has sufficient cultural heritage value or interest to warrant designation, as per the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED24025.

Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 7

FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: N/A

- Staffing: N/A
- Legal: The designation process will follow the requirements of the *Ontario Heritage Act* and provide for adequate notice of Council's intention to designate the properties. Formal objections may be made under the *Ontario Heritage Act* and considered by Council before either withdrawing the notice of intention to designate or passing a designation by-law. Once a designation by-law has been passed, any further objection would be heard before the Ontario Land Tribunal (OLT).

Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* allows municipalities to recognize a property's cultural heritage value or interest, and to conserve and manage the property through the Heritage Permit process enabled under Sections 33 (alterations) and 34 (demolition or removal) of the *Act*.

Where alterations to designated properties are contemplated, a property owner is required to apply for, obtain, and comply with a Heritage Permit, for any alteration that "is likely to affect the property's heritage attributes, as set out in the description of the property's heritage attributes" (Sub-section 33(1)).

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The subject property located at 380-386 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, shown in Appendix "A" attached to Report PED24025, is comprised of a two-and-one-half-storey stone building connected to a one-and-a-half-storey stone building, both constructed in

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 380-386 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, (Former Ancaster Hotel and Coach House) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED24025) (Ward 12) - Page 3 of 7

1832 and known as the former Ancaster Hotel and Coach House, respectively. The subject property was first surveyed for potential heritage interest in the 1970s.

Between 1976 and 1985, the Ancaster Local Architectural Conservation Advisory Committee (former Heritage Committee) conducted an inventory of properties of potential heritage interest to the community. In 1977, as part of this inventory, a heritage research report was prepared for the subject property. A copy of the 1977 report "Old Stone Hotel: 380-384" was utilized in the writing of this Report (see the Research Sources attached as Appendix "D" to Report PED24025).

In 2020, the property was listed on the Municipal Heritage Register and was added to staff's designation workplan for further research and assessment of the property. As a result of the recent Bill 23 changes to the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the former staff workplan for designation was rescinded and replaced with a new public list of Candidates for Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (see Report PED22211(a)), at which time 380-386 Wilson Street East was reprioritized for review for designation by January 1, 2025.

In a letter dated July 10, 2023, Cultural Heritage Planning staff notified the property owner of the changes to the City's heritage designation process and the reprioritization of staff's review of the property for designation. In a subsequent letter, dated December 12, 2023, staff advised the owner of the recommendation to designate the property, provided them with a copy of the proposed Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and advised them of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee meeting date that the recommendation would be considered. Staff have not received a response from the property owner to date.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

The recommendations of this Report are consistent with Provincial and Municipal legislation, policy and direction, including:

- Determining the cultural heritage value or interest of a property based on design/physical value, historical/associative value and contextual value criteria (*Ontario Heritage Act, Ontario Regulation 9/06*);
- Ensuring significant built heritage resources are conserved (*Provincial Policy Statement*, 2020, Sub-section 2.6.1); and,
- Designating properties of cultural heritage value under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (Urban Hamilton Official Plan, Section B.3.4.2.3).

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Employees.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 380-386 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, (Former Ancaster Hotel and Coach House) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED24025) (Ward 12) - Page 4 of 7

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

External

• Property Owner;

In addition, Cultural Heritage Planning staff have emailed the Ward Councillor (Councillor C. Cassar) for Ward 12 and provided an overview of the reasons for designation and the process for designating a property.

ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

The intent of municipal designation, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, is to enable a process for the management and conservation of significant cultural heritage resources. Once a property is designated, the municipality can manage change to a property through the Heritage Permit process to ensure that the significant features of the property are maintained.

Section 29(1) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* permits the Council of a municipality to designate property to be of cultural heritage value or interest where property meets two or more of the Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest prescribed in *Ontario Regulation 9/06*, as amended by *Ontario Regulation 569/22*, which identifies nine criteria in three broad categories: Design / Physical Value; Historical / Associative Value; and Contextual Value. The evaluation of cultural heritage value or interest of the subject property was completed by Cultural Heritage Planning staff based on a site visit of the exterior of the property conducted on August 28, 2023 (see photographs attached as Appendix "C" to Report PED24025) and available secondary and primary research sources (attached as Appendix "D" to Report PED24025). As outlined below, based on staff's cultural heritage evaluation, it was determined that the subject property meets 6 of the 9 criteria contained in *Ontario Regulation 9/06* in all three categories.

Design or Physical Value

1. The property located at 380-386 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, is comprised of a connected pair of stone buildings, including the former Ancaster Hotel (addresses 384-386), a two-and-a-half-storey structure constructed circa 1832 and extended circa 1878, and the one-and-one-half-storey former Coach House (addresses 380-382). The buildings are connected via a rear addition and form a U-shaped footprint with a central courtyard. The property has design or physical value as it is comprised of a representative examples of a vernacular stone commercial buildings with later additions influenced by the Gothic Revival style of architecture.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 380-386 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, (Former Ancaster Hotel and Coach House) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED24025) (Ward 12) - Page 5 of 7

The former Hotel structure is a rectangular two-and-a-half-storey stone building originally constructed circa 1832 as a two-storey stone structure with a hip roof that was extended circa 1878 to include a street-facing gable roof with a round-headed two-over-two window below. The building consists of a coursed ashlar stone front (west) façade and rubble stone walls on the side and rear elevations, and features dressed stone quoins, lug sills and lintels over doors and windows, transoms over the ground and second-storey doors and a visible seam in stonework between the 1832 and 1878 portions on side elevation. The Coach House is a rectangular one-and-a-half-storey stone building also constructed circa 1832 and features a front gable roof, stone walls (partially clad in wood siding) and dressed stone quoins.

The Gothic Revival influences are demonstrated in the circa 1878 extensions of the buildings and include serpentine bargeboards with foil arches and finials and remnant millwork in the two-storey front porch of the former Hotel building.

- 2. The property displays a high degree of craftsmanship, as evidenced by:
 - the Gothic Revival bargeboard present under the eaves of the gables;
 - the round stone arch over the window in the gable peak;
 - the quality of the stonework on the front facades; and,
 - the closely-matched masonry in the 1878 addition, including the type of stone and its application.
- 3. The property does not display a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

Historical or Associative Value

4. The property has direct association with the theme of early development of the Village of Ancaster. Built circa 1832 for George Rousseaux (1787-1851), son of prominent Ancaster settler John-Baptist Rousseaux (1758-1812), the Ancaster Hotel went through several names and many owners over the years.

In 1878, a fire destroyed the interior of the building. It was subsequently renovated with a large addition to the rear (east) and upper storey of the building. The delineation in the stonework between the original 1832 portion and the circa 1878 rear (east) addition is visible on the northern side wall facing Academy Street, including the remnant corner stone quoining. This rebuilding is likely when the Hotel and Coach House structures were joined at the rear. An engraving of the Hotel from 1859 shows a two-storey hip roof structure with no porch, suggesting that the existing gable roof, second-storey doorway, porch and

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 380-386 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, (Former Ancaster Hotel and Coach House) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED24025) (Ward 12) - Page 6 of 7

Gothic Revival ornamentation were added around the time of the post-fire renovations.

The Hotel and Coach House served as a meeting place and community focal point from its construction in 1832 to its conversion to apartments in 1950. As Ancaster was not connected to Canada's railway system, the hotel, located on Ancaster's main road, would have continued to have great importance to travelers well into the twentieth century. It continued to have local importance as the automobile was adopted, as indicated from a 1920s photograph showing the coach house converted into a garage and gas station. The property, now home to several local businesses and a popular restaurant, is still a draw for Ancaster residents and visitors alike.

- 5. The property does not yield or have the potential to yield information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture.
- 6. This property does not demonstrate or reflect the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to the community.

Contextual Value

- 7. The property defines the character of the surrounding area as the core of Ancaster Village. Though surrounded by modern construction, this pair of earlynineteenth century stone buildings sits on a corner lot at the intersection of two historic roads. This prominent location for a tavern and hotel, as well as several other historic stone structures nearby indicates the importance of this location to the Ancaster Village in the nineteenth century.
- 8. The property is visually, historically and functionally linked to its surroundings, being in its original location within the core of Ancaster Village, at a crossroads on the historic Wilson Street transportation corridor and Academy Street. The former Ancaster Hotel and Coach House were well placed for travelers visiting Ancaster, those travelling along Wilson Street, and was long remembered as a place for community members to gather locally.
- 9. The property is a considered to be a local landmark due to its prominent corner lot location in the center of the historic core of Ancaster Village. It was considered an important enough community building to warrant an engraving in Robert Surtee's (1835-1906) 1859 Map of Wentworth County. The property's inclusion in local walking tours and guides demonstrates its continued status as a community landmark.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Employees.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 380-386 Wilson Street East, Ancaster, (Former Ancaster Hotel and Coach House) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED24025) (Ward 12) - Page 7 of 7

Staff have determined that 380-386 Wilson Street East, Ancaster is of cultural heritage value or interest sufficient to warrant designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Heritage attributes of value include contextual attributes and the exterior facades of the two connected buildings as outlined in Appendix "B" to Report PED24025. Staff recommend designation according to the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED24025.

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the designation of property is a discretionary activity on the part of Council. Council, as advised by its Municipal Heritage Committee, may decide to designate property or decline to designate property.

Decline to Designate

By declining to designate, the municipality would be unable to provide long-term, legal protection to this significant cultural heritage resource (designation provides protection against inappropriate alterations and demolition) and would not fulfil the expectations established by existing municipal and provincial policies.

Without designation, the property would not be eligible for the City's financial incentives for heritage properties, including development charge exemption and grant and loan programs. Designation alone does not restrict the legal use of property, prohibit alterations and additions, nor does it restrict the sale of a property, or been demonstrated to directly affect its resale value. However, designation does allow the municipality to manage change to the heritage attributes of a property through the Heritage Permit process. Staff does not consider declining to designate any of the properties to be an appropriate conservation alternative.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix "A" to PED24025 – Location Map Appendix "B" to PED24025 – Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes Appendix "C" to PED24025 – Photographs Appendix "D" to PED24025 – Research Sources

SD/AG/sd

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.