



**GENERAL ISSUES COMMITTEE  
(OPERATING AND CAPITAL BUDGET)  
MINUTES 24-001(e)**

9:30 a.m.

Friday, January 26, 2024  
Council Chambers, City Hall, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor  
71 Main Street West, Hamilton, Ontario

**Present:** Mayor A. Horwath, Councillors J. P. Danko (Chair)  
J. Beattie, C. Cassar, B. Clark, M. Francis, T. Hwang,  
T. Jackson, C. Kroetsch, T. McMeekin, N. Nann, E. Pauls,  
M. Spadafora, M. Tadeson, A. Wilson, M. Wilson

**THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REFERRED TO COUNCIL FOR CONSIDERATION:**

**1. Municipally Generated Tax Cap (Item 8.1)**

**(McMeekin/Tadeson)**

WHEREAS, municipal property tax is generally considered a regressive form of taxation;

WHEREAS, Hamilton residential taxpayers are subject to amongst the highest per-capita municipal taxes in the country;

WHEREAS, many Hamilton citizens are being hammered and facing their own financial crisis which includes high inflation, high housing rental rates (eg. a 103% rise in the cost of a bachelor apartment from 2021 to 2023); escalating mortgage costs; A Bank of Canada rise in interest rates (raised up eight times in the last ten months) and the soaring increase in the price of essentials, like food, as evidenced by a reported 40% increased use of area food banks.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

That Hamilton City Council go on record to embrace a municipally generated tax cap no greater than 4% for the 2024 Budget.

**Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 14 to 2, as follows:**

Yes - Mayor Andrea Horwath

Yes	-	Ward 1	Councillor Maureen Wilson
No	-	Ward 2	Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 3	Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 4	Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5	Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6	Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 7	Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8	Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9	Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10	Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11	Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12	Councillor Craig Cassar
No	-	Ward 13	Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 14	Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 15	Councillor Ted McMeekin

**FOR INFORMATION:**

**(a) APPROVAL OF AGENDA (Item 1)**

The Committee Clerk advised of the following changes to the agenda:

**9. NOTICES OF MOTION**

- 9.1 Litter Management Service Enhancements (PW23076) - Council Referred Item #39: Litter Collection – Service Level Review
- 9.2 Reporting of Annual Expenditures on the Transportation Network in Alignment with the Asset Management Plan
- 9.3 Hamilton Police Services Board
- 9.4 Hamilton Apartment Rental Program
- 9.5 Hospital Capital Contribution (FCS23108)
- 9.6 2024 Tax Budget Amendments - Discretionary Development Charge Exemptions

**(Beattie/Nann)**

That the agenda for the January 26, 2024 General Issues Committee (Budget) meeting, be approved, as amended.

**Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 14 to 0, as follows:**

Absent	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch

Yes	-	Ward 3	Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 4	Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5	Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6	Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 7	Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8	Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9	Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10	Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11	Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12	Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 13	Councillor Alex Wilson
Absent	-	Ward 14	Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 15	Councillor Ted McMeekin

**(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)**

There were no declarations of interest.

**(c) STAFF PRESENTATIONS (Item 6)**

**(i) Planning and Economic Development - 2024 Budget Presentation (Item 6.1)**

Jason Thorne, General Manager of Planning and Economic Development addressed the Committee with a presentation respecting the Planning and Economic Development - 2024 Budget.

**(Cassar/McMeekin)**

That the staff presentation respecting Planning and Economic Development – 2024 Budget, be received.

**Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 14 to 0, as follows:**

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Absent	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Absent	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

Yes - Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin

**(ii) (M. Wilson/Cassar)**

That the General Issues Committee recess for 10 minutes until 11:16 am.

**Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 14 to 0, as follows:**

Yes - Mayor Andrea Horwath  
Yes - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson  
Yes - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch  
Yes - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann  
Absent - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang  
Yes - Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis  
Yes - Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson  
Yes - Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls  
Yes - Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko  
Yes - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark  
Yes - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie  
Yes - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson  
Yes - Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar  
Absent - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson  
Yes - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora  
Yes - Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin

**(iii) Public Works Department - 2024 Budget Presentation (Item 6.2)**

Carlyle Khan, General Manager, Public Works Department, addressed the Committee with a presentation respecting the Public Works Department - 2024 Budget.

**(Tadeson/A. Wilson)**

That the staff presentation respecting Public Works Department - 2024 Budget, be received.

**Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 14 to 0, as follows:**

Absent - Mayor Andrea Horwath  
Yes - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson  
Yes - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch  
Yes - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann  
Yes - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang  
Yes - Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis  
Yes - Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson  
Yes - Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls  
Yes - Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko  
Yes - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark  
Yes - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie  
Yes - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson

Yes - Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar  
Yes - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson  
Absent - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora  
Yes - Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin

**(iv) (Cassar/Kroetsch)**

That the General Issues Committee recess until 2:15 pm.

**Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 13 to 0, as follows:**

Absent - Mayor Andrea Horwath  
Yes - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson  
Yes - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch  
Yes - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann  
Yes - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang  
Absent - Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis  
Yes - Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson  
Yes - Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls  
Yes - Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko  
Yes - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark  
Yes - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie  
Yes - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson  
Yes - Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar  
Yes - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson  
Absent - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora  
Yes - Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin

**(d) NOTICES OF MOTION (Item 9)**

Councillor Hwang introduced the following Notice of Motion:

**(i) Litter Management Service Enhancements (PW23076) - Council Referred Item #39: Litter Collection – Service Level Review (Added Item 9.1)**

WHEREAS, Council is in the midst of the 2024 Budget Review;

WHEREAS, Council has referred a business case for Litter Management Service Enhancements to the 2024 Budget listed in the Budget as item 39 of the Council Referred Items;

WHEREAS, in Report PW23076, respecting Litter Management Service Enhancements a survey was completed and the findings concluded that 62% of respondents answered that litter within the city is a big problem and also cited that the downtown and Business Improvement Areas (BIAs) would benefit from enhanced litter cleanup services;

WHEREAS, the total recommended ask in the report PW23076 an annualized operating budget of \$2,073,600 and 27.96 full-time equivalent employees (FTE), a capital budget of \$2,245,000, and operating impacts from capital beginning in 2025 of \$307,000.

WHEREAS, Council has been charged to find savings in the 2024 Budget while aligning to the Council Strategic Priorities of Safe and Thriving Neighborhoods and Economic Sustainability;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

- (a) That Council adopt a new Alternative 3; to Report PW23076, Litter Management Service Enhancements, as this recommendation prioritizes downtown enhancements, expanded street sweeping in BIAs, broadened litter collection in parks and trails and the ability to promote and support volunteer cleanup programs;
- (b) That as per the new Alternative 3; an annualized 2024 operating budget of \$747,000 which includes 10.96 FTE; a capital budget of \$575,000 which is already included in the 2024 waste management capital request; and operating impacts from capital beginning in 2025 of \$83,800; be approved. Councillor Danko assumed the Chair.

Councillor M. Wilson introduced the following Notice of Motion:

**(ii) Reporting of Annual Expenditures on the Transportation Network in Alignment with the Asset Management Plan (Added Item 9.2)**

WHEREAS, the Transportation network refer to the roads distribution network that facilitates the safe, accessible, and efficient movement of people, goods, and services across the City. It encompasses road pavement, active transportation, traffic assets, as well as the engineered structures including bridges, major culverts, and retaining walls, etc. within the transportation network;

WHEREAS, Public Works Department is entrusted with delivering the capital program, as it relates to roads construction, rehabilitation and reconstruction projects and programs for the City of Hamilton's approximate 6,500 lane-kilometers of road network;

WHEREAS, Public Works Department is assigned the responsibility of formulating capital investment plans for the Transportation network, encompassing long-, medium-, and short-term strategies, and delineating the costs associated with executing capital rehabilitation and reconstruction projects and programs;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

That the General Managers of Public Works and Finance & Corporate Services, be directed to report back to the General Issues Committee by the third quarter of 2024 following the:

- (i) examination of the entire capital planning procedure in creating capital program pertaining to the Transportation network, independent of department or division responsible for executing the capital works;
- (ii) examination of the historic Transportations network capital funding levels, adjusted for inflation, compared to the 2024 capital spending, including the multi-year outlook in the 2024 Budget presentation(s);
- (iii) examination of the historical classification or categorization of the capital projects, and recommended strategies, in accordance with current and future known administrative procedures, such as the Corporate Asset Management framework, to maintain the City's Transportation network in "fair to good" condition; and
- (iv) development of a methodology and report format for consistent communication of the information as described in above paragraphs (i), (ii) and (iii).

Councillor Kroetsch introduced the following Notice of Motion:

**(iii) Hamilton Police Services 2024 Budget (Added Item 9.3)**

WHEREAS, in 2011 Council voted 8-7 to approve a motion tabled by Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson and Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson that the budget submitted by the Hamilton Police Services Board of a \$130,752,220 increase or 4.97% "be referred back to the Police Services Board requesting further review and consideration of their budget";

WHEREAS, in 2024, the Hamilton Police Services Board has put forward a total budget increase of \$19,826,637 or 10.24% for a total budget of \$213M;

WHEREAS Mayoral Directive MDI-2023-02, released on August 31, 2023, states that the City of Hamilton must "reduce the burden on residential property taxes" and all budget asks are reviewed prior to submission "to ensure that redundancies and efficiencies have been identified and addressed and that program lines are assessed for ongoing public benefit before continued funding is recommended";

WHEREAS further deliberation by the Hamilton Police Services Board toward this directive may result in finding further redundancies and efficiencies; and

WHEREAS the City recognizes its fiduciary obligation to fund any mandatory capital costs as outlined in the Police Services Act 4(3).

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

That City Council refer the proposed Hamilton Police Services Board budget increase of \$19,826,637 or 10.24% back to the Hamilton Police Services Board requesting further review and consideration and report back with an amended budget, outlining any additional redundancies and efficiencies, by February 15, 2024.

Councillor Nann introduced the following Notice of Motion:

**(iv) Hamilton Apartment Rental Program (Added Item 9.4)**

That Staff be directed to review the Hamilton Apartment Rental Program inclusive of the Tenant Support Program, Safe Apartment By-Law, and Renovation License & Relocation By-Law programs and report back on any opportunities for 2024 Tax Levy savings from the coordinated and staggered implementation of the program.

Councillor Spadafora introduced the following Notice of Motion:

**(v) Hospital Capital Contribution (FCS23108) (Added Item 9.5)**

WHEREAS, On June 14, 2023, at the General Issues Committee (GIC) meeting, Hamilton Health Sciences Corporation (HHSC) and St. Joseph's Healthcare Hamilton (SJHH) provided an overview of major hospital redevelopment projects to seek support to work with City staff to explore local share funding options.

WHEREAS, on November 15, 2023 staff presented Report FCS23108, Hospital Capital Contribution to the General Issues Committee that directed staff to report back to the General Issues Committee with recommendations on financing options for the City's local share contribution in Q1 of 2024;

WHEREAS, The Ontario Government provides funding for hospital capital projects under the Health Infrastructure Renewal Fund, Major Capital Projects Program and project planning

WHEREAS, the Ontario government funds 90% of eligible hospital construction project costs and 100% of eligible planning, design, financing and transaction costs. The balance of the construction project costs, hospital furniture/ equipment and non-shareable costs including constructing a parking facility or renovating or constructing a gift or coffee shop which are



revenue producing are the financial responsibility of the hospital funded under the Local Share Plan

WHEREAS, the local share is estimated at \$363.6 M for HHSC and \$265.0 M for SJHH.

WHEREAS, expected contributions from the hospital foundations of between 25% and 28% of the local share, there is a balance of approximately \$462 M requested from contributions by the City of Hamilton.

WHEREAS, the Proposed 2024 Tax Budget contains a placeholder of 1% (\$12M) residential tax levy increase as a potential municipal contribution to the Local Share Plan.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

- (a) That staff be directed to remove the 1% placeholder for the Hospital redevelopment from the 2024 tax budget.

Councillor Cassar introduced the following Notice of Motion:

**(vi) 2024 Tax Budget Amendments - Discretionary Development Charge Exemptions – REVISED (Added Item 9.6)**

WHEREAS, Council recognizes affordability concerns in the community given the recent periods of high inflation and rising interest rates;

WHEREAS, the Mayor directed staff through MDI-2023-02 to reduce the burden on residential property taxes by prioritizing the utilization of debt and emergency reserves while responsibly maintaining the City's credit rating;

WHEREAS, the proposed 2024 Tax Budget reflects a total Development Charge exemptions expense of \$62 million, a year-over-year increase of 300%

WHEREAS, the proposed 2024 Tax Budget recommends a three-year phase-in strategy for unfunded discretionary development charges exemptions provided under the City's Development Charges Bylaw with funding from the Unallocated Capital Levy Reserve of \$9.57M;

WHEREAS, the proposed 2024 Tax Budget recommends the continuation of an eight-year phase-in strategy that leverages \$6.50M annually between 2023 to 2030 to cover the shortfall in historical discretionary Tax Supported DC exemptions incurred from 2013 to 2020;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

- (a) That staff be directed to revise the phase-in strategy for discretionary development charge exemptions over a longer timeline that is sustainable while reducing the tax impact in 2024 and report back to General Issues Committee (Budget) with a recommended adjustment prior to the conclusion of the 2024 budget process; and
- (b) That staff continue the annual process of reviewing the opportunity to fund discretionary development charges exemptions through the annual budget surplus.

Councillor Beattie introduced the following Notice of Motion:

**(vii) Replacement of 2018 Diesel Waster Packer Equipment**

WHEREAS, the 2024 Capital Budget Waste Management Fleet Acquisition Project Number 5120051501 contemplates replacing nine 2018 model year waste handling units (packers) at a net levy impact of \$1.195M;

WHEREAS, this purchase will replace current diesel powertrain units with compressed natural gas (CNG) powertrain units as per previous Council direction;

WHEREAS, moving from diesel to CNG powered units will require additional investment in CNG fueling stations, which is included in the budget request;

WHEREAS, there are no commercially viable zero carbon powertrain options currently available in the vocational truck market;

WHEREAS, new commercially viable low or no-carbon powertrain options including hydrogen, hybrid and battery electric options are expected to come to market within the next three years;

WHEREAS, new diesel engine powertrain systems offer substantial emissions reductions over their older model year counterparts due to changes in regulatory frameworks;

WHEREAS, the City of Hamilton views CNG be a transitional fuel source until commercially viable zero-emission options become available; and

WHEREAS, 16 additional diesel units are scheduled to begin a replacement process in 2027.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

- (a) That staff be directed to replace the current block of nine diesel waste packer units in a like-for-like manner; and,

- (b) That the additional \$1.195M expenditure to replace 2018 diesel waster packer equipment with compressed natural gas (CNG) equivalents and fueling infrastructure as required be removed from the 2024 tax budget, with a view to future equipment replacements using low-carbon, commercially viable equivalents including hydrogen, hybrid or battery electric options.

**(e) ADJOURNMENT (Item 12)**

**(Spadafora/McMeekin)**

That there being no further business, the General Issues Committee (Budget) be adjourned at 3:20 p.m.

**Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 16 to 0, as follows:**

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin

Respectfully submitted,

---

Councillor John Paul Danko  
Chair, General Issues Committee Budget

---

Janet Pilon  
Acting City Clerk