



**GENERAL ISSUES COMMITTEE
(OPERATING AND CAPITAL BUDGET)
MINUTES 24-001(f)**

9:30 a.m.

Tuesday, January 30, 2024
Council Chambers, City Hall, 2nd Floor
71 Main Street West, Hamilton, Ontario

Present: Mayor A. Horwath, Councillors J. P. Danko (Chair)
J. Beattie, C. Cassar, B. Clark, M. Francis, T. Hwang,
T. Jackson, C. Kroetsch, T. McMeekin, N. Nann, E. Pauls,
M. Spadafora, M. Tadeson, A. Wilson, M. Wilson

**THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REFERRED TO COUNCIL FOR CONSIDERATION:
FOR INFORMATION:**

(a) APPROVAL OF AGENDA (Item 1)

The Committee Clerk advised of the following changes to the agenda:

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

3.1 January 25, 2024

3.2 January 26, 2024

7. DISCUSSION ITEMS

7.1(a) Litter Management Service Enhancements (PW23076) - Council
Referred Item #39: Litter Collection – Service Level Review

7.1(b) Hamilton Police Services Board

7.1(c) Hamilton Apartment Rental Program

7.1(d) Hospital Capital Contribution (FCS23108)

7.1(e) 2024 Tax Budget Amendments - Discretionary Development
Charge Exemptions

7.1(f) Replacement of 2018 Diesel Waster Packer Equipment

8. MOTIONS

8.2 Reporting of Annual Expenditures on the Transportation Network in
Alignment with the Asset Management Plan

8.3 Attaining Efficiencies Through the Review of the Use of Consultants

8.4 Internal Facilitation of Special Events including Traffic Control Plans
as per Ontario Traffic Manual (OTM) Book 7 and Implementation of
Temporary Road Closures for Event Organizers

(Spadafora/Horwath)

That the agenda for the January 30, 2024 General Issues Committee (Budget)
meeting, be approved, as amended.

Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 16 to 0, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)

Mayor A. Horwath declared a disqualifying interest to Item 7.1(c) Hamilton
Apartment Rental Program (Amending Motion), as she is a landlord.

Councillor M. Spadafora declared a disqualifying interest to Item 7.1(c) Hamilton
Apartment Rental Program (Amending Motion), as he is a landlord.

(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS (Item 3)

(i) January 25, 2024 and January 26, 2024 (Items 3.1 and 3.2)

(Kroetsch/Beattie)

That the minutes of the January 25, 2024 and January 26, 2024 General Issues Committee (Budget) meetings, be approved.

Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 16 to 0, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin

(d) DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 7)

(i) 2024 Tax Supported Budget and Financing Plan (FCS24002) (City Wide) (Item 7.1)

(Horwath/M. Wilson)

(a) That the proposed 2024 tax supported budget and financing plan be approved, inclusive of:

- (i) The net tax levy of \$727.1M, representing an increase over 2023 of \$63.2 M, for City Departments, as detailed in Appendix "A" to Report FCS24002 and inclusive of Business Cases and Council Referred Items outlined in Appendix "C" to Report FCS24002;
- (ii) The Capital Levy of \$162.3 M, representing an increase over 2023 of \$20.8 M;
- (iii) The Area Rating Special Capital Re-Investment Levy of \$13.4 M, representing no change over 2023;

- (iv) The net tax levy of \$267.3 M, representing an increase over 2023 of \$16.5 M, for external Boards and Agencies inclusive of proposed service level adjustments as outlined in Appendix “G” to Report FCS24002;
- (v) The introduction of a Special Hospital Redevelopment Levy of \$12.0 M, representing an average residential tax increase of 1.0%;
- (vi) One-time financing of \$72.3 M to support the Housing Sustainability and Investment Roadmap as outlined in Appendix “E” to Report FCS24002;
- (vii) One-time financing of \$24.1 M to phase-in statutory and discretionary development charge exemptions permitted under the *Development Charges Act, 1997* and the City of Hamilton’s Development Charges Bylaw as outlined in Appendix “E” to Report FCS24002;
- (viii) One-time financing of \$18.4 M to support tax affordability as outlined in Appendix “E” to Report FCS24002;
- (ix) The 2024 gross capital budget of \$373.3 M and financing sources outlined in Appendix “F” to Report FCS24002;
- (b) That the Tax Supported Multi-Year Operating Budget 2025 to 2027, attached as Appendix “H” to Report FCS24002, and the Capital Financing Plan 2025 to 2033, attached as Appendix “I” to Report FCS24002, be approved, in principle, and subject to deliberations by Council each budget year;
- (c) That the General Manager, Finance and Corporate Services, be authorized and directed to implement the reserve financing strategy, including closure of the identified reserves, as outlined in Appendix “E” to Report FCS24002;
- (d) That the General Manager, Finance and Corporate Services, be authorized and directed to negotiate and confirm the terms for the placement and issuance of all debenture issue(s), in either a public or private market and / or bank loan agreements and debenture issue(s), in and / or variable interest rate bank loan agreement and debenture issue(s), in an amount not to exceed \$21.1 M Canadian currency, as attached in Appendix “F” to Report FCS24002, which includes \$3.7 M in Tax Supported municipal debt and \$17.4 M in Development Charges municipal debt;

- (e) That the General Manager, Finance and Corporate Services, be authorized to engage the services of all required professionals to secure the terms and issuance of the debenture issue(s) described in recommendation (d) including, but not limited to, external legal counsel and fiscal agents;
- (f) That the General Manager, Finance and Corporate Services, be authorized and directed, on behalf of the City of Hamilton, to enter into and / or execute, all agreements and necessary ancillary documents to secure the terms and issuance of the debenture issue(s) described in recommendation (d), on terms satisfactory to the General Manager, Finance and Corporate Services and in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor;
- (g) That staff be authorized and directed to prepare all necessary By-Law(s) for Council's consideration, for the purpose of authorizing debenture issue(s) described in recommendation (d);
- (h) That the General Manager, Healthy and Safe Communities, or delegate, be authorized and directed to execute, on behalf of the City, all agreements, including all federal and provincial funding agreements and any agreements with Community Services Provider(s), as well as, any ancillary agreements, contracts, extensions and documents, associated with, or arising out of, Council's approval of the 2024 Tax Supported Budget and Financing Plan, which also includes the authority to authorize the submission of budgets and quarterly and / or year-end reporting, as well as, the authority to make appropriate payments to community service providers, in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor;
- (i) That, where required for Public Health Services, the General Manager, Healthy and Safe Communities, or delegate, or the Medical Officer of Health, or delegate, be authorized and directed to execute, on behalf of the City, all agreements, including all federal and provincial funding agreements, as well as, any ancillary agreements, contracts, extensions and documents, associated with or arising out of Council's approval of the 2024 Tax Supported Budget and Financing Plan, and includes the authority to authorize the submission of budgets and quarterly and / or year-end reporting;
- (j) That the City Solicitor be authorized and directed to prepare all necessary by-laws, for Council approval, for the purposes of establishing the tax levy, totalling \$1,181.7 M exclusive of Education per Recommendation (a);

- (k) That in accordance with the “Budgeted Complement Control Policy”, the requested change in staff complement as outlined in Appendix “L” to Report FCS24002, be approved; and
- (l) That the budget exclusions related to Regulation 284/09 of the *Municipal Act* titled “Budget Matters – Expenses”, as per Appendix “L” attached to Report FCS23007(a), be received as information.
- (1) Litter Management Service Enhancements (PW23076) - Council Referred Item #39: Litter Collection – Service Level Review (Added Item 7.1(a))**

(Hwang/Kroetsch)

WHEREAS, Council is in the midst of the 2024 Budget Review;

WHEREAS, Council has referred a business case for Litter Management Service Enhancements to the 2024 Budget listed in the Budget as item 39 of the Council Referred Items;

WHEREAS, in Report PW23076, respecting Litter Management Service Enhancements a survey was completed and the findings concluded that 62% of respondents answered that litter within the city is a big problem and also cited that the downtown and Business Improvement Areas (BIAs) would benefit from enhanced litter cleanup services;

WHEREAS, the total recommended ask in the report PW23076 an annualized operating budget of \$2,073,600 and 27.96 full-time equivalent employees (FTE), a capital budget of \$2,245,000, and operating impacts from capital beginning in 2025 of \$307,000; and

WHEREAS, Council has been charged to find savings in the 2024 Budget while aligning to the Council Strategic Priorities of Safe and Thriving Neighborhoods and Economic Sustainability.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

That staff be directed to report back to General Issues Committee (Budget) with the details of the new Alternative 3 to Report PW23076, Litter Management Service Enhancements with cost implications to the 2024 Budget on February 15, 2024, in order to prioritize downtown enhancements, expanded street sweeping in BIAs, broadened litter collection in parks and trails and the ability to promote and support volunteer cleanup programs.

Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 16 to 0, as follows:

Yes - Mayor Andrea Horwath

Yes	-	Ward 1	Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2	Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 3	Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 4	Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5	Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6	Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 7	Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8	Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9	Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10	Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11	Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12	Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 13	Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 14	Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 15	Councillor Ted McMeekin

(2) Hamilton Police Services Board (Added Item 7.1(b))

(Kroetsch/Hwang)

WHEREAS, in 2011 Council voted 8-7 to approve a motion tabled by Ward 12 Councillor Lloyd Ferguson and Ward 11 Councillor Brenda Johnson that the budget submitted by the Hamilton Police Services Board of a \$130,752,220 increase or 4.97% “be referred back to the Police Services Board requesting further review and consideration of their budget”;

WHEREAS, in 2024, the Hamilton Police Services Board has put forward a total budget increase of \$19,826,637 or 10.24% for a total budget of \$213M;

WHEREAS Mayoral Directive MDI-2023-02, released on August 31, 2023, states that the City of Hamilton must “reduce the burden on residential property taxes” and all budget asks are reviewed prior to submission “to ensure that redundancies and efficiencies have been identified and addressed and that program lines are assessed for ongoing public benefit before continued funding is recommended”;

WHEREAS further deliberation by the Hamilton Police Services Board toward this directive may result in finding further redundancies and efficiencies;

WHEREAS the City recognizes its fiduciary obligation to fund any mandatory capital costs as outlined in the *Police Services Act* 4(3).; and

WHEREAS, on January 26, 2024, the General Issues Budget (Committee) approved a motion from Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin and Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson that, "Hamilton City Council go on record to embrace a municipally generated tax cap no greater than 4% for the 2024 Budget."

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

That City Council refer the proposed Hamilton Police Services Board budget increase of \$19,826,637 or 10.24% back to the Hamilton Police Services Board requesting further review and consideration and report back with a "municipally generated tax cap no greater than 4% for the 2024 Budget", outlining any additional redundancies and efficiencies, by February 15, 2024.

Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 12 to 3, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
No	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
No	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Absent	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
No	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin

(3) Hamilton Apartment Rental Program (Added Item 7.1(c))

(Nann/A. Wilson)

Staff be directed to review the Hamilton Apartment Rental Program inclusive of the Tenant Support Program, Safe Apartment By-Law, and Renovation License & Relocation By-Law programs and report back on any opportunities for 2024 Tax Levy savings from the coordinated and staggered implementation of the program.

Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 13 to 0, as follows:

Absent	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch

Yes	-	Ward 3	Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 4	Councillor Tammy Hwang
Absent	-	Ward 5	Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6	Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 7	Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8	Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9	Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10	Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11	Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12	Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 13	Councillor Alex Wilson
Conflict	-	Ward 14	Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 15	Councillor Ted McMeekin

(4) Hospital Capital Contribution (FCS23108) (Added Item 7.1(d))

(Spadafora/Jackson)

WHEREAS, On June 14, 2023, at the General Issues Committee (GIC) meeting, Hamilton Health Sciences Corporation and St. Joseph's Healthcare Hamilton provided an overview of major hospital redevelopment projects to seek support to work with City staff to explore local share funding options.

WHEREAS, on November 15, 2023 staff presented Report FCS23108, Hospital Capital Contribution to the General Issues Committee that directed staff to report back to the General Issues Committee with recommendations on financing options for the City's local share contribution in Q1 of 2024;

WHEREAS, The Ontario Government provides funding for hospital capital projects under the Health Infrastructure Renewal Fund, Major Capital Projects Program and project planning

WHEREAS, the Ontario government funds 90% of eligible hospital construction project costs and 100% of eligible planning, design, financing and transaction costs. The balance of the construction project costs, hospital furniture/ equipment and non-shareable costs including constructing a parking facility or renovating or constructing a gift or coffee shop which are revenue producing are the financial responsibility of the hospital funded under the Local Share Plan

WHEREAS, the local share is estimated at \$363.6 M for HHSC and \$265.0 M for SJHH.

WHEREAS, expected contributions from the hospital foundations of between 25% and 28% of the local share, there is a balance of approximately \$462 M requested from contributions by the City of Hamilton.

WHEREAS, the Proposed 2024 Tax Budget contains a placeholder of 1% (\$12M) residential tax levy increase as a potential municipal contribution to the Local Share Plan.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

That staff be directed to remove the 1% placeholder for the Hospital redevelopment from the 2024 tax budget.

Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 15 to 0, as follows:

Absent	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Item (d)(i)(7)

(5) 2024 Tax Budget Amendments - Discretionary Development Charge Exemptions (Added Item 7.1(e))

(Cassar/Kroetsch)

WHEREAS, Council recognizes affordability concerns in the community given the recent periods of high inflation and rising interest rates;

WHEREAS, the Mayor directed staff through MDI-2023-02 to reduce the burden on residential property taxes by prioritizing the utilization of debt and emergency reserves while responsibly maintaining the City's credit rating;

WHEREAS, the proposed 2024 Tax Budget reflects a total Development Charge exemptions expense of \$62 million, a year-over-year increase of 300%

WHEREAS, the proposed 2024 Tax Budget recommends a three-year phase-in strategy for unfunded discretionary development charges exemptions provided under the City's Development Charges Bylaw with funding from the Unallocated Capital Levy Reserve of \$9.57M;

WHEREAS, the proposed 2024 Tax Budget recommends the continuation of an eight-year phase-in strategy that leverages \$6.50M annually between 2023 to 2030 to cover the shortfall in historical discretionary Tax Supported DC exemptions incurred from 2013 to 2020;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

- (a) That staff be directed to review the phase-in strategy for discretionary development charge exemptions over a longer timeline that is sustainable while reducing the tax impact in 2024 and report back to General Issues Committee (Budget) with a recommended adjustment prior to the conclusion of the 2024 budget process; and
- (b) That staff continue the annual process of reviewing the opportunity to fund discretionary development charges exemptions through the annual budget surplus.

Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 15 to 0, as follows:

Absent	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin

(6) Replacement of 2018 Diesel Waster Packer Equipment (Added Item 7.1(f))

(Beattie/Francis)

WHEREAS, the 2024 Capital Budget Waste Management Fleet Acquisition Project Number 5120051501 contemplates replacing nine 2018 model year waste handling units (packers) at a net levy impact of \$1.195M;

WHEREAS, this purchase will replace current diesel powertrain units with compressed natural gas (CNG) powertrain units as per previous Council direction;

WHEREAS, moving from diesel to CNG powered units will require additional investment in CNG fueling stations, which is included in the budget request;

WHEREAS, there are no commercially viable zero carbon powertrain options currently available in the vocational truck market;

WHEREAS, new commercially viable low or no-carbon powertrain options including hydrogen, hybrid and battery electric options are expected to come to market within the next three years;

WHEREAS, new diesel engine powertrain systems offer substantial emissions reductions over their older model year counterparts due to changes in regulatory frameworks;

WHEREAS, the City of Hamilton views CNG be a transitional fuel source until commercially viable zero-emission options become available;

WHEREAS, 16 additional diesel units are scheduled to begin a replacement process in 2027.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

That staff be directed to report back to the General Issues Committee (Budget) with the cost implications to the 2024 Budget on February 15, 2024, of replacing the current block of nine diesel waste packer units in a like-for-like manner and the removal of the additional \$1.195M expenditure to replace 2018 diesel waster packer equipment with compressed natural gas (CNG) equivalents and fueling infrastructure as required from the 2024 tax budget, with a view to future equipment replacements using low-carbon, commercially viable equivalents including hydrogen, hybrid or battery electric options.

Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 15 to 0, as follows:

Absent	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin

(Nann/Cassar)

That the General Issues Committee recess until 12:45 pm.

Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 15 to 0, as follows:

Absent	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin

(7) (Cassar/Spadafora)

That the consideration of Report FCS24002, as **Amended**, respecting 2024 Tax Supported Budget and Financing Plan, be deferred to the February 15, 2024 General Issues Committee (Budget) meeting:

- (a) That the proposed 2024 tax supported budget and financing plan be approved, inclusive of:
 - (i) The net tax levy of \$727.1M, representing an increase over 2023 of \$63.2 M, for City Departments, as detailed in Appendix “A” to Report FCS24002 and inclusive of Business Cases and Council Referred Items outlined in Appendix “C” to Report FCS24002;
 - (ii) The Capital Levy of \$162.3 M, representing an increase over 2023 of \$20.8 M;
 - (iii) The Area Rating Special Capital Re-Investment Levy of \$13.4 M, representing no change over 2023;
 - (iv) The net tax levy of \$267.3 M, representing an increase over 2023 of \$16.5 M, for external Boards and Agencies inclusive of proposed service level adjustments as outlined in Appendix “G” to Report FCS24002;
 - ~~(v) ***The introduction of a Special Hospital Redevelopment Levy of \$12.0 M, representing an average residential tax increase of 1.0%;***~~
 - (v) One-time financing of \$72.3 M to support the Housing Sustainability and Investment Roadmap as outlined in Appendix “E” to Report FCS24002;
 - (vi) One-time financing of \$24.1 M to phase-in statutory and discretionary development charge exemptions permitted under the *Development Charges Act, 1997* and the City of Hamilton’s Development Charges Bylaw as outlined in Appendix “E” to Report FCS24002;
 - (vii) One-time financing of \$18.4 M to support tax affordability as outlined in Appendix “E” to Report FCS24002;

- (viii) The 2024 gross capital budget of \$373.3 M and financing sources outlined in Appendix “F” to Report FCS24002;
- (b) That the Tax Supported Multi-Year Operating Budget 2025 to 2027, attached as Appendix “H” to Report FCS24002, and the Capital Financing Plan 2025 to 2033, attached as Appendix “I” to Report FCS24002, be approved, in principle, and subject to deliberations by Council each budget year;
- (c) That the General Manager, Finance and Corporate Services, be authorized and directed to implement the reserve financing strategy, including closure of the identified reserves, as outlined in Appendix “E” to Report FCS24002;
- (d) That the General Manager, Finance and Corporate Services, be authorized and directed to negotiate and confirm the terms for the placement and issuance of all debenture issue(s), in either a public or private market and / or bank loan agreements and debenture issue(s), in and / or variable interest rate bank loan agreement and debenture issue(s), in an amount not to exceed \$21.1 M Canadian currency, as attached in Appendix “F” to Report FCS24002, which includes \$3.7 M in Tax Supported municipal debt and \$17.4 M in Development Charges municipal debt;
- (e) That the General Manager, Finance and Corporate Services, be authorized to engage the services of all required professionals to secure the terms and issuance of the debenture issue(s) described in recommendation (d) including, but not limited to, external legal counsel and fiscal agents;
- (f) That the General Manager, Finance and Corporate Services, be authorized and directed, on behalf of the City of Hamilton, to enter into and / or execute, all agreements and necessary ancillary documents to secure the terms and issuance of the debenture issue(s) described in recommendation (d), on terms satisfactory to the General Manager, Finance and Corporate Services and in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor;
- (g) That staff be authorized and directed to prepare all necessary By-Law(s) for Council’s consideration, for the purpose of authorizing debenture issue(s) described in recommendation (d);

- (h) That the General Manager, Healthy and Safe Communities, or delegate, be authorized and directed to execute, on behalf of the City, all agreements, including all federal and provincial funding agreements and any agreements with Community Services Provider(s), as well as, any ancillary agreements, contracts, extensions and documents, associated with, or arising out of, Council's approval of the 2024 Tax Supported Budget and Financing Plan, which also includes the authority to authorize the submission of budgets and quarterly and / or year-end reporting, as well as, the authority to make appropriate payments to community service providers, in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor;
- (i) That, where required for Public Health Services, the General Manager, Healthy and Safe Communities, or delegate, or the Medical Officer of Health, or delegate, be authorized and directed to execute, on behalf of the City, all agreements, including all federal and provincial funding agreements, as well as, any ancillary agreements, contracts, extensions and documents, associated with or arising out of Council's approval of the 2024 Tax Supported Budget and Financing Plan, and includes the authority to authorize the submission of budgets and quarterly and / or year-end reporting;
- (j) That the City Solicitor be authorized and directed to prepare all necessary by-laws, for Council approval, for the purposes of establishing the tax levy, totalling ~~\$1,181.7M~~ **\$1,175.7M** exclusive of Education per Recommendation (a);
- (k) That in accordance with the "Budgeted Complement Control Policy", the requested change in staff complement as outlined in Appendix "L" to Report FCS24002, be approved; and
- (l) That the budget exclusions related to Regulation 284/09 of the *Municipal Act* titled "Budget Matters – Expenses", as per Appendix "L" attached to Report FCS23007(a), be received as information.

Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 13 to 0, as follows:

Absent	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Absent	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson

Yes	-	Ward 7	Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8	Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9	Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10	Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11	Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12	Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 13	Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 14	Councillor Mike Spadafora
Absent	-	Ward 15	Councillor Ted McMeekin

(e) MOTIONS (Item 8)

Councillor Danko relinquished the Chair to Vice-Chair M. Wilson to introduce the following notice of motion:

**(i) Financial Impact of Provincial Policies and Downloaded Expenses
(Item 8.1)**

(Danko/M. Wilson)

That the financial impact of Provincial policies and downloaded expenses be included as an individual line item on the 2024 City of Hamilton property tax bills and accompanying property tax information package.

Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 14 to 0, as follows:

Absent	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Absent	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin

Councillor Danko assumed the Chair.

(ii) Reporting of Annual Expenditures on the Transportation Network in Alignment with the Asset Management Plan (Added Item 8.2)

(M. Wilson/Francis)

WHEREAS, the Transportation network refer to the roads distribution network that facilitates the safe, accessible, and efficient movement of people, goods, and services across the City. It encompasses road pavement, active transportation, traffic assets, as well as the engineered structures including bridges, major culverts, and retaining walls, etc. within the transportation network;

WHEREAS, Public Works Department is entrusted with delivering the capital program, as it relates to roads construction, rehabilitation and reconstruction projects and programs for the City of Hamilton's approximate 6,500 lane-kilometers of road network;

WHEREAS, Public Works Department is assigned the responsibility of formulating capital investment plans for the Transportation network, encompassing long-, medium-, and short-term strategies, and delineating the costs associated with executing capital rehabilitation and reconstruction projects and programs;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

- (a) That the General Managers of Public Works and Finance & Corporate Services, be directed to report back to the General Issues Committee by the second quarter of 2024 following the:
 - (i) examination of the entire capital planning procedure in creating capital program pertaining to the Transportation network, independent of department or division responsible for executing the capital works;
 - (ii) examination of the historic Transportations network capital funding levels, adjusted for inflation, compared to the 2024 capital spending, including the multi-year outlook in the 2024 Budget presentation(s);
 - (iii) examination of the historical classification or categorization of the capital projects, and recommended strategies, in accordance with current and future known administrative procedures, such as the Corporate Asset Management framework, to maintain the City's Transportation network in "fair to good" condition; and
 - (iv) development of a methodology and report format for consistent communication of the information as described in above paragraphs (i), (ii) and (iii).

Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 14 to 0, as follows:

Absent	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Absent	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin

**(iii) Attaining Efficiencies Through the Review of the Use of Consultants
- REVISED (Added Item 8.3)**

(Tadeson/Kroetsch)

WHEREAS, the City has and continues to engage consultants to complete work when specific expertise is required;

WHEREAS, a review of the use of consultants would provide Council with the frequency as well as a listing of the expertise the City requires on an ongoing basis; and

WHEREAS, providing staff with training opportunities to acquire the specific expertise would result in the potential for long term cost savings by having the work currently completed by consultants, completed by staff.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

- (a) That staff be directed to review and report back to the General Issues Committee with an interim report by the second quarter of 2024 respecting the projects the City has engaged consultants to frequently complete and any upcoming projects; and

- (b) That staff be directed to evaluate the potential of long term cost savings by reviewing the list of projects, the expertise that was/is required and make recommendations for having this work completed by City staff by:
 - (i) Offering training opportunities;
 - (ii) Offering inter-departmental opportunities for staff with expertise;
 - (iii) Hiring staff with the expertise required; and
 - (iv) Include a review of the labour market and competitiveness of the City's ability to bring the expertise in house.

Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 16 to 0, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Yes	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin

(iv) Internal Facilitation of Special Events including Traffic Control Plans as per Ontario Traffic Manual (OTM) Book 7 and Implementation of Temporary Road Closures for Event Organizers (Added Item 8.4)

(Kroetsch/Tadeson)

WHEREAS, the City of Hamilton phased out the preparation of Traffic Control Plans as per Ontario Traffic Manual (OTM) Book 7 by Qualified Persons, implementation of the temporary road closure with associated Roads and Traffic Plans in 2012 due to emergency response requirements, safety and liability risks, road maintenance priorities throughout the City, and staffing shortages due to the volume of events;

WHEREAS, the Special Events Advisory Team (SEAT), led by Healthy and Safe Communities (H&SC) is a cross-departmental team that is comprised of City of Hamilton staff from 15 municipal divisions to facilitate and support public events taking place on City property and, in some cases, events on private property that have a significant impact on City services;

WHEREAS, SEAT ensures that these events have all the necessary permits, permissions, and insurance so that events are safe for organizers, participants, the corporation, and citizens;

WHEREAS, in 2023, there were 170 major events and 250 community-level events, with a yearly average of approximately 400 events each year;

WHEREAS, event organizers are responsible for paying for various City-issued permits and licences, providing the City with proof of insurance from a 3rd party insurer, are responsible for the preparation of Traffic Control Plans as per OTM Book 7 to support all events that require a temporary closure, plus the implementation of temporary closures once approved;

WHEREAS, the City Enrichment Fund (CEF), launched in 2015, after transitioning from the Community Partnership Program (CPP), the fund provides grants to not-for profit organizations, charities, and community groups across seven program areas, Agriculture, Arts, Communities, Culture and Heritage (CCH), Community Services, Environment, Sport and Active Lifestyle that deliver a variety of services and programs throughout the city; and

WHEREAS, each year organizations are invited to submit grant applications in support of these services and programs, which are evaluated by internal and external teams. In 2023, 337 applications received funding in the amount of \$6,559,227 approved by Council to be used towards project, programs, and operations of the various applications. These include in some cases event fees (e.g. traffic control plans, road closures, off-duty police support).

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

That the General Managers of Public Works and Planning and Economic Development, be directed to report back to the General Issues Committee with an Information Report by the second quarter of 2024 on the following:

- (i) That City staff investigate any potential savings that may exist in transferring the responsibility of the event coordination in-house to the current SEAT model; referencing any other similar situations where there has been a historic need for a particular type of external advice;
- (ii) That the resources (staffing, material and vehicle costs) and processes required for a cross-departmental City of Hamilton Team to facilitate all processes, including the Traffic Control Plans associated with the implementation of temporary closures for Event Organizers be identified as part of this review;
- (iii) That the Hamilton Police Services be consulted with and resources (staffing and material costs) and processes be outlined as part of this process if to be facilitated by the City of Hamilton as part of this review;

- (iv) That the Legal & Risk Management Services Division be consulted with to identify risks, liability and insurance costs if to be facilitated by the City of Hamilton as part of this review; and
- (v) That staff identify as part of the review any opportunities for fee reductions or cost recoveries.

Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 15 to 0, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Absent	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin

(f) NOTICES OF MOTION

(i) Final Global Budget Number (Added Item 9.1)

(Jackson/Spadafora)

That the Rules of Order be waived to allow for the introduction of a motion respecting Final Global Budget Number.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a 2/3rds vote of 14 to 1, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
No	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Absent	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson

Yes	-	Ward 12	Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 13	Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 14	Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 15	Councillor Ted McMeekin

(g) MOTIONS - Continued (Item 8)

(i) Final Global Budget Number (Added Item 8.5)

(Jackson/Spadafora)

WHEREAS the 2024 tax levy increase as of the end of deliberations on January 30 stands at 6.9%;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED:

That the City Manager be directed to report back by February 15, 2024 at the General Issues Committee (Budget) meeting (if not earlier), indicating how the final global budget number can be reduced to 4% maximum and providing the benefits/challenges of this direction.

Result: MOTION, DEFEATED by a vote of 6 to 9, as follows:

No	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
No	-	Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
No	-	Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
No	-	Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
No	-	Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6 Councillor Tom Jackson
Absent	-	Ward 7 Councillor Esther Pauls
No	-	Ward 8 Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
No	-	Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar
No	-	Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora
No	-	Ward 15 Councillor Ted McMeekin

(g) ADJOURNMENT (Item 12)

(Clark/Kroetsch)

That there being no further business, the General Issues Committee (Budget) be adjourned at 2:52 p.m.

Result: MOTION, CARRIED by a vote of 15 to 0, as follows:

Yes	-	Mayor Andrea Horwath
-----	---	----------------------

Yes	-	Ward 1	Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 2	Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes	-	Ward 3	Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes	-	Ward 4	Councillor Tammy Hwang
Yes	-	Ward 5	Councillor Matt Francis
Yes	-	Ward 6	Councillor Tom Jackson
Absent	-	Ward 7	Councillor Esther Pauls
Yes	-	Ward 8	Councillor J. P. Danko
Yes	-	Ward 9	Councillor Brad Clark
Yes	-	Ward 10	Councillor Jeff Beattie
Yes	-	Ward 11	Councillor Mark Tadeson
Yes	-	Ward 12	Councillor Craig Cassar
Yes	-	Ward 13	Councillor Alex Wilson
Yes	-	Ward 14	Councillor Mike Spadafora
Yes	-	Ward 15	Councillor Ted McMeekin

Respectfully submitted,

Councillor John Paul Danko
Chair, General Issues Committee Budget

Janet Pilon
Acting City Clerk