



Hamilton

INFORMATION REPORT

TO:	Chair and Members Public Works Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	April 29, 2024
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Accessible Transportation Services Performance Report (PW22079(f)) (City Wide)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	City Wide
PREPARED BY:	Michelle Martin (905) 546-2424 Ext. 2765
SUBMITTED BY:	Maureen Cosyn Heath Director, Transit Public Works Department
SIGNATURE:	

COUNCIL DIRECTION

Public Works Committee, at its meeting of April 22, 2022, approved the following: “That staff be directed to report back to the Public Works Committee and the Advisory Committee for Persons with Disabilities on a quarterly basis respecting Accessible Transportation Services (ATS).” (PW Report 22-006, Item 3 (PW21055(a))).

INFORMATION

In 1998, an Ontario Human Rights Code complaint was filed, and the subsequent settlement established, in part, that the City of Hamilton report on service-specific requirements: notably, a trip denial rate goal of 5%, an on-time performance goal of 95% or greater for DARTS trips, and an annual report to the Accessibility Committee for Persons with Disabilities (formerly named the Advisory Committee for Persons with Disabilities) on: trip requests, trip denials, passenger refusals of trips, cancellations, no shows, missed trips, trips provided, complaints and on-time performance.

Accessible Transportation Services Q1, Q2, and Q3 2023 indicators were presented as described in Reports PW22079(c), PW22079(d), and PW22079(e). Q4 2023 indicators were presented to the Accessibility Committee for Persons with Disabilities (ACPD) on February 13, 2024 (meeting 24-002, Item 8.1), and is attached as Appendix “A” to Report PW22079(f).

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

**SUBJECT: Accessible Transportation Services Performance Report
(PW22079(f)) (City Wide) – Page 2 of 3**

Customer complaints per 1,000 trips are also broken down by provider and into detailed subcategories as shown in Appendix “A” attached to Report PW22079(f) on page 13. This is more detail than the Ontario Human Rights Code settlement requires, but it was requested by the Accessibility Committee for Persons with Disabilities following presentation of the Q1 2023 report and these details are now regularly included.

The overall 2023 trend for contractor DARTS on-time performance is almost 98%, greater than the 95% on-time performance guideline established by the 2004 Ontario Human Rights Commission settlement cited above. This performance level is approaching the 99% industry standard. (Canadian Urban Transit Association Specialized Transit Services Industry Practices Review, 2016). Figures 2 and 3 in Appendix “A” illustrate the trends in late trip counts and on-time performance across 2023 and compare these with 2022 trends. Preliminary data for January 2024 shows on-time performance at about 98.6%.

Complaints about late trips continue to drive total complaints received: 36% of Q4 complaints were about late trips. Total complaints received in 2023 resulted in 7.7 complaints per thousand DARTS trips, with a marked decrease from over 9 per thousand early in the year and dropping to 4.5 per thousand trips in Q4. The industry standard is 1.0 customer complaints/1,000 trips, and the 2016 Canadian Urban Transit Association average was 2.1 complaints/1,000 trips for large systems such as Hamilton. (Canadian Urban Transit Association Specialized Transit Services Industry Practices Review, 2016).

Complaints of being on hold or unable to connect accounted for about 8% of all validated DARTS complaints received in Q4 2023. Call centre statistics provided by DARTS show that call centre service levels have improved to 62% in Q4 2023, up from 53% the previous quarter.

The trip denial rate for DARTS continued its trend of improvement, ending Q4 with 1.5% of trips requested being denied, for an overall 2023 trip denial rate of 2.7%. This is within the trip denial 5% benchmark set in the 2004 Ontario Human Rights Commission settlement. The 2016 Canadian Urban Transit Association average is 1.98% for large systems such as Hamilton, while the industry best practice is 0% (Canadian Urban Transit Association Specialized Transit Services Industry Practices Review, 2016). It is important to note, poor on-time performance can also appear in trip denial rates: a trip that is missed and then rebooked due to a projected late arrival is counted as a denied trip. Preliminary numbers for January 2024 show a denial rate of about 1.9%.

The quarterly report presented above exceeds the terms and the reporting frequency requirements of the 2004 Ontario Human Rights Commission settlement. The Q1 2024 report (January – March 2024) will be presented to the ACPD later in Q2 2024 and then to the Public Works Committee.

**SUBJECT: Accessible Transportation Services Performance Report
(PW22079(f)) (City Wide) – Page 3 of 3**

Beginning with Report PW22079(e), and as part of continuous improvement, Accessible Transportation Services now includes additional metrics related to the management of the contracted relationship with DARTS. These include a summary count of performance-related letters sent by the City to the contractor, classified according to category. The letters referenced may be related to DARTS and/ or their subcontractors. Report PW22079(e) included the count of letters dating back to 2020 up to 2023. Up to the end of February 2024, ATS has sent two performance-related letters regarding serious incidents.

Also, Appendix “B” attached to report PW22079(f) summarizes Contractor Vehicle Inspection results for 2023 and year to date; these include results from both third-party mechanical inspections and on-site vehicle records inspections by City staff.

Due to uneven vehicle and vehicle records inspection results to date, Accessible Transportation Services undertook an internal process review of the Daily Vehicle Inspection procedure (vehicle “circle checks”) with both DARTS and DARTS subcontractors. All on-site visits and staff interviews were completed by March 2024. At time of writing, Accessible Transportation Services was in the process of compiling all results to review nonconformances, opportunities for improvement, and best practices observed with DARTS as part of continuous quality improvement.

This work was undertaken in response to recommendations from the Office of the Auditor General and will be reported in the Accessible Transportation Services Quarterly Report to Public Works Committee, going forward (see also Report PW24005 brought before the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee on January 18, 2024 – titled DARTS Vehicle Safety Audit AUD22007(a) Update to Management Response). Related to the above paragraph, it should be noted that the Office of the City Auditor has not completed any work to validate the current status of the Management response to AUD22007(a).

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix “A” to Report PW22079(f) – Advisory Committee for Persons with Disabilities Meeting 24-002 8.1 – Accessible Transportation Services Performance Report Q4 2023

Appendix “B” to Report PW22079(f) – Contractor Vehicle Inspection Results 2023 – Year-to-Date