



**LIGHT RAIL TRANSIT SUB-COMMITTEE
MINUTES 24-001**

1:00 p.m.

Monday, January 29, 2024

Council Chambers

Hamilton City Hall

71 Main Street West

Present: Mayor A. Horwath, Councillors N. Nann (Chair), C. Kroetsch (Vice-Chair), C. Cassar, J.P. Danko, T. Hwang and M. Wilson

**Absent with
Regrets:** Councillor M. Francis – City Business

THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REFERRED TO GENERAL ISSUES COMMITTEE FOR INFORMATION:

1. Light Rail Transit Operations Models (PED23166(b)) (City Wide) (Item 8.1)

(Horwath/Cassar)

That Report (PED23166(b)), respecting Light Rail Transit Operations Models (City Wide), be referred to the March 21, 2024 meeting of the General Issues Committee.

Result: **AMENDMENT CARRIED by a vote of 5 to 2, as follows:**

Yes - Mayor Andrea Horwath
 Yes - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
 No - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
 No - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
 Yes - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
 Not Present - Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
 Yes - Ward 8 Councillor John Paul Danko
 Yes - Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar

FOR INFORMATION:

(a) APPROVAL OF AGENDA (Item 2)

The Committee Clerk advised of the following changes to the agenda:

5. COMMUNICATIONS

5.1 Correspondence respecting Item 8.1 - Light Rail Transit Operations Models (PED23166(b)) (City Wide), from the following individuals:

Recommendation: Be received and referred to consideration of 8.1.

- (a) Daniella Balasal, CP Planning
- (b) Leilani Hana
- (c) Amy Shi
- (d) Rose Janson
- (e) Nate Wallace, National Defence
- (f) Shania Ramharrack-Maharaj
- (g) Stop Sprawl HamOnt Organizers
- (h) Kate Pearson
- (i) Helena Dalrymple

6. DELEGATION REQUESTS

6.5 Delegation requests respecting Item 8.1 - Light Rail Transit Operations Models (PED23166(b)) (City Wide) for today's meeting from the following individuals:

- (a) Ian Borsuk, Environment Hamilton (In-Person)
- (b) James Kemp (Virtually)
- (c) Stewart Klazinga, ACORN Hamilton (Virtually)
- (d) T. H. Ponders (In-Person)

- (e) Caitlin Craven, Hamilton Centre for Civic Inclusion - WITHDRAWN
- (f) Don McLean, Hamilton 350 Committee (Virtually)
- (g) Shelagh Pizey-Allen, TTCriders (Virtually)
- (h) Christie McNabb, Council of Canadians - Hamilton Chapter (Virtually)
- (i) Evan Ubene (In-Person)
- (j) Anthony Marco, Hamilton and District Labour Council (In-Person)
- (k) Theresa Cardey, Transit Matters (Virtually)
- (l) Mason Fitzpatrick, CUPE Local 3906 (In-Person)

6.6 Clint Crabtree, ATU Local 279 Ottawa respecting LRT in Ottawa (Virtually)

8.1 STAFF PRESENTATIONS

- (a) Light Rail Transit Operations Models (PED23166(b)) (City Wide) - Presentation – FURTHER REVISED

CHANGE TO THE ORDER OF ITEMS:

That the delegation from Councillor Josh Matlow, City of Toronto, respecting the Hamilton LRT, be heard as the first delegation (Item 7.1)

(Cassar/Hwang)

That the agenda for the January 29, 2024, Light Rail Transit Sub-Committee meeting be approved, as amended.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

Yes - Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Not Present - Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes - Ward 8 Councillor John Paul Danko

Yes - Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 3)

There were no declarations of interest.

(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 4)

(i) December 11, 2023 (Item 4.1)

(Wilson/Cassar)

That the Minutes of the December 11, 2023, meeting of the Light Rail Transit Sub-Committee be approved, as presented.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

Yes - Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Not Present - Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes - Ward 8 Councillor John Paul Danko
Yes - Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar

(d) COMMUNICATIONS (Item 5)

(i) (Hwang/Cassar)

That the Correspondence Items 5.1(a) to 5.1(i) respecting Item 8.1 - Light Rail Transit Operations Models (PED23166(b)) (City Wide), as follows, be received:

- (a) Daniella Balasal, CP Planning (Added Item 5.1(a))
- (b) Leilani Hana (Added Item 5.1(b))
- (c) Amy Shi (Added Item 5.1(c))
- (d) Rose Janson (Added Item 5.1(d))
- (e) Nate Wallace, Environmental Defence (Added Item 5.1(e))
- (f) Shania Ramharrack-Maharaj (Added Item 5.1(f))

- (g) Stop Sprawl HamOnt Organizers (Added Item 5.1(g))
- (h) Kate Pearson (Added Item 5.1(h))
- (i) Helena Dalrymple (Added Item 5.1(f))

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

Yes - Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Not Present - Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes - Ward 8 Councillor John Paul Danko
Yes - Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar

(e) DELEGATION REQUESTS (Item 6)

(Kroetsch/Hwang)

That the Delegation Requests for today's meeting be approved, as follows:

- (i) Eric Tuck, Amalgamated Transit Union Local 107, respecting LRT Options Report (In-Person) (Item 6.1)
- (ii) Vic Wojciechowska, CUPE 3906, respecting Keep Transit Public campaign (In-Person) (Item 6.2)
- (iii) Councillor Josh Matlow, City of Toronto, respecting the Hamilton LRT (Virtually) (Item 6.3)
- (iv) John Di Nino, ATU Canada, respecting operation and maintenance of Hamilton LRT (Virtually) (Item 6.4)
- (v) Delegation requests respecting Item 8.1 - Light Rail Transit Operations Models (PED23166(b)) (City Wide) for today's meeting from the following individuals:
 - (a) Ian Borsuk, Environment Hamilton (In-Person) (Added Item 6.5(a))
 - (b) James Kemp (Virtually) (Added Item 6.5(b))
 - (c) Stewart Klazinga, ACORN Hamilton (Virtually) (Added Item 6.5(c))

- (d) T. H. Ponders (In-Person) (Added Item 6.5(d))
- (e) Don McLean, Hamilton 350 Committee (Virtually) (Added Item 6.5(e))
- (f) Shelagh Pizey-Allen, TTCriders (Virtually) (Added Item 6.5(f))
- (g) Christie McNabb, Council of Canadians - Hamilton Chapter (Virtually) (Added Item 6.5(g))
- (h) Evan Ubene (In-Person) (Added Item 6.5(h))
- (i) Anthony Marco, Hamilton and District Labour Council (In-Person) (Added Item 6.5(i))
- (j) Theresa Cardey, Transit Matters (Virtually) (Added Item 6.5(j))
- (k) Mason Fitzpatrick, CUPE Local 3906 (In-Person) (Added Item 6.5(k))
- (vi) Clint Crabtree, ATU Local 279 Ottawa respecting LRT in Ottawa (Virtually) (Added Item 6.6)

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 1, as follows:

Yes - Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Not Present - Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
No - Ward 8 Councillor John Paul Danko
Yes - Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar

(f) DELEGATIONS (Item 7)

The following delegations addressed the Committee:

- (i) Councillor Josh Matlow, City of Toronto, respecting the Hamilton LRT (Virtually) (Item 7.1)
- (ii) Eric Tuck, Amalgamated Transit Union Local 107, respecting LRT Options Report (In-Person) (Item 7.2)

- (iii) Vic Wojciechowska, CUPE 3906, respecting Keep Transit Public campaign (In-Person) (Item 7.3)
- (iv) John Di Nino, ATU Canada, respecting operation and maintenance of Hamilton LRT (Virtually) (Item 7.4)
- (v) Delegation requests respecting Item 8.1 - Light Rail Transit Operations Models (PED23166(b)) (City Wide) for today's meeting from the following individuals:
 - (a) Ian Borsuk, Environment Hamilton (In-Person) (Added Item 7.5(a))
 - (b) James Kemp (Virtually) (Added Item 7.5(b))
 - (c) Stewart Klazinga, ACORN Hamilton (Virtually) (Added Item 7.5(c))
 - (d) T. H. Ponders (In-Person) (Added Item 7.5(d))
 - (e) Shelagh Pizey-Allen, TTCriders (Virtually) (Added Item 7.5(f))
 - (f) Christie McNabb, Council of Canadians - Hamilton Chapter (Virtually) (Added Item 7.5(g))
 - (g) Evan Ubene (In-Person) (Added Item 7.5(h))
 - (h) Anthony Marco, Hamilton and District Labour Council (In-Person) (Added Item 7.5(i))
 - (i) Theresa Cardey, Transit Matters (Virtually) (Added Item 7.5(j))
 - (j) Mason Fitzpatrick, CUPE Local 3906 (In-Person) (Added Item 7.5(k))

The following Delegations were not in attendance when called upon:

- (i) Don McLean, Hamilton 350 Committee (Virtually) (Added Item 7.5(e))
- (ii) Clint Crabtree, ATU Local 279 Ottawa respecting LRT in Ottawa (Virtually) (Added Item 7.6)

(Hwang/Cassar)

That the following Delegations, be received:

- (i) Councillor Josh Matlow, City of Toronto, respecting the Hamilton LRT (Virtually) (Item 7.1)
- (ii) Eric Tuck, Amalgamated Transit Union Local 107, respecting LRT Options Report (In-Person) (Item 7.2)
- (iii) Vic Wojciechowska, CUPE 3906, respecting Keep Transit Public campaign (In-Person) (Item 7.3)
- (iv) John Di Nino, ATU Canada, respecting operation and maintenance of Hamilton LRT (Virtually) (Item 7.4)
- (v) Delegation requests respecting Item 8.1 - Light Rail Transit Operations Models (PED23166(b)) (City Wide) for today's meeting from the following individuals:
 - (a) Ian Borsuk, Environment Hamilton (In-Person) (Added Item 7.5(a))
 - (b) James Kemp (Virtually) (Added Item 7.5(b))
 - (c) Stewart Klazinga, ACORN Hamilton (Virtually) (Added Item 7.5(c))
 - (d) T. H. Ponders (In-Person) (Added Item 7.5(d))
 - (e) Shelagh Pizey-Allen, TTCriders (Virtually) (Added Item 7.5(f))
 - (f) Christie McNabb, Council of Canadians - Hamilton Chapter (Virtually) (Added Item 7.5(g))
 - (g) Evan Ubene (In-Person) (Added Item 7.5(h))
 - (h) Anthony Marco, Hamilton and District Labour Council (In-Person) (Added Item 7.5(i))
 - (i) Theresa Cardey, Transit Matters (Virtually) (Added Item 7.5(j))
 - (j) Mason Fitzpatrick, CUPE Local 3906 (In-Person) (Added Item 7.5(k))

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 0, as follows:

Yes - Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Not Present - Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Not Present - Ward 8 Councillor John Paul Danko
Yes - Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar

(g) STAFF PRESENTATIONS (Item 8)

(i) Light Rail Transit Operations Models (PED23166(b)) (City Wide) (Item 8.1)

Abdul Shaikh, Director LRT Project Office, addressed the Committee respecting Report PED23166(b), Light Rail Transit Operations Models, with the aid of a PowerPoint presentation.

(Horwath/Kroetsch)

That the presentation by Abdul Shaikh, Director LRT Project Office, respecting Report PED23166(b), Light Rail Transit Operations Models, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

Yes - Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Not Present - Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes - Ward 8 Councillor John Paul Danko
Yes - Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar

(ii) (Horwath/Hwang)

That the City endorse Operations Model 2 (*Municipality performs passenger interface activities*) to be selected as the City's preferred Light Rail Transit operations model with the right to opt-in (transition) to Operations Model 4 (*Municipality performs all aspects of Operational activities except facility operations*) after an initial 10-year term.

For disposition of this matter, refer to Item 1.

(h) ADJOURNMENT (Item 16)

(Hwang/Danko)

That there being no further business, the Light Rail Transit Sub-Committee adjourned at 4:53 p.m.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

Yes - Mayor Andrea Horwath
Yes - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
Yes - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
Yes - Ward 3 Councillor Nrinder Nann
Yes - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
Not Present - Ward 5 Councillor Matt Francis
Yes - Ward 8 Councillor John Paul Danko
Yes - Ward 12 Councillor Craig Cassar

Respectfully submitted,

Councillor N. Nann, Chair,
Light Rail Transit Sub-Committee

Carrie McIntosh
Legislative Coordinator
Office of the City Clerk