

CITY OF HAMILTON PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT Planning Division

то:	Chair and Committee Members Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	July 22, 2024
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Recommendation to Designate 7 Rolph Street, Dundas, known as the Lennard House / Mushroom House, under Part IV of the <i>Ontario Heritage Act</i> (PED24125) (Ward 13)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	Ward 13
PREPARED BY:	Maryssa Barras (905) 546-2424 Meg Oldfield (905) 546-2424
SUBMITTED BY:	Anita Fabac Acting Director, Planning and Chief Planner Planning and Economic Development Department
SIGNATURE:	autoJaba

RECOMMENDATION

That the City Clerk be directed to give notice of Council's intention to designate 7 Rolph Street, Dundas, shown in Appendix "A" attached to Report PED24125, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, in accordance with the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED24125, subject to the following:

- (a) If no objections are received to the notice of intention to designate in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, City Council directs staff to introduce the necessary by-law to designate the property to be of cultural heritage value or interest to City Council;
- (b) If an objection to the notice of intention to designate is received in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, City Council directs staff to report back to Planning Committee to allow Council to consider the objection and decide whether or not to withdraw the notice of intention to designate the property.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 7 Rolph Street, Dundas, known as the Lennard House / Mushroom House, under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (PED24125) (Ward 13) - Page 2 of 8

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This Report recommends designation of the significant built heritage resource located at 7 Rolph Street, Dundas, known as Lennard House / Mushroom House, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The subject property is currently listed on the City's Municipal Heritage Register. Staff have completed an evaluation of the subject property using Ontario Regulation 9/06 and determined that is has sufficient cultural heritage value or interest to warrant designation, as per the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED24125. The owner of the property requested its designation and is supportive of the staff recommendation.

Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 7

FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

- Financial: N/A
- Staffing: N/A
- Legal: The designation process will follow the requirements of the *Ontario Heritage Act* and provide for adequate notice of Council's intention to designate the property. Formal objections may be made under the *Ontario Heritage Act* and considered by Council before either withdrawing the notice of intention to designate or passing a designation by-law. Once a designation by-law has been passed, any further objection would be heard before the Ontario Land Tribunal.

Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* allows municipalities to recognize a property's cultural heritage value or interest, and to conserve and manage the property through the Heritage Permit process enabled under Sections 33 (alterations) and 34 (demolition or removal) of the *Act*.

Where alterations to designated properties are contemplated, a property owner is required to apply for, obtain, and comply with a Heritage Permit, for any alteration that "is likely to affect the property's heritage attributes, as set out in the description of the property's heritage attributes" (Sub-section 33(1)).

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The subject property located at 7 Rolph Street, Dundas, shown in Appendix "A" attached to Report PED24125, is comprised of a two-storey steel and wood frame

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 7 Rolph Street, Dundas, known as the Lennard House / Mushroom House, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED24125) (Ward 13) - Page 3 of 8

pedestal dwelling built in 1971. The building was first assessed for heritage value in 2019.

In August 2023, staff received a request from the owner to designate the property. In response, staff conducted a site visit on April 19, 2024, and determined the property met the criteria for designation. In an email dated May 22, 2024, staff advised the owner of the heritage evaluation and recommendation to designate and provided them with a draft Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Attributes (attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED24125). In an email dated June 5, 2024, staff advised the owner of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee meeting date when the recommendation to designate would be considered.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

The Recommendation of this Report is consistent with Provincial and Municipal legislation, policy and direction, including:

- Determining the cultural heritage value or interest of a property based on design/physical value, historical/associative value and contextual value criteria (*Ontario Heritage Act*, Ontario Regulation 9/06);
- Ensuring significant built heritage resources are conserved (Provincial Policy Statement, 2020, Sub-section 2.6.1); and,
- Designating properties of cultural heritage value under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (Urban Hamilton Official Plan, Section B.3.4.2.3).

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

External

- Property Owner; and,
- Harry Lennard.

In addition, on June 11, 2024, Cultural Heritage Planning staff emailed the Ward Councillor (Councillor A. Wilson) for Ward 13 and provided an overview of the reasons for designation and the process for designating a property.

ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

The intent of municipal designation, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, is to enable a process for the management and conservation of significant cultural heritage resources. Once a property is designated, the municipality can manage change to a property through the Heritage Permit process to ensure that the significant features of the property are maintained.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 7 Rolph Street, Dundas, known as the Lennard House / Mushroom House, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED24125) (Ward 13) - Page 4 of 8

Section 29(1) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* permits the Council of a municipality to designate property to be of cultural heritage value or interest where property meets two or more of the Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest prescribed in Ontario Regulation 9/06, as amended by Ontario Regulation 569/22, which identifies nine criteria in three broad categories: Design / Physical Value; Historical / Associative Value; and Contextual Value. The evaluation of cultural heritage value or interest of the subject property was completed by Cultural Heritage Planning staff based on a site visit of the property conducted on April 19, 2024 (see photographs attached as Appendix "C" to Report PED24125) and available secondary and primary research sources (attached as Appendix "D" to PED24125). As outlined below, based on staff's cultural heritage evaluation, it was determined that the subject property meets 8 of the 9 criteria contained in Ontario Regulation 9/06 in all three categories.

Design / Physical Value

- 1. The property at 7 Rolph Street. Dundas has physical value as a rare example of a dodecagon (twelve-sided) contemporary dwelling. The two-storey pedestal form frame dodecagon was designed in 1969 and constructed in 1971 and is the only documented example of either a pedestal or dodecagon dwelling in Hamilton. It is also a rare example of a dodecagon dwelling in Canada, and it is believed to be the only pedestaled dodecagon dwelling in the country. The dwelling features include: a structural steel cantilever pedestal; a dodecagon footprint and design; cedar board cladding; a hipped roof with twelve facets; a raised, central skylight with a decorative collar; a central, circular, interior skylight opening lined with stained cedar; a stained cedar ceiling lining the main living areas, including living and dining areas, kitchen, halls, and master bedroom; a steel frame porch and bridge; an angled, vertical plank fence along the porch and bridge; a rear porch extension; four large square picture windows along the rear of the building; transom windows along the façade and eastern elevations; lowerlevel rounded glass bay which houses a spiral staircase; interior spiral staircase including second storey wood banister; and deep soffits with embedded lights. The surrounding landscape includes an exterior cut-stone staircase, a lower, circular walkway delineated with cut-stone features surrounding the dwelling's pedestal and cut-stone planter features. The property also features mature fruiting and hardwood trees, whose intentional presence are connected to the building's original design and relationship with nearby Sydenham Creek.
- 2. The property displays a high degree of craftsmanship in the cantilever pedestal form of the dwelling, the design of the steel frame porch and bridge, including an angled, vertical plank fence along the porch and bridge, and the central skylight and collar. The stained cedar detailing surrounding the interior central, circular, skylight opening and main living areas, including living and dining areas, kitchen, halls, and master bedroom also display a high degree of craftsmanship.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully. OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 7 Rolph Street, Dundas, known as the Lennard House / Mushroom House, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED24125) (Ward 13) - Page 5 of 8

3. The property demonstrates a high degree of technical achievement. The dwelling's pedestal form was designed as a practical solution to the topography of the site. The property's location in Sydenham Creek's floodplain causes frequent flooding resulting in municipal regulations over the site prohibiting the construction of both a basement and living quarters at ground level. The steel cantilever pedestal design of the dwelling allows it to support the main living area above ground level away from flooding. The unique dodecagon shape of the dwelling is also noteworthy, as the only recorded example of such a dwelling in Hamilton and one of few such dwellings in North America.

Historical / Associative Value

4. The property has historical and associative value due to its connections with the Lennard family, including Harry Lennard a notable architect, and with Hugh and Marjorie Clark. The dwelling at 7 Rolph Street was designed by Harry Lennard for his parents Samuel Bertram Lennard (Bert) (1905-1981) and Gladys Louisa McInnis Lennard (1906-1989) in 1969 and was completed in 1971. Harry Lennard designed the house early in his career while employed for Trevor Garwood-Jones, a prominent Hamilton architectural firm, where he worked on the design of hospitals, churches, schools, residences, and cultural facilities. Throughout his career Harry Lennard has played important roles in the construction of major landmarks, including the theatre complex then known as Hamilton Place now named First Ontario Concert Hall. Lennard was also principal architect for the restoration and interior reconstruction of St. James Anglican Church in Dundas after it was damaged by a fire in 1978. Harry Lennard opened a private practice in 1979, where he undertook a broad range of projects including several more single detached residences in Burlington and several renovations and additions for schools in Milton, before retiring in 2005.

The Lennard family is associated with the notable historic Dundas apparel business S. Lennard & Sons Ltd., founded by Bertram's grandfather Samuel Lennard (1829-1892). S. Lennard & Sons Ltd. was active from 1879 to 1973 and was known for producing knit underwear. At its peak, S. Lennard & Sons Ltd. employed as many as 200 Dundas workers, operating out of a now demolished brick building on the south-west corner of John and King Streets. S. Lennard and Sons Ltd. remained a family business until it was sold in 1969 to Shelway Holdings Ltd. and was closed by its new owners in 1973. During his life Bert was employed by this longstanding family business, serving as superintendent for a time.

In addition to 7 Rolph Street, the Lennard's also owned the property at 36 (previously 35) Cayley Street which directly abuts the rear (northern) limit of 7 Rolph Street prior to construction of the Lennard / Mushroom House. Bertram

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 7 Rolph Street, Dundas, known as the Lennard House / Mushroom House, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED24125) (Ward 13) - Page 6 of 8

and Gladys Lennard lived at 36 Cayley Street for several decades, where they raised their children including Harry Lennard. As Bertram and Gladys aged, they required a smaller home to meet their needs, prompting Harry Lennard to use the Lennard's existing property at 7 Rolph Street as inspiration for the design of the Lennard / Mushroom house. Given that the property at 7 Rolph Street is in a floodplain, it remained undeveloped until the Lennard / Mushroom house was built. The Lennard / Mushroom House's dual name comes from its historical / architectural affiliation and its design. The 'Lennard House' title is drawn from its connection with the Lennard family, including Gladys, Bertram, and Harry Lennard, while the 'Mushroom House' title originates in reference to the building's design, and is used widely by local residents and has been referenced by Harry Lennard in the 'mushroom shaped' design of the building.

The late 1960s and 1970s saw a trend of architectural innovation inspired by imaginations of the future and the relationships between humanity and nature, catalyzed in Canada in part by Expo 67 in Montreal, spilling over into Ontario in places like Ontario Place (completed in 1972). During this time, interest in pedestal forms for their tree-like properties grew, and by the mid-1960s the technology needed to construct cantilever pedestal buildings had been developed. In the case of the Lennard / Mushroom house, the inspiration behind the building's dodecagon design reportedly came from Bertram Lennard's desire to live in a circular house. Harry Lennard was able use recent developments in architecture to realize his father's vision, highlighting the local impact and reach which broader innovative architectural discourse had on Canadian communities at this time.

In 1989 the property was sold to Marjorie Hawkins Clark (1928-2007) and Hugh Clark (1932-2018). Hugh Clark was a notable Hamiltonian, having served as CEO of the Adam Clark Company Limited, founded in 1877 by Hugh's grandfather. It was one of the oldest Hamilton companies still in business, prior to its sale in 2008 to Aecon. Hugh made an impact in Hamilton with a strong interest in local philanthropy, founding the Clark family foundation with his brother, and the Marjorie Hawkins Clark Fund after Marjorie's death in 2007.

- 5. The property does not yield or have the potential to yield information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture.
- 6. The property demonstrates and reflect the work or ideas of Harry Lennard, a notable architect who was born and raised in Dundas, and who has strong familial connections to significant historic Dundas businesses.

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Employees.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 7 Rolph Street, Dundas, known as the Lennard House / Mushroom House, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED24125) (Ward 13) - Page 7 of 8

Contextual Value

- 7. The property is important in defining the character of this area. The Lennard house is an important landmark in its immediate residential landscape and is indicative of experimental trends in housing design in the second half of the twentieth century. The wooded character of the property at 7 Rolph Street including fruit and hardwood trees also maintains and supports surrounding natural features like the Sydenham Creek.
- 8. The property is visually and historically linked to its surroundings. The Lennard house is historically associated with surrounding properties, including 36 (formerly 35) Cayley Street which served as Bertram and Gladys Lennard's home for several decades, and which was the childhood home of Harry Lennard. The property is additionally linked to the historic evolution of Dundas's residential landscape in the twentieth century, with its design showcasing changes in values and trends in the early contemporary period. The intentional architectural and landscape design of the property is connected to its relationship with nearby Sydenham Creek. The raised nature of the main living area, and projecting porch, is embedded in the tree canopy on the property.
- 9. The property can be considered to be a landmark. The dwelling's unique 'mushroom' shape stands out in the surrounding historic and post-war residential landscape. The property has often been included in architectural tours and other public materials surveying properties of interest as an important architectural landmark.

Based on the foregoing, staff have determined that 7 Rolph Street, Dundas, is of cultural heritage value or interest sufficient to warrant designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Heritage attributes of value include contextual attributes, the exterior of the building and key interior features tied to the original architect design, as outlined in Appendix "B" to Report PED24125. Staff recommend designation according to the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED24125.

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the designation of property is a discretionary activity on the part of Council. Council, as advised by its Municipal Heritage Committee, may decide to designate property or decline to designate property.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Employees.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 7 Rolph Street, Dundas, known as the Lennard House / Mushroom House, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED24125) (Ward 13) - Page 8 of 8

Decline to Designate

By declining to designate, the municipality would be unable to provide long-term, legal protection to this significant cultural heritage resource (designation provides protection against inappropriate alterations and demolition) and would not fulfil the expectations established by existing municipal and provincial policies.

Without designation, the property would not be eligible for the City's financial incentives for heritage properties, including development charge exemption and grant and loan programs. Designation alone does not restrict the legal use of property, prohibit alterations and additions, nor does it restrict the sale of a property, or been demonstrated to affect its resale value. However, designation does allow the municipality to manage change to the heritage attributes of a property through the Heritage Permit process. Staff does not consider declining to designate the property to be an appropriate conservation alternative.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix "A" to Report PED24125 – Location Map Appendix "B" to Report PED24125 – Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes Appendix "C" to Report PED24125 – Photographs Appendix "D" to Report PED24125 – Research Sources

MB/MO/sd