




CITY OF HAMILTON
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
Planning Division

TO:	Chair and Committee Members Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	September 27, 2024
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Recommendation to Designate 24 Blake Street, Hamilton, (Eastcourt Carriage House) under Part IV of the <i>Ontario Heritage Act</i> (PED24171) (Ward 3)
WARD(S) AFFECTED:	Ward 3
PREPARED BY:	Maryssa Barras (905) 546-2424, ext.6126 Meg Oldfield (905) 546-2424, ext. 7163
SUBMITTED BY:	Anita Fabac Acting Director, Planning and Chief Planner Planning and Economic Development Department
SIGNATURE:	

RECOMMENDATION

That the City Clerk be directed to give notice of Council's intention to designate 24 Blake Street, Hamilton (Eastcourt Carriage House), shown in Appendix "A" attached to Report PED24171, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, in accordance with the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED24171, subject to the following:

- (a) If no objections are received to the notice of intention to designate in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, City Council directs staff to introduce the necessary by-law to designate the property to be of cultural heritage value or interest to City Council;
- (b) If an objection to the notice of intention to designate is received in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, City Council directs staff to report back to Planning Committee to allow Council to consider the objection and decide whether or not to withdraw the notice of intention to designate the property.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This Report recommends designation of the significant built heritage resource located at 24 Blake Street, Hamilton, known as the Eastcourt Carriage House, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The subject property is currently listed on the City's Municipal Heritage Register. Staff have completed an evaluation of the subject property using Ontario Regulation 9/06 and determined that it has sufficient cultural heritage value or interest to warrant designation, as per the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED24171. While the one-and-one-half-storey circa 1875 carriage house located at the rear of the property has been identified as having heritage value and is recommended to be designated, the property is also comprised of a circa 1910 two-and-one-half-storey dwelling which is not intended to be identified or protected by designation. The owner of the property is supportive of the staff recommendation to designate.

Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 7

FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: N/A

Staffing: N/A

Legal: The designation process will follow the requirements of the *Ontario Heritage Act* and provide for adequate notice of Council's intention to designate the property. Formal objections may be made under the *Ontario Heritage Act* and considered by Council before either withdrawing the notice of intention to designate or passing a designation by-law. Once a designation by-law has been passed, any further objection would be heard before the Ontario Land Tribunal.

Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* allows municipalities to recognize a property's cultural heritage value or interest, and to conserve and manage the property through the Heritage Permit process enabled under Sections 33 (alterations) and 34 (demolition or removal) of the Act.

Where alterations to designated properties are contemplated, a property owner is required to apply for, obtain, and comply with a Heritage Permit, for any alteration that "is likely to affect the property's heritage attributes, as set out in the description of the property's heritage attributes" (Sub-section 33(1)).

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The subject property located at 24 Blake Street, Hamilton, shown in Appendix “A” attached to Report PED24171, is comprised of a circa 1910 two-and-a-half-storey dwelling and a one-and one-half-storey detached brick accessory building constructed circa 1875. The subject property was first surveyed for potential heritage interest in 2019 by the Inventory and Research Working Group of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee, which focused their review on the heritage value of the former Eastcourt Carriage House located at the rear of the property. In 2020, the property was listed on the Municipal Heritage Register and the Carriage House was added to staff’s designation workplan for further research and assessment of the property.

On May 8, 2024, staff received an inquiry from the property owner looking for more information on their property’s heritage status. In subsequent phone and email conversations with the owner, they expressed interest in having their property designated and the financial incentives available for designated heritage properties that would assist them in restoring the building. Staff conducted a site visit of the property on June 3, 2024, at which time the owner expressed their continued interest in the designation of the property. On August 9, 2024, staff advised the owner of the recommendation to designate the property, provided them with a copy of the proposed Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and advised them of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee meeting that the recommendation would be considered.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

The Recommendation of this Report is consistent with Provincial and Municipal legislation, policy, and direction, including:

- Determining the cultural heritage value or interest of a property based on design/physical value, historical/associative value, and contextual value criteria (*Ontario Heritage Act*, Ontario Regulation 9/06);
- Ensuring significant built heritage resources are conserved (Provincial Policy Statement, 2020, Sub-section 2.6.1); and,
- Designating properties of cultural heritage value under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (Urban Hamilton Official Plan, Section B.3.4.2.3).

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

External

- Property Owner

In addition, on August 9, 2024, Cultural Heritage Planning staff emailed the Ward Councillor (Councillor N. Nann) for Ward 3 to advise of the staff recommendation to designate the property.

ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

The intent of municipal designation, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, is to enable a process for the management and conservation of significant cultural heritage resources. Once a property is designated, the municipality can manage change to a property through the Heritage Permit process to ensure that the significant features of the property are maintained.

Section 29(1) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* permits the Council of a municipality to designate property to be of cultural heritage value or interest where the property meets two or more of the Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest prescribed in Ontario Regulation 9/06, as amended by Ontario Regulation 569/22, which identifies nine criteria in three broad categories: Design / Physical Value; Historical / Associative Value; and Contextual Value. The evaluation of cultural heritage value or interest of the subject property was completed by Cultural Heritage Planning staff based on a site visit to the property conducted on May 29 and June 3, 2024 (see photographs attached as Appendix "C" to Report PED24171) and available secondary and primary research sources (attached as Appendix "D" to PED24171). As outlined below, based on staff's cultural heritage evaluation, it was determined that the subject property meets five of the nine criteria contained in Ontario Regulation 9/06 in all three categories.

Design / Physical Value

1. The property at 24 Blake Street has physical value as a representative and unique example of a nineteenth-century brick carriage house influenced by the Second Empire style of architecture. The one-and-one-half-storey brick carriage house located at the rear (west) of the property was constructed circa 1875 as part of the now demolished Eastcourt residence. The outbuilding was designed to match the Second Empire style and ornate detailing of Eastcourt, including its Mansard roof with half-round dormers and segmentally arched window and door openings with brick voussoirs and cast-iron ornaments.

The use of cast-iron ornamentation over window and door opening keystones and at the proximal ends of their decorative arches is also considered to be rare. By the late 1880s, cast iron had been largely replaced by galvanized iron, a form of sheet metal, which became very popular for fabricating ornate cornices and window surrounds, with cast iron being relegated to storefronts for both structural and ornamental function.

Although historic images of the carriage house have not yet been found, historic mapping (Fire Insurance Plans) and differences in the brickwork suggest that the building has undergone modifications from its original design, with garage doors installed on the south and east elevations, and an additional large opening added to the west elevation which has truncated two of the original window and door openings. The property also features a circa 1910 two-and-one-half-storey brick dwelling located at the front (eastern) part of the property, which is not considered to be of significant heritage value worthy of protection at this time.

2. The property displays a high degree of craftsmanship as demonstrated by the remaining cast-iron ornamentation in the window and door openings.
3. The property does not demonstrate a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

Historical / Associative Value

4. The property has historical value for its association with prominent Hamiltonians and late-nineteenth-to-early-twentieth century women's organizations and advocacy. The Eastcourt Carriage House is believed to have been originally built circa 1875, at the same time as the Eastcourt Estate for Edward Mitchell (circa 1840-1892), a local businessman who worked with the Bank of Commerce. In 1893, the property was purchased by Joseph Hoodless (1824-1895) and his son John Hoodless (1854-1923) of J. Hoodless & Son, a Hamilton-based furniture manufacturing business. Joseph moved into the property immediately, while John and his family, including his wife, Adelaide Hoodless, nee Hunter (1857-1910), and their children moved onto the property in 1894.

Adelaide Hoodless was an important and high-profile political player and champion for Canadian women's education in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries, eventually gaining national recognition. Locally, Adelaide participated in the founding of Hamilton's Young Women's Christian Association (YWCA) chapter in 1889, becoming its second president in 1890. With the YWCA, Adelaide promoted training for women in homemaking skills and opened the School of Domestic Science, the very first of its kind, in 1894 at the Hamilton YWCA. Drawing on this success, in 1900 she played a central role in establishing the Ontario Normal School of Domestic Science and Art in Hamilton.

Beyond Hamilton, Adelaide was also an important political influencer at National and Provincial levels, participating in international and national women's conferences, and playing an instrumental role in forming the YWCA Canada in 1895, the Women's Institute in 1897, and presiding over the creation of the Macdonald Institute of Home Economics in Guelph in 1903. In these roles

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe, and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

Adelaide influenced the Ontario government to adopt domestic science into its public education in 1897, subsequently writing the very first domestic science textbook in Canada in 1898. As an important and high-profile figure in women's organizing, Eastcourt became a frequented gathering place for important discussions and formal meetings for the organizations and individuals affiliated with Adelaide. Despite her advocacy for women's education and contribution to women's organizing, it is worth noting that in her life Adelaide was opposed to radical movements like women's suffrage (the right to vote and hold political office), and instead supported conservative movements to integrate women into Canadian politics through her connections with organizations like the National Council of Women of Canada.

In 1910, the plot of land on which the Eastcourt residence stood was surveyed and subdivided into smaller lots, including a public laneway. The Carriage House was subdivided at this time into a separate lot, and the laneway was plotted to circumvent the building, before being added to the property at 24 Blake Street by 1911. Following Adelaide's death, the Hoodless family vacated Eastcourt, and the building was converted into apartments which were occupied by 1914. These apartments, known as the Eastcourt Apartments, remained occupied until at least 1969, but the building had fallen into disrepair and was demolished after the property was purchased for redevelopment into a school building which opened in 1972. The carriage house, which had been part of 24 Blake Street for over half a century at that point, was spared demolition.

5. The property has the potential to yield information that contributes to an understanding of Adelaide Hoodless, late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century women's movements and organising, and the early urban development of the Blakeley Neighbourhood. As the last remaining building connected to the Eastcourt Estate, the Eastcourt Carriage House stands as a testament to the design and detail of the historically significant property.
6. The property does not demonstrate or reflect the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer, or theorist who is significant in the community.

Contextual Value

7. The Eastcourt Carriage House's well-hidden location behind the early-twentieth century dwelling at 24 Blake Street means that the property is important in supporting, but not defining the character of the area. The Carriage House serves as a tangible reminder of the Eastcourt Estate, which would have been one of a series of substantial estates, including mansion and outbuildings surrounded by attractively landscaped grounds, owned by the nineteenth-century local elite on Main Street East. Its presence is also a tangible reminder of the

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe, and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.

historic evolution of the Blakeley Neighbourhood, including the evolution of the Eastcourt Estate into apartments.

8. The property is historically and physically linked to its surroundings as the last remaining building from the original landmark estate which historically defined the upper-class residential character of the area now known as Blakeley Neighbourhood. The Carriage House has also played an important role in shaping local urban development, with the 1910 plan for the area showing plans for the present-day public laneway to accommodate and wrap around the building. It is further linked to nearby properties including: 770 Main Street East (the lot on which the Eastcourt Estate was historically located), 7 Blake Street, historically known as Linden Place and now known as Adelaide Residence after Adelaide Hoodless, which was also constructed in the Second Empire style in the same year as the Eastcourt; and, the Adelaide Hoodless Elementary School at 71 Maplewood Avenue, which was constructed and named in honour of Adelaide Hoodless shortly following her death.
9. The property is not considered to be a local landmark.

Based on the foregoing, staff have determined that the historic carriage house building located at the rear of 24 Blake Street, Hamilton, is of cultural heritage value or interest sufficient to warrant designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Heritage attributes of value include the exterior of the building, as outlined in Appendix “B” to Report PED24171. Staff recommend designation according to the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix “B” to Report PED24171.

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the designation of property is a discretionary activity on the part of Council. Council, as advised by its Municipal Heritage Committee, may decide to designate property, or decline to designate property.

Decline to Designate

By declining to designate, the municipality would be unable to provide long-term, legal protection to this significant cultural heritage resource (designation provides protection against inappropriate alterations and demolition) and would not fulfil the expectations established by existing municipal and provincial policies.

Without designation, the property would not be eligible for the City’s financial incentives for heritage properties, including development charge exemption and grant and loan programs. Designation alone does not restrict the legal use of property, prohibit

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 24 Blake Street, Hamilton, (Eastcourt Carriage House) under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED24171) (Ward 3) - Page 8 of 8

alterations and additions, nor does it restrict the sale of a property, or been demonstrated to affect its resale value. However, designation does allow the municipality to manage change to the heritage attributes of a property through the Heritage Permit process. Staff does not consider declining to designate the property to be an appropriate conservation alternative.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix "A" to Report PED24171 – Location Map

Appendix "B" to Report PED24171 – Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes

Appendix "C" to Report PED24171 – Photographs

Appendix "D" to Report PED24171 – Research Sources

MB/MO: mb

OUR Vision: To be the best place to raise a child and age successfully.

OUR Mission: To provide high quality cost conscious public services that contribute to a healthy, safe, and prosperous community, in a sustainable manner.

OUR Culture: Collective Ownership, Steadfast Integrity, Courageous Change, Sensational Service, Engaged Empowered Employees.