

AUDIT, FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE MINUTES 24-021

9:30 a.m. November 21, 2024 Council Chambers Hamilton City Hall

Present: Councillors T. Hwang (Chair), M. Spadafora (Vice-Chair), J. Beattie (virtually), B. Clark (virtually), C. Kroetsch, M. Tadeson, A. Wilson and M. Wilson

Also Present: Councillor C. Cassar

THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REFERRED TO COUNCIL FOR CONSIDERATION:

1. Volunteer Advisory Committee Review (CM23025(a)) (City Wide) (Outstanding Business List) (Item 8.1)

(Kroetsch/Beattie)

- (b) That **staff report back with a plan to disband** the following Advisory Committees and that their members be thanked by Council for their service to the community:
 - (i) Committee Against Racism;
 - (ii) Food Advisory Committee;
 - (iii) Immigrants and Refugees Advisory Committee; and,
 - (iv) Mundialization Advisory Committee.

Result: Motion on Subsection (b) of Report CM23025(a), as *Amended,* CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 2, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson NO - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang NO - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

2. Fraud and Waste Annual Report (AUD24006) (City Wide) (Item 8.2)

(Spadafora/Tadeson)

That Appendices "A", "B", and "C" to Report AUD24006, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

3. Auditor General Reporting of Serious Matters to Council (Case #78878) (AUD24007) (City Wide) (Item 9.1)

(Tadeson/Clark)

That Report AUD24006, respecting Auditor General Reporting of Serious Matters to Council (Case #78878), be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson

ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch

- YES CHAIR Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
- YES Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
- YES Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
- YES Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
- YES Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
- YES Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

4. Stormwater Asset Management – Investigation of Recent Sewage Leaks Audit (PW24071) (City Wide) (Item 10.1)

(Clark/Spadafora)

That Report PW24071, respecting Stormwater Asset Management – Investigation of Recent Sewage Leaks Audit, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

5. 2025 City Enrichment Fund Advance Payments (CM24007) (City Wide) (Item 10.2)

(Clark/Tadeson)

- (a) That, effective January 1, 2025, advance payments from the City Enrichment Fund be provided to the organizations as specified in Appendix "A" of Report CM24007; and
- (b) That any outstanding arrears owed to the City of Hamilton by these organizations, as detailed in Appendix "A" of Report CM24007, be deducted from the approved City Enrichment Fund grants, including any advance payments, until the debt is fully satisfied, prior to issuing the remaining approved funds to that organization.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

- YES Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
- ABSENT Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
- YES CHAIR Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
- YES Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
- YES Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
- YES Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
- YES Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
- YES Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

6. 2025 Temporary Borrowing and Interim Tax Levy By-laws (FCS24049) (City Wide) (Item 10.3)

(Spadafora/Beattie)

- (a) That Appendix "A" attached to Report FCS24049, "By-law to Authorize the Temporary Borrowing of Monies to Meet Current Expenditures Pending Receipt of Current Revenues for 2025", be enacted; and
- (b) That Appendix "B" attached to Report FCS24049, "By-law to Authorize an Interim Tax Levy for 2025", be enacted.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark YES - Ward 10 Councillor Brad Clark YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

7. Governance Review Sub-Committee Report 24-002 (October 31, 2024) (Item 10.4)

(M. Wilson/A. Wilson)

(a) Governance Workplan (City Wide) (CC24001) (Item 10.1)

That Report CC24001, respecting Governance Workplan, be received.

(b) 2025 Council and Committee Schedule of Meetings (FCS24062) (Added Item 10.2)

- That the 2025 Committee and Council Schedule of Meetings, as presented in Appendix A to Governance Review Sub-Committee Report 24-002, be approved; and
- (ii) That the necessary amendment to the Procedural By-law, By-law 21-021, respecting the Committee and Council Schedule of Meetings, be prepared and presented for Council consideration.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 6 to 1, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang NO - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie YES - Ward 10 Councillor Mark Tadeson YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

8. Proposed Changes to Schedule B: Fees, Gifts and Hospitality of the Code of Conduct for Employees Policy (HUR24011) (Item 10.5)

(Spadafora/Beattie)

- (a) That the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee approve the proposed changes to Schedule B: Fees, Gifts and Hospitality within the Code of Conduct for Employees Policy, as outlined in Appendix "A" attached to Report HUR24011. The recommended amendments to Schedule B include the following:
 - (i) That the terms 'gifts' and 'hospitality' within the policy be defined as separate items, with different and distinct criteria for each;
 - (ii) That the different nominal amounts referenced in the Schedule be eliminated, in favour of one consistent amount (\$50);
 - (iii) That the amendments to the Schedule that clarifies the criteria for when employees can accept hospitality be accepted;

- (iv) That any gifts over \$50 received by employees will be returned, or given to charity, or shared with other employees;
- (v) That gifts of alcohol cannot be accepted;
- (vi) That hospitality offered to employees that exceed \$50 in value will require approval by the General Manager; and
- (vii) That employees be required to track the acceptance of gifts and hospitality, and should the amount exceed \$200 annually, submit a disclosure form by end of calendar year.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson YES - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

9. Inclusion of Studies in the 2024 Development Charges By-law (FCS24051) (City Wide) (Added Item 10.6(a))

(Spadafora/Tadeson)

That Appendix "A" attached to Report FCS24051 respecting a By-Law to Amend By-Law 24-072, Respecting Development Charges on Lands within the City of Hamilton, which has been prepared in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor, be passed and enacted.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

- YES Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
- YES Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
- YES CHAIR Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
- YES Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
- YES Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
- YES Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
- YES Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
- YES Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

10. Review of the Council Codes of Conduct at Other Municipalities Respecting Limiting or Prohibiting the Accepting of Gifts for Elected Officials (FCS24057) (City Wide) (Outstanding Business List Item) (Added Item 10.7)

(Kroetsch/M. Wilson)

That Report FCS24057, respecting Review of the Council Codes of Conduct at Other Municipalities Respecting Limiting or Prohibiting the Accepting of Gifts for Elected Officials, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

- YES Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
- YES Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
- YES CHAIR Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
- YES Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
- YES Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
- YES Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
- YES Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
- YES Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

FOR INFORMATION:

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 2)

The Committee Clerk advised of the following changes to the agenda.

6. DELEGATION REQUESTS

6.1 Ian Borsuk, Environment Hamilton, respecting Item 8.1 Volunteer Advisory Committee Review (for today's meeting)

10. DISCUSSION ITEMS

- 10.6(a) Inclusion of Studies in the 2024 Development Charges By-law (FCS24051) (City Wide)
- 10.7 Review of the Council Codes of Conduct at Other Municipalities Respecting Limiting or Prohibiting the Accepting of Gifts for Elected Officials (FCS24057) (City Wide) (Outstanding Business List Item)

13. GENERAL INFORMATION / OTHER BUSINESS

- 13.1 Amendments to Outstanding Business List
 - 13.1.a.d Amendment to the Council Code of Conduct Policy (HUR23009)

Added June 1, 2023

Subsection (b) addressed as Item 10.7 on today's agenda

CHANGES TO THE ORDER OF THE AGENDA

Item 10.7, Review of the Council Codes of Conduct at Other Municipalities Respecting Limiting or Prohibiting the Accepting of Gifts for Elected Officials, will be moved up on the agenda to be considered immediately following Item 10.5, as the two reports are related.

(Spadafora/Tadeson)

That the agenda for the November 21, 2024 Audit, Finance and Administration Committee meeting, be approved, as amended.

CARRIED

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 3)

There were no declarations of interest.

(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING (Item 4)

(i) Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting (Item 4.1)

(Tadeson/Kroetsch)

That the Minutes of the November 7, 2024 meeting, be approved, as presented.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

- YES Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
- YES Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
- YES CHAIR Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
- YES Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
- YES Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
- YES Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson

ABSENT - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson

YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(d) DELEGATION REQUESTS (Item 6)

(i) Ian Borsuk, Environment Hamilton, respecting Item 8.1 Volunteer Advisory Committee Review (Item 6.1)

(Tadeson/Kroetsch)

That the Delegation Request from Ian Borsuk, Environment Hamilton, respecting Item 8.1 Volunteer Advisory Committee Review, be approved for today's meeting.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson

YES - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson ABSENT - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(e) DELEGATIONS (Item 7)

(i) Ian Borsuk, Environment Hamilton, respecting Item 8.1 Volunteer Advisory Committee Review (Added Item 7.1)

Ian Borsuk, Environment Hamilton, addressed Committee respecting Item 8.1 Volunteer Advisory Committee Review.

(Tadeson/Kroetsch)

That the Delegation from Ian Borsuk, Environment Hamilton, respecting Item 8.1 Volunteer Advisory Committee Review, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson YES - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang ABSENT - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(f) STAFF PRESENTATIONS (Item 8)

(i) Volunteer Advisory Committee Review (CM23025(a)) (City Wide) (Outstanding Business List) (Item 8.1)

(1) Rebecca Banky, Project Manager, Community Inclusion and Equity, addressed Committee respecting Volunteer Advisory Committee Review, with the aid of a presentation.

(Kroetsch/Beattie)

That the presentation from Rebecca Banky, Project Manager, Community Inclusion and Equity, respecting Volunteer Advisory Committee Review, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson

- YES Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
- YES CHAIR Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang

- YES Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
- YES Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
- YES Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
- YES Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
- YES Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(2) (Tadeson/Kroetsch)

- (a) That, based on municipal best practices, a new civic engagement model be applied that uses community liaison groups of volunteers, with each Division reporting back within one year, and that the:
 - (i) Tourism and Culture Division staff report back to the General Issues Committee on the creation of a community liaison group to replace the Arts Advisory Committee to recommend activities for the stabilization and strengthening of the arts community, monitor and assist with the implementation of the Arts Awards Program and Public Art Program, and inform Council of issues and achievements in the Hamilton arts community and acts as a point of contact for members of the arts community regarding issues affecting the arts community; and that the 2024 approved budget currently assigned to the Arts Advisory Committee be transferred to this Division to support this working group;
 - Climate Change Initiatives Division staff report back to (ii) the General Issues Committee on the creation of a community liaison group to replace the Climate Change Advisory Committee to provide advice to Council and City staff on the prioritization, implementation, and monitoring of Hamilton's Climate Action Strategy, through an equitable, inclusive, and climate justice lens, that responds to the perspectives and needs of all, while transitioning to a prosperous. healthy and vibrant net-zero greenhouse gas community that is a national leader in climate adaptation; and that the 2024 approved budget currently assigned to the Climate Change Advisory Committee be transferred to this Division to support this working group;
 - (iii) Active Transportation and Mobility Division staff report back to the Public Works Committee on the further development of the Division's Mobility Lab, a community liaison group, to also replace the Hamilton Cycling Committee, expanding their mandate to encourage residents to cycle and monitor the implementation of the Hamilton Cycling Master Plan;

and that the 2024 approved budget currently assigned to the Hamilton Cycling Committee be transferred to this Division to support this working group;

- (iv) Indigenous Relations Division staff report back to the Emergency and Community Services Committee on the creation of a community liaison group to replace the Hamilton Indigenous Advisory Committee to honour and engage Indigenous residents in the pursuit of the City's vision by providing advice and recommendations that enhance the wellbeing of Indigenous people; and that the 2024 approved budget currently assigned to the Hamilton Indigenous Advisory Committee be transferred to this Division to support this working group;
- (v) Heritage Resource Management Division staff report back to the Emergency and Community Services Committee on the creation of a community liaison group to replace the Hamilton Veterans Committee to oversee the planning and delivery of military remembrance and commemoration activities on behalf of the City; and that the 2024 approved budget currently assigned to the Hamilton Veterans Committee be transferred to this Division to support this working group;
- (vi) Children's & Community Services Division staff report back to the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee on the creation of a community liaison group to replace the Hamilton Women and Gender Equity Advisory Committee to provide input with respect to the issues of women, non-binary individuals and gender diverse people; and that the 2024 approved budget currently assigned to the Hamilton Women and Gender Equity Advisory Committee be transferred to this Division to support this working group;
- (vii) Housing Secretariat staff, in partnership with Housing Services Divisions staff report back to the General Issues Committee on the further development of a community liaison group to also replace the Housing and Homelessness Advisory Committee, expanding their mandate to work to address the needs of citizens within the community for whom barriers exist to accessing safe, suitable, and affordable housing, including the supports needed to enable citizens to obtain and retain their homes; and that the 2024 approved budget currently assigned to the Housing

and Homelessness Committee be transferred to this Division to support this working group;

- (viii) Environmental Services Division staff report back to the Public Works Committee on the creation of a community liaison group to replace the Keep Hamilton Clean and Green Committee to beautify our community, promote environmental stewardship, and prevent litter, illegal dumping and graffiti; and that the 2024 approved budget currently assigned to the Keep Hamilton Clean and Green Committee be transferred to this Division to support this working group;
- (ix) Children's & Community Services staff report back to the Emergency and Community Services Committee on the creation of a community liaison group to replace the LGBTQ Advisory Committee to eliminate barriers experienced by LGBTQ communities by giving voice to the perspectives of LGBTQ individuals and evaluating the City on its related efforts; and that the 2024 approved budget currently assigned to the LGBTQ Advisory Committee be transferred to this Division to support this working group;
- (x) Lodges Division staff report back to the Emergency and Community Services Committee on the creation of a community liaison group to replace the Seniors Advisory Committee to organize the Senior of the Year Awards and to be a credible communication vehicle regarding the quality of life for all older persons in the City; and that the 2024 approved budget currently assigned to the Seniors Advisory Committee be transferred to this Division to support this working group; and
- (xi) Reserve budgets remaining from Advisory Committees transitioning to working groups be transferred to the Tax Stabilization reserve;
- (b) That the following Advisory Committees be disbanded, and their members thanked by Council for their service to the community:
 - (i) Committee Against Racism;
 - (ii) Food Advisory Committee;
 - (iii) Immigrants and Refugees Advisory Committee; and,
 - (iv) Mundialization Advisory Committee;

- (c) That staff be directed to review the Accessibility Committee for Persons with Disabilities for alignment with the City's new civic engagement model and community liaison groups;
- (d) That staff in the Office of the City Clerk, in consultation with the City Manager's Office, develop and host a robust and mandatory training program for staff supporting community liaison groups, inclusive of:
 - (i) Civic engagement best practices in alignment with the City's Public Engagement Policy and Framework;
 - (ii) Legislative policies and procedural requirements for meetings; and,
 - Decorum and behavioural expectations including an explanation of the role of the City's Integrity Commissioner;
- (e) That staff in the City Manager's Office be directed to work with the Integrity Commissioner and Clerks Office to develop and host a training program for members of community liaison groups on expectations, liabilities, and project plans.

(3) (Beattie/Tadeson)

That subsection (a)(xi) be *amended* as follows:

(xi) Reserve budgets remaining from Advisory Committees transitioning to working groups be transferred to the Tax Stabilization reserve and that the transfer from the Hamilton Veterans Committee reserve of \$49,058 be committed for future investments for Remembrance Day services and youth-specific education regarding Veterans and Remembrance.

Result: Amendment CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

- YES Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
- YES Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
- YES CHAIR Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
- YES Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
- YES Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
- YES Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
- YES Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
- YES Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(4) (Kroetsch/A. Wilson)

That Report CM23025(a), *as Amended*, be referred to staff for report back to the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee in

Q1 2025 with options for a future model for volunteer advisory committees that better delineate the roles and responsibilities of those committees respecting support for citywide events and advice given directly to Council, that ensure that advisory committees continue to be citizen led and have a direct connection to Council through which to offer their advice.

Result: *Amendment* **DEFEATED** by a vote of 4 to 4, as follows:

NO - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson YES - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang NO - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark NO - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie YES - Ward 10 Councillor Mark Tadeson YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson NO - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(5) (A. Wilson/M. Wilson)

That subsection (b) be **amended** as follows:

- (b) That staff report back with a plan to disband the following Advisory Committees be disbanded, and their members thanked by Council for their service to the community:
 - (i) Committee Against Racism;
 - (ii) Food Advisory Committee;
 - (iii) Immigrants and Refugees Advisory Committee; and,
 - (iv) Mundialization Advisory Committee.

Result: Amendment CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

- YES Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
- YES Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
- YES CHAIR Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
- YES Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
- YES Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
- YES Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
- YES Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
- YES Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

Subsection (b) of Report CM23025(a), respecting the Volunteer Advisory Committee Review (City Wide) (Outstanding Business List) (Item 8.1), As Amended, was voted on separately. For the disposition of subsection (b) of Report CM23025(a), respecting the Volunteer Advisory Committee Review (City Wide) (Outstanding Business List) (Item 8.1), **As Amended,** refer to Item 1.

(6)

Result: Motion on the balance of Report CM23025(a), *As Amended*, DEFEATED by a vote of 4 to 4, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson NO - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang NO - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie NO - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson NO - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(ii) Fraud and Waste Annual Report (AUD24006) (City Wide) (Item 8.2)

Charles Brown, Auditor General, and Brigitte Minard, Deputy Auditor General, addressed Committee respecting Fraud and Waste Annual Report, with the aid of a presentation.

(Spadafora/Tadeson)

That the presentation from Charles Brown, Auditor General, and Brigitte Minard, Deputy Auditor General, respecting Fraud and Waste Annual Report, be received.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson ABSENT - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch YES - CHAIR - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark YES - Ward 10 Councillor Brad Clark YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson YES - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

For further disposition of this matter, refer to Item 2.

(g) GENERAL INFORMATON / OTHER BUSINESS (Item 13)

(i) Amendments to the Outstanding Business List (Item 13.1)

(Spadafora/Beattie)

That the following amendments to the Outstanding Business List, be approved:

(1) Items Considered Complete and To Be Removed

(a) Stormwater Asset Management – Investigation of Recent Sewage Leaks Audit

Added November 16, 2023 Addressed as Item 10.1 on today's agenda

(b) Review of the City of Hamilton Volunteer Advisory Committees

> Added September 7, 2023 Addressed as Item 8.1 on today's agenda

(c) Amendment to Code of Conduct Policy (HUR23009)

Added Jun 1, 2023 Subsection (a) addressed as Item 10.5 on today's agenda

(d) Amendment to the Council Code of Conduct Policy (HUR23009)

Added June 1, 2023 Subsection (b) addressed as Item 10.7 on today's agenda

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

- YES Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
- YES Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
- YES CHAIR Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
- YES Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
- YES Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
- YES Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
- YES Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
- YES Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(h) ADJOURNMENT (Item 15)

(Tadeson/Clark)

That, there being no further business, the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee, be adjourned at 12:47 p.m.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

- YES Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
- YES Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
- YES CHAIR Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
- YES Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
- YES Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
- YES Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
- YES Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
- YES Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

Respectfully submitted,

Councillor Tammy Hwang, Chair Audit, Finance and Administration Committee

Tamara Bates Legislative Coordinator Office of the City Clerk