



AUDIT, FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE

MINUTES AFAC 25-001

9:30 a.m.

January 16, 2025

Council Chambers (Hybrid), City Hall, 2nd Floor
71 Main Street West, Hamilton, Ontario

Present: Councillors M. Spadafora (Chair), J. Beattie (Vice-Chair) (virtually), B. Clark, T. Hwang, C. Kroetsch, M. Tadeson, A. Wilson (virtually) and M. Wilson

1. CALL TO ORDER

Committee Chair M. Spadafora called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

2. CEREMONIAL ACTIVITIES

There were no ceremonial activities.

3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

(Hwang/Tadeson)

That the agenda for the January 16, 2025 Audit, Finance and Administration Committee meeting, be approved, as presented.

CARRIED

4. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

There were no declarations of interest.

5. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

5.1 December 5, 2024

(Kroetsch/Beattie)

That the minutes of the December 5, 2024 Audit, Finance and Administration Committee, be adopted, as presented.

CARRIED

6. DELEGATIONS

6.1 Karl Andrus, Hamilton Community Benefits Network, respecting policy for future social engagement around budget practices

Karl Andrus, Hamilton Community Benefits Network, addressed Committee respecting policy for future social engagement around budget practices with the aid of a presentation and a handout.

6.2 Henry Morris, respecting an appeal to the committee for the full grant of for backwater valve grant

Henry Morris addressed Committee respecting an appeal to the committee for the full grant of for backwater valve grant with the aid of a handout.

(a) Staff Supporting Documentation respecting Henry Morris, respecting an appeal to the committee for the full grant of for backwater valve grant

(Kroetsch/Hwang)

- (a) That the Delegation from Karl Andrus, Hamilton Community Benefits Network, respecting policy for future social engagement around budget practices be received and referred to the Mayor for consideration and request a report back through the Budget process;
- (b) That the Delegation from Henry Morris, respecting an appeal to the committee for the full grant of for backwater valve grant, be received; and,
- (c) That the Staff Supporting Documentation respecting Henry Morris, respecting an appeal to the committee for the full grant of for backwater valve grant, be received.

CARRIED

(Kroetsch/Hwang)

- (a) That staff be directed to report back to the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee in Q3 2025 with the following:
 - (i) an outline of the process for all matters subject to adjudication by the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee; and
 - (ii) any recommendations, either through a memo or other written document as a standard template to use as a way to provide context for their decision.

Councillor Kroetsch WITHDREW the motion.

7. ITEMS FOR INFORMATION

**7.1 AUD21004(a)
Cyber Security Follow Up Audit – Planning Summary (City Wide)**

(Clark/Hwang)

That consideration of Item 7.1, AUD21004(a), respecting Cyber Security Follow Up Audit, be deferred until after Closed Session.

CARRIED

8. PUBLIC HEARINGS

**8.1 FCS24016(a)
Community Benefits Charges By-Law Amendment**

The Chair advised that the non-statutory public meeting respecting Item 8.1 is being held to present and obtain public input on the City's proposed Community Benefits Charges By-Law Amendment. The Chair further advised that notice of the public meeting was published in the Hamilton Spectator on December 14, 2024 and on the City's website, inviting interested parties to make representations at today's meeting. Any person in attendance was able make representation.

Chair Spadafora called three times for public delegations and no one came forward.

(Tadeson/Kroetsch)

- (a) That there were no public submissions received regarding this matter; and,
- (b) That the public meeting be closed.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 7 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
ABSENT - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(M. Wilson/Tadeson)

That Report FCS24016(a) dated January 16, 2025, Community Benefits Charges By-Law Amendment, be received and the following recommendations be approved:

- (a) That the Community Benefits Charges By-Law Amendment, Appendix "A" to Report FCS24016(a), be passed and enacted.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

9. ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

9.1 AUD25001

Audit of Contract Payments to DARTS

Charles Brown, Auditor General, addressed Committee respecting Audit of Contract Payments to DARTS with the aid of a presentation.

(Hwang/Kroetsch)

- (a) That the presentation from Charles Brown, Auditor General, respecting Audit of Contract Payments to DARTS, be received; and
- (b) That Report AUD25001, respecting Audit of Contract Payments to DARTS be received and the following recommendations be approved:
 - (i) That Audit Report titled "Audit of Contract Payments to DARTS", attached as Appendix "A" to Report AUD25001, be received;
 - (ii) That the management responses, as detailed in Appendix "A" to Report AUD25001 be approved; and
 - (iii) That the General Manager of Public Works be directed to implement the management responses (contained in Appendix "A" to Report AUD25001) and report back to Audit, Finance and Administration Committee by December 31, 2025, on the

nature and status of actions taken in response to the audit report.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

10. MOTIONS

10.1 Development Charges By-Law and Complaints under Section 20 of the Development Charges Act

(M. Wilson/Kroetsch)

- (a) That staff be directed to report back to the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee with information on the following:
- (i) The number of formal Development Charges complaints received by the Clerk under Section 20 of the *Development Charges Act* in 2024 and how this compares to the number of Section 20 complaints received in 2019, 2020, 2021, 2022 and 2023;
 - (ii) How small- to medium-sized businesses/investors and residents are apprised of possible development charges for their development projects; and,
 - (iii) Any recommendations on how the City could improve information provided to the public regarding Hamilton's Development Charges By-Law.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

11. NOTICES OF MOTION

There were no Notices of Motion.

12. PRIVATE AND CONFIDENTIAL

Committee determined that discussion of Item 12.1 was not required in Closed Session; therefore, the matter was addressed in Open Session, as follows:

12.1 Closed Session Minutes – December 5, 2024

(Hwang/Beattie)

That the Closed Session minutes of the December 5, 2024 Audit, Finance and Administration Committee meeting, be adopted and remain confidential.

CARRIED

(Tadeson/Hwang)

That Darren Jones and Aron Feuer of Valencia Risk be permitted to attend the Closed Session portion of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee respecting Item 12.2, Confidential Appendix “A” to Report AUD21004(a), respecting Cyber Security Follow Up Audit - Planning Summary.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

- YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
- YES - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
- YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
- YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
- YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
- YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
- YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
- YES - CHAIR - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(Tadeson/Hwang)

That the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee move into Closed Session respecting Item 12.2, pursuant to Section 9.3, Sub-section (a) of the City's Procedural By-law 21-021, as amended, and Section 239(2), Sub-section (a) of the *Ontario Municipal Act, 2001*, as amended, as the subject matter pertains to the security of the property of the municipality or local board.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

- YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
- YES - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
- YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
- YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark

YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

The Audit, Finance and Administration Committee resolved into closed session at 11:48 a.m.

The Audit, Finance and Administration Committee meeting reconvened in Open Session at 12:30 p.m.

12.2 Confidential Appendix “A” to Report AUD21004(a), respecting Cyber Security Follow Up Audit

For disposition of this item, refer to Item 7.1.

7. ITEMS FOR INFORMATION (CONTINUED)

**7.1 AUD21004(a)
Cyber Security Follow Up Audit – Planning Summary (City Wide)**

(Clark/Kroetsch)

That staff review the content of Confidential Appendix “A” to Report AUD21004(a) and release any information that can be released to the public.

Result: Motion CARRIED by a vote of 8 to 0, as follows:

YES - Ward 1 Councillor Maureen Wilson
YES - Ward 2 Councillor Cameron Kroetsch
YES - Ward 4 Councillor Tammy Hwang
YES - Ward 9 Councillor Brad Clark
YES - Ward 10 Councillor Jeff Beattie
YES - Ward 11 Councillor Mark Tadeson
YES - Ward 13 Councillor Alex Wilson
YES - CHAIR - Ward 14 Councillor Mike Spadafora

(Hwang/Kroetsch)

- (a) That Report AUD21004(a), respecting Cyber Security Follow Up Audit – Planning Summary, be received; and
- (b) That the information in Confidential Appendix “A” to Report AUD21004(a), respecting Cyber Security Follow Up Audit – Planning Summary that is considered to be confidential following the review, remain confidential.

CARRIED

13. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee, adjourned at 12:35 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Tamara Bates
Legislative Coordinator
Office of the City Clerk

Councillor M. Spadafora,
Chair, Audit, Finance and Administration
Committee