

Comment Response Matrix

Date	Comment Type	Comment Summary	Staff Response
11/27/2025	Survey Form	<p>1. Treescapes/ mature tree protection is not addressed adequately.</p> <p>2. What happens if Council does not approve the HCD Plan?</p>	<p>1. Policy b) in Section 5.5 Landscape Features notes that widening of driveways and walkways must not impact heritage attributes such as trees and other landscape features. The final Plan includes an additional guideline 5.5(g), encouraging long-term maintenance and retention of canopy trees.</p> <p>Section 12.3 Tree preservation discusses the amendment to Tree Preservation By-law No. 4513-99 in Dundas which would require amending to include any new HCD boundaries.</p> <p>2. If Council decides to not designate the area as a new HCD, the municipality would be unable to provide long-term, legal protection to this significant cultural heritage landscape and the</p>

Date	Comment Type	Comment Summary	Staff Response
			<p>contributing properties located within the district boundary (designation provides protection against inappropriate alterations and demolition). Without district designation, there is a risk of unsympathetic change and development in the area that could erode the historic character and sense of place of the neighbourhood. Without designation, the contributing properties in the District would not be eligible for the City's financial incentives for heritage properties.</p>
11/27/2025	Survey Form	<p>The neighbourhood is a special place for residents and visitors – maintaining the character is important. Appreciates the work related to the HCD.</p>	N/A
11/27/2025	Comment Form	<p>The HCD Plan is a positive action for local cultural heritage. Thanked City staff for positive action for the community.</p>	N/A

Date	Comment Type	Comment Summary	Staff Response
12/02/2025	Online Survey	<p>1. Is a permit required for routine pruning and maintenance of trees on Contributing properties?</p> <p>2. Are there financial incentives available to assist property owners with the cost of necessary tree maintenance?</p> <p>If no such incentives currently exist, I would encourage the City to consider establishing them. Supporting regular maintenance would help ensure the long-term health of mature trees, reduce the likelihood of property damage, and align with the City's goals of preservation.</p>	<p>As a general rule, as noted on the City's website for Heritage Permits, planting and/or removal of minor vegetation does not require a Heritage Permit. However, if a tree is related to tree canopy elements along Melville Street between Sydenham Street, Albert Street and Matilda Street, which are listed as Heritage Attributes in the HCD's Statement of Significance, maintenance on these trees may require a Heritage Permit. Please check with staff to confirm.</p> <p>General maintenance of trees is not currently eligible for heritage grant or loan funding. However, if a tree is listed as a heritage attribute in the HCD or in a Part IV designation by-law, work to ensure its conservation may qualify for grant funding through the City's Heritage Revitalization Grant Program, subject to its terms and conditions.</p>

Date	Comment Type	Comment Summary	Staff Response
12/04/2025	Email	Expressed concerns about the feasibility of labelling and storing historic materials for future repairs on-site.	<p>Section 3.4 Additional Resources identifies other helpful resources in understanding the best practice for heritage conservation, such as labelling, numbering, and storing masonry to be re-used / reinstalled later. Similarly, section 5.7 Removal of Heritage Building Fabric – Guidelines notes that salvaged materials should be kept on site and documented to be used in a future alteration.</p> <p>Staff note that for many historic masonry buildings, it can be difficult to find replacement materials when making repairs, closing in openings, etc. Therefore, it is encouraged that owners store salvaged materials on site (if feasible), to assist with this future work. However, both of these sections do not contain mandatory policies in this HCD Plan.</p>

Date	Comment Type	Comment Summary	Staff Response
		<p>Did not want the plan to control fencing or other changes to yards/ landscaping and wanted to clarify what types of significant disturbances to landscape features would require an archaeological assessment.</p>	<p>The HCD Study phase of this project assessed the heritage value of the area and identified key heritage attributes that contribute to that character, including landscape features. The HCD Plan is meant to provide policies and guidelines for conserving the identified heritage attributes. Fence guidelines are not meant to require an owner to get a heritage permit to replace an existing wood fence with a similar fence in size, material, and design. Additional clarification has been added to Part III – Work Not Requiring a Heritage Permit, under Section 11.1 (i), indicating that the removal or replacement of contemporary fencing does not require a heritage permit.</p> <p>The revised Plan also clarifies that archaeological assessment work is not required as part of the regular heritage permit process for changes to a property in the District. However, an archaeological assessment may be required as part of a Committee of Adjustment application for</p>

Date	Comment Type	Comment Summary	Staff Response
		<p>Concerned about the cost of repairs within the new HCD and accessibility of grant funding.</p>	<p>a severance for lot creation under the <i>Planning Act</i> (see Section 9.5(c) of the Plan).</p> <p>The City wants to support owners who are undertaking appropriate heritage conservation and restoration work and to assist them with these costs. The City offers two heritage funding programs that we recently updated the terms of and increased the available funding amounts for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Heritage Revitalization Grant; - Heritage Revitalization Loan. <p>As an example, a single-detached home would be eligible for a matching grant of up to \$10,000 per year for eligible heritage conservation work (as per the terms of the program). There is also a \$1,500 study grant component, for when a technical or consultant study is required to support a project. For later and unexpected projects that have significant up-front costs, the loan programs</p>

Date	Comment Type	Comment Summary	Staff Response
			<p>offer a \$100,000 10-year interest free loan for eligible conservation work (as per the terms of the program).</p> <p>You can read more about these programs at investinhamilton.ca/incentives and summarized in Section 12.4 of the Plan.</p>
12/10/2025	Emailed letter (See objection letter attached as Appendix “E” of Report PED24140(b))	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The designation process was politically driven, not community-driven or initiated in reps. 2. The plan relies on subjective, unchallengeable assumptions. 	<p>Response to 1 & 2</p> <p>The new HCD stems from the City’s Built Heritage Inventory work that began with the Downtown Built Heritage Inventory pilot in 2014. The Built Heritage Inventory Strategy update in August 2020 (PED20133) noted that the evaluation of Downtown Dundas was a short-term priority in staff’s workplan. All Designation work is informed by research to determine that a building or potential district meet the appropriate number of criteria as legislated. The criteria is outlined in Ontario Regulation 9/06.</p>

Date	Comment Type	Comment Summary	Staff Response
			<p>In the spring of 2022, the City of Hamilton's Tourism and Culture Division launched an updated heritage survey of Downtown Dundas as part of the Built Heritage Inventory Strategy. Research and engagement on the Downtown Dundas Inventory were undertaken in 2022, including the preparation of a preliminary Historic Context Statement and the calling of a Downtown Dundas Heritage Focus Group.</p> <p>On September 28, 2022, the local Ward Councillor brought forward a motion, which resulted in the passing of a by-law to designate a portion of Melville Street, located in the Downtown Dundas Inventory project area, as a Heritage Conservation District Study Area and directing staff to initiate a heritage conservation district study.</p> <p>An evaluation of cultural heritage value or interest of the properties located in the proposed Melville Street Heritage Conservation District boundary</p>

Date	Comment Type	Comment Summary	Staff Response
		<p>3. The plan offers no credible evidence on property-value impacts.</p>	<p>was completed by MHBC Planning Ltd., in consultation with Cultural Heritage Planning staff, and was informed by input from the community. Two open houses were held during the Study phase, and two open houses were held during the Plan phase, as well as an online surveys, with feedback informing the final HCD Plan.</p> <p>Response to 3</p> <p>Studies have shown that designation does not negatively impact price and may be correlated with increases in property values. See Report PED20030 and the recent 2023 McMaster Study investigating this topic in the Hamilton context, Investigating the Impact of Heritage Property Designation on Real Estate Value.</p> <p>There are also previous studies which focus on designated heritage districts, in particular. You can find these through the University of Waterloo's Heritage Resources Centre, and one of their key</p>

Date	Comment Type	Comment Summary	Staff Response
		<p>4. The plan imposes onerous, unfunded, and vague compliance restrictions on private homeowners.</p>	<p>summary reports found here. These indicate that, “real estate values in Heritage Conservation Districts generally rise more consistently than surrounding areas”.</p> <p>Response to 4</p> <p>The owners of designated heritage properties are required to obtain Heritage Permits to make any changes that may impact the designated heritage features and, in the case of a heritage district, scopes of work identified in the HCD Plan requiring a permit. The municipality manages change to designated properties through the Heritage Permit process. A Heritage Permit approval outlines scopes of work and methods for undertaking the work but does not dictate or require who does the work. For example, an owner undertaking their own work on their property can do so, in accordance with any</p>

Date	Comment Type	Comment Summary	Staff Response
			<p>requirements of the Heritage Permit or Building Permit processes.</p> <p>The City also provides financial incentives for designated property owners to assist with eligible heritage conservation and maintenance work. More information on these incentives can be found at https://investinhamilton.ca/incentives. Please note that there are some eligibility requirements to use licensed contractors when receiving City funding for heritage conservation work, outlined in the program terms.</p>
12/24/2025	Email	Policies to protect windows should only apply to windows visible from the public realm and to character defining windows.	The intention is that only heritage features visible from the public realm will be subject to heritage permits. Section 12.1 of the revised Plan clarifies what activities do not require a heritage permit, including exterior works not visible from the public right-of-way. Additional clarification has been provided under Part III – Work Not Requiring a Heritage Permit, in particular Section 11.1(k).

Date	Comment Type	Comment Summary	Staff Response
		<p>Disagrees with the proposed guidelines for the location of solar panels. The installation of solar panels constitutes meaningful action to address climate change and should not be restricted.</p> <p>Restrictions on non-contributing properties are too onerous (i.e.</p>	<p>The intent of the previous draft Plan policies and guidelines was not to prevent the installation of solar panels, but to encourage them to be located in inconspicuous areas (when feasible) and that any installations visible from the public right-of-way affecting heritage attributes in the District would require a Permit to ensure any impacts are minimized (see Sections 5.2 (f) and 9.4 (a) and (b)). Further clarification has been added to the Plan, including Section 11.1(d) which indicates that the installation of solar panels located in the same plane as the roof, where installation does not damage or remove heritage fabric, does not require a heritage permit. Staff also note that City's Climate Change Office was consulted in the preparation of this Plan.</p> <p>The revised Plan includes additional exemptions for hard landscaping under Section 11.1(h). In</p>

Date	Comment Type	Comment Summary	Staff Response
		<p>widening driveways/ walkways, replacing vinyl siding and windows) and should be adjusted to capture major modifications that would impact the character of the HCD.</p> <p>Plan needs to be clearer about which alterations require a Heritage Permit. Helpful to include a table similar to Kitchener Civic Centre Neighbourhood HCD Plan.</p>	<p>addition to the already exempted replacement in kind of hard landscaping, driveways may be also widened by 10% and walkways by 30% without a heritage permit if the change also complies with the City's Zoning By-laws.</p> <p>Revisions have been made to the Plan under Part III – Work Not Requiring a Heritage Permit, clarifying that the replacement in kind of non-historic material such as vinyl siding and windows do not require a heritage permit (see Section 11.1(p) and (k) respectively.</p> <p>This was a very helpful suggestion. The Plan has been updated to include a summary table to clarify the work that will require a heritage permit, which is included as Appendix D of the Plan.</p>