



Hamilton

MINUTES 12-001 HAMILTON MUNICIPAL HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Thursday, January 19, 2012

12:00 p.m., Room 264

Hamilton City Hall

Present: A. Denham-Robinson (Chair)
M. Kirk, (Co-Vice Chair)
Councillors McHattie, Pearson, Ferguson
M. Adkins, W. Arndt, W. Furlan, C. Lei, W. Rosart, R. Sinclair,
P. Wilson

Absent: K. Wakeman (Co-Vice Chair)
S. Nowak

Also Present: M. Sergi, Manager, Community Planning and Design
M. House, Cultural Heritage Planner
J. Muller, Cultural Heritage Planner
A. Mikkila, Assistant Cultural Heritage Planner
A. Golden, Heritage Planning Technician
C. Newman, Legislative Assistant, City Clerk's Office

A Election of one Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee to sit on the Joint Plaquing Sub-Committee for the term of Council spanning from 2011 to 2014.

(Adkins/Sinclair)

That Christine Lei be elected as the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee representative on the Joint Plaquing Sub-Committee for the term of Council spanning 2011 to 2014

CARRIED

1. CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)

4. ADDED DELEGATION REQUEST

4.1 Delegation Request from Mr. Claire Sellens respecting Heritage Permit Application HP2011-058 for the Demolition of a Detached Garage, Construction of a New Detached Three Bay Garage and Workshop, and Construction of Additions to the Existing House at

31 Cross Street, Dundas

9. ADDED GENERAL INFORMATION

9.7 Joint Plaquing Sub-Committee Minutes – January 10, 2011

(Adkins/Rosart)

That the agenda be approved, as amended.

CARRIED

2. **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)**

None

3. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item 3)**

(i) **December 15, 2011 (Item 3.1)**

(Kirk/Adkins)

That the Minutes of the December 15, 2011 meeting of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee, be approved.

CARRIED

4. **DELEGATION REQUESTS/DELEGATIONS/PRESENTATIONS (Item 4)**

4.1 **Delegation Request from Mr. Claire Sellens respecting Heritage Permit Application HP2011-058 for the Demolition of a Detached Garage, Construction of a New Detached Three Bay Garage and Workshop, and Construction of Additions to the Existing House at 31 Cross Street, Dundas**

(Adkins/Sinclair)

That the delegation request by Mr. Claire Sellens respecting Heritage Permit Application HP2011-058 for the Demolition of a Detached Garage, Construction of a New Detached Three Bay Garage and Workshop, and Construction of Additions to the Existing House at 31 Cross Street, be approved and he be permitted to speak at today's meeting as item 5.1.2

CARRIED

5. **HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATIONS (Item 5)**

(a) **Delegated Approvals:**

(i) **Heritage Permit Application (Paving of shared driveway) 35 Cross Street, Dundas, Cross-Melville Heritage Conservation District (Ward 13) (Item 5.1.1)**

- (ii) **Heritage Permit Application (Installation of a fence, deck, trellis and landscaping) 40 Cross Street, 1 Melville Street, and 5 Melville Street (Dundas) Cross-Melville Heritage Conservation District (Ward 13) (Item 5.1.2)**
- (iii) **Heritage Permit Application (Restoration of Windows) 900 Woodward Avenue (Hamilton) Hamilton Museum of Steam and Technology – 1913 Pumping Station By-law No. 86-310 (Ward 4) (Item 5.1.3)**
- (iv) **Heritage Permit Application (Curatorial Building Gas Pipe Removal) 600 York Boulevard (Hamilton) Dundurn Castle (Ward 1) (Item 5.1.4)**

(Adkins/Kirk)

That the delegated approval letters 5.1.1 through 5.1.4 be received. **CARRIED**

- (b) **Heritage Permit Application HP2011-058, Under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act, for Demolition of a Detached Garage, Construction of a New Detached Three Bay Garage and Workshop, and Construction of Additions to the Existing House at 31 Cross Street (Dundas) (Ward 13) (Item 5.2)**

M. House addressed the Committee respecting the Heritage Permit Application HP2011-058, Under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act, for Demolition of a Detached Garage, Construction of a New Detached Three Bay Garage and Workshop, and Construction of Additions to the Existing House at 31 Cross Street. Her comments included but were not limited to the following:

Ms. House indicated that the property is located in the Cross-Melville Heritage Conservation District. Staff gave a description of the property in its current state, and described the proposed work that the owner has applied for Heritage Permit approval to undertake. It was noted that the Heritage Permit Review Sub-Committee recommended that specific components of the proposal should be amended to conserve the heritage features of the property and the District.

(Adkins/Kirk)

That the presentation respecting Heritage Permit Application HP2011-058, Under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act, for Demolition of a Detached Garage, Construction of a New Detached Three Bay Garage and Workshop, and Construction of Additions to the Existing House at 31 Cross Street, be received. **CARRIED**

- (i) **Delegation Request from Mr. Claire Sellens respecting Heritage Permit Application HP2011-058 for the Demolition of a Detached Garage, Construction of a New Detached Three Bay Garage and Workshop, and Construction of Additions to the Existing House at 31 Cross Street (Added Item 5.2.1)**

Mr. Sellens addressed the Committee respecting his property at 31 Cross Street. His comments included but were not limited to the following:

Mr. Sellens gave an overview of the proposed plans for his property and further explanation of his intentions for the property. In his delegation he addressed the concerns of the Permit Review Sub-Committee's concerns respecting his pending renovation.

(Adkins/Rosart)

That the delegation by Mr. Claire Sellens respecting Heritage Permit Application HP2011-058 for the Demolition of a Detached Garage, Construction of a New Detached Three Bay Garage and Workshop, and Construction of Additions to the Existing House at 31 Cross Street, be received. **CARRIED**

(Adkins/Arndt)

That recommendation (m) be added to HP2011-058, and read as follows:

- (m) That the corridor addition between the new porch and rear addition shall be glazed and revised elevation drawings showing this change shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of Planning staff, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit. **Amendment CARRIED**

Councillor Pearson, P. Wilson and M. Kirk were opposed to the preceding amendment.

(Arndt/Adkins)

That the City of Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee advises Council:

That Heritage Permit Application HP2011-058 be approved for demolition of a detached garage, construction of a new detached, three bay garage and workshop, and construction of additions to the existing house at 31 Cross Street (Cross-Melville Heritage Conservation District) (Dundas), subject to the following conditions:

- (a) That a tree inventory and protection plan shall be submitted for all the trees within the area of construction impact, to the satisfaction and approval of Planning staff, prior to any grading or tree removals.
- (b) That the existing mature tree in the south side yard shall be protected from temporary or permanent construction impacts, as per the submitted tree protection plan, prior to any grading and for the duration of construction, to the satisfaction and approval of Planning staff.
- (c) That the final details regarding the attachment of the proposed new additions, side porch and porte cochère to the existing stone walls shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of Planning staff, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit.
- (d) That specifications, samples, and/or brochures for the proposed stone foundation and stucco cladding on the proposed additions shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of Planning staff, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit.
- (e) That the final dimensions, design, and materials for all new doors, windows, and garage doors shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of Planning staff, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit.
- (f) That the dimensions and materials for all new fascia, roof flashings, columns, railings, and other exterior structures shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of Planning staff, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit.
- (g) That the repair methods, materials specifications, and mortar composition shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of Planning staff, prior to any masonry repairs or repointing of the existing stone building walls or the stone wall along the front of the property.
- (h) That the new asphalt surface and paving stones shall be within the limits of the existing gravel driveway, and that no existing shrubs or trees shall be removed or adversely impacted by the resurfacing.
- (i) That the paving materials for the proposed terrace and detailed elevations and/or plans for any outdoor fireplace, walls, railings, or other fixtures/structures shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of Planning staff, prior to installation.

- (j) That the elevation drawings depicting the proposed garage roof(s) shall be revised, to the satisfaction and approval of Planning staff and the Heritage Permit Review Sub-committee, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit.
- (k) That any minor changes to the plans and elevations following Heritage Permit approval shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of Planning staff, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit.
- (l) That construction and site alterations, in accordance with this approval, shall be completed no later than January 31, 2014. If the alterations are not completed by January 31, 2014, then this approval expires as of that date, and no alterations shall be undertaken without a new approval issued by the City of Hamilton.
- (m) That the corridor addition between the new porch and rear addition shall be glazed and revised elevation drawings showing this change shall be submitted, to the satisfaction and approval of Planning staff, prior to submission as part of any application for a Building Permit. **Motion as Amended CARRIED**

6. HERITAGE PROPERTY DESIGNATIONS (Item 6)

None

7. DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 7)

(i) Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Heritage Recognition Awards (Item 7.1)

Staff indicated that at the last HMHC meeting, the Pearl Company was put forward for a Heritage Property Conservation Award, but unfortunately the property is currently in litigation respecting a zoning issue. The Committee discussed the granting of an award to a location that is possibly not complying with City By-laws.

(Adkins/Arndt)

That the nomination of The Pearl Company, 16 Steven Street, Hamilton, Ontario be deferred to the 2013 Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Heritage Recognition Awards deliberations. **CARRIED**

P. Wilson was opposed to the preceding motion.

(ii) Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Year End Report (Item 7.2)

Chair Denham-Robinson distributed draft copies of the Committee's year end report. Committee members commented on the report and suggested potential changes.

(Adkins/Lei)

That the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Year End Report for 2011 be approved in principal. **CARRIED**

(iii) Draft Nomination of the Lister Block to the Canadian Register of Historic Places (Item 7.3)

(McHattie/Kirk)

(a) That the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee supports the nomination of the Lister Block to the Canadian Register of Historic Places;

(b) That staff be requested to update the nomination papers as required and submit them to the Council for approval. **CARRIED**

Councillor McHattie recalled that a previous HMHC Committee discussed the same initiative with respect to City Hall.

(McHattie/Pearson)

That staff be requested to commence work on nominating Hamilton City Hall (71 Main Street East, Hamilton) to the Canadian Register of Historic Places. **CARRIED**

(iv) Beach Canal Lighthouse (Item 7.4)

The Committee discussed the Beach Canal Lighthouse and expressed an interest in supporting the Beach Canal Lighthouse Group in their efforts to save the lighthouse.

(Adkins/Wilson)

That the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee write a letter of support to the Beach Canal Lighthouse Group in their efforts to take over the Beach Canal Lighthouse. **CARRIED**

8. Buildings and Landscapes (Item 8)

(a) Endangered Buildings and Landscapes:

(i) Auchmar Gate House, 71 Claremont Drive, Hamilton (L)(R) – M. Adkins

Mr. Wilson indicated that he drove past the property and it was in poor condition. Mr. Wilson indicated an interest opening up lines of communication with the owner of the property. Staff indicated that they could pass Mr. Wilson's information on to the owner.

(ii) St. Marks, 120 Bay Street South, Hamilton (D) – M. Kirk

No update

(iii) Tivoli, 108 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – B. McHattie

No update

(iv) Book House, 167 Book Road East, Ancaster (L) – W. Arndt

No update

(v) The Royal Connaught Hotel, 112 King Street East, Hamilton (L) – M. Adkins

Mr. Adkins indicated an interest in organizing a tour of the building.

(vi) Andrew Sloss House, 372 Butter Road West, Ancaster (D) – W. Rosart

No update

(vii) (Thomas Building) – 46 – 52 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – R. Sinclair

The disassembled building materials are still in storage.

(viii) All Saints Church, 15 Queen Street South, Hamilton (L) – A. Denham-Robinson

Staff indicated that the OMB issued decision in favour of applicant and variances were permitted.

(ix) Grove Hall, Gateview, Century Manor and surrounding landscape, 100 West 5th Street, Hamilton (L)(R)(D) – C. Lei

No update

(x) Erland Lee Home and Museum, 552 Ridge Road, Stoney Creek

– K. Wakeman

Councillor Pearson and Councillor Johnson had been made aware of a new membership on the FWIO board, and there has been renewed support for the museum. The intent of the board is to have the museum open this spring.

(xi) Federal Building, 150 Main Street West (L) – M. Adkins

The property has been cleaned up and the sculptures remain covered.

(b) Buildings and Landscapes of Interest:

(i) Desjardins Canal, Dundas, Hamilton (R) – S. Nowak

No update

(ii) Hamilton-Wentworth District School Board Building, 100 Main Street West, Hamilton – P. Wilson

McMaster University and the School Board are negotiating who will contract a heritage consultant. Mr. Wilson suggested that the building may be a good candidate for the Door's Open event.

(iii) Stinson School, Hamilton, 200 Stinson Street, Hamilton – M. Adkins

HMHC members toured the building and were very impressed with the work being done.

(iv) Auchmar, 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton (D) – C. Lei

Ms. Lei stated that she has seen a white van on site and was wondering what was happening on the property.

(c) Heritage Properties Update:

(i) Lister Building, 28-44 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – B. McHattie

No update

(ii) Treble Hall, 6-12 John Street North, Hamilton (L) – M. Adkins

New windows are going to be installed, and the owner would like to organize another tour once the work is complete.

9. GENERAL INFORMATION (Item 9)

- (a) 2012 Volunteer Service Awards (VSA) – Ministry of Citizenship and Immigration (Item 9.1)**

(Adkins/Rosart)

That the correspondence respecting the 2012 Volunteer Service Awards (VSA) – Ministry of Citizenship and Immigration, be received. **CARRIED**

- (b) Ontario Medal for Young Volunteers - Ministry of Citizenship and Immigration (Item 9.2)**

(Adkins/Rosart)

That the correspondence respecting the Ontario Medal for Young Volunteers - Ministry of Citizenship and Immigration, be received.

CARRIED

- (c) Copley Building – 56 York Boulevard, Hamilton (Item 9.3)**

Staff indicated that the buildings designation began in the late 1970's but the designation was not completed nor approved by Council. Staff indicated that the will continue to research this item.

(Furlan/Adkins)

That the update respecting the Copley Building – 56 York Boulevard, Hamilton, be received. **CARRIED**

- (d) Erland Lee Museum - 2-year calendar (Item 9.4)**

(Sinclair/Adkins)

That the update respecting the Erland Lee Museum, be received.

CARRIED

- (e) Doors Open Hamilton – Application process (Item 9.5)**

(Adkins/Wilson)

That the update respecting Doors Open Hamilton – Application process, be received. **CARRIED**

- (f) Heritage Permit Applications (Item 9.6)**

(Adkins/Lei)

That the update respecting Heritage Permit Applications for 2011, be received. **CARRIED**

(g) Joint Plaquing Sub-Committee Minutes – January 10, 2011 (Added Item 9.7)

(Wilson/Furlan)

That the Joint Plaquing Sub-Committee Minutes – January 10, 2011, be received. **CARRIED**

10. NEW BUSINESS

10.1 Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Heritage Recognition Awards

(Adkins/Sinclair)

That a budget of no more than \$300 excluding GST/PST/HST be approved for this event and that the funds be allocated from the appropriate Planning and Economic Development Department Account.

CARRIED

11. ADJOURNMENT (Item 10)

(Adkins/Furlan)

That the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee, be adjourned at 2:30 p.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully submitted,

Alissa Denham-Robinson, Chair
Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee

Christopher Newman
Legislative Assistant,
City Clerk's Office
January 19, 2012