



AUDIT, FINANCE AND ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE MINUTES

Wednesday, June 22, 2011

9:30 a.m.

Council Chambers

City Hall

71 Main Street West

Hamilton, Ontario

Present: Councillors B. Clark (Chair), B. Johnson (Vice Chair), M. Pearson, R. Powers and B. Morelli

Also Present: Councillors, L. Ferguson, T. Whitehead
R. Rossini, General Manager, Finance & Corporate Services
T. Tollis, City Treasurer
R. Caterini, Clerk
P. Barkwell, City Solicitor
A. Zuidema, Director, Corporate Initiatives
A. Pekaruk, Director, Audit Services
R. Male, Director of Financial Services
G. Moore, Director of Engineering Services, Public Works
A. Grozelle, Legislative Assistant, Office of the City Clerk

THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REPORTED TO COUNCIL FOR CONSIDERATION:

- 1. Treasurer's Apportionment of Land Taxes for Property in Flamborough (FCS11001(c)) (Ward 15) (Item 5.1)**

(Powers/Pearson)

That the 2011 property taxes in the amount of \$5,432 for 46-48 Mill St. S., Flamborough, (Roll #2518 303 310 59400 0000) be apportioned and split amongst the two newly created parcels as set out in Appendix A to report FCS11001(c).

CARRIED

2. Follow Up of Audit Report 2009-08 - Cemeteries - Administrative Office (AUD11023) (City Wide) (Item 5.2)

(Powers/Pearson)

That Report AUD11023 respecting the follow up of Audit Report 2009-08, Cemeteries Administrative Office, be received.

CARRIED

3. Follow Up of Audit 2008-11 - Wage Payroll and Timekeeping (AUD11019) (City Wide) (Item 5.3)

(Powers/Pearson)

That Report AUD11019 respecting the follow up of Audit Report 2008-11, Wage Payroll and Timekeeping, be received.

CARRIED

4. Evaluation of City of Hamilton Accounts Payable Program (FCS11051) (City Wide) (Item 5.4)

(Powers/Pearson)

That Report FCS11051 respecting the Evaluation of the City of Hamilton Accounts Payable Program be received.

CARRIED

5. Professional and Consultant Services Roster 2007-2008 / 2009-2010 (PW11038) (City Wide) (Item 5.5)

(Pearson/Morelli)

That Report PW11038, respecting the Professional and Consultant Services Roster for 2007-2008 and 2009-2010, be received.

CARRIED

6. Annual Follow Up of Outstanding Audit Report Recommendations (CM11012) (City Wide) (Item 5.6)

(Pearson/Morelli)

(a) That Report CM11012, respecting the Annual Follow-Up of Outstanding Audit Report Recommendations, be received.

CARRIED

(Pearson/Pearson)

(b) That, staff be directed to report back to the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee with a matrix respecting the Outstanding Audit Report Recommendations, to include all deficiencies, reasons behind non-compliance and timelines until compliance.

CARRIED

7. Monthly Status Report of Tenders and Requests for Proposals for April 9, 2011 to May 27, 2011 (FCS11004(c)) (City Wide) (Item 5.7)

(Johnson/Pearson)

That Report FCS11004(c), respecting the Monthly Status Report of Tenders and Requests for Proposals for April 9, 2011 to May 27, 2011, be received.

CARRIED

8. Governance Review Sub-Committee Minutes, March 8, 2011 (Item 5.8)

(Johnson/Pearson)

That the Minutes for the Governance Review Sub-Committee meeting of March 8, 2011, be received.

CARRIED

9. Governance Review Sub-Committee Minutes, March 22, 2011 (Item 5.9)

(Johnson/Pearson)

That the Minutes for the Governance Review Sub-Committee meeting of March 22, 2011, be received.

CARRIED

10. Committee Against Racism Minutes, May 24, 2011 (Item 5.10)

(Johnson/Pearson)

That the Minutes for the Committee Against Racism meeting of May 24, 2011, be received.

CARRIED

11. Audit Report 2011-03 - Sole and Single Source Procurement (AUD11024) (City Wide) (Item 8.1)

(Pearson/Johnson)

(a) That Report AUD11024 respecting Audit Report 2011-03, Sole and Single Source Procurement, be received;

(b) That the Management Action Plans as detailed in Appendix "A" of Report AUD11024 be approved; and,

(c) That the General Managers of Corporate Services and Public Works be directed to instruct the appropriate staff to have the Management Action Plans (attached as Appendix "A" to Report AUD11024) implemented.

CARRIED

12. Audit Report 2010-13 - Domiciliary Hostels (AUD11017) (City Wide) (Item 8.2)

(Pearson/Johnson)

- (a) That Report AUD11017 respecting Audit Report 2010-13, Domiciliary Hostels, be received;
- (b) That the Management Action Plans as detailed in Appendix "A" of Report AUD11017 be approved; and,
- (c) That the General Manager of Community Services be directed to instruct the appropriate staff to have the Management Action Plans (attached as Appendix "A" to Report AUD11017) implemented.

CARRIED

13. Rotary Clubs' of Ancaster – Pledge Agreement Cessation (FCS11057) (Ward 12) (Item 8.3)

(Powers/Johnson)

- (a) That the remaining commitment of \$168,000 of the total pledge of \$500,000 by the Rotary Club of Ancaster A.M. (Rotary A.M.) and Rotary Club of Ancaster P.M. (Rotary P.M.) towards the Construction of the Ancaster Community Centre-Phase II and confirmed through an Agreement between the former Town of Ancaster and the Rotary Clubs dated January 17, 2000, be re-directed towards other projects that benefit the Ancaster Community;
- (b) That the Community Centre Phase II Agreement between the Corporation of the City of Hamilton (originally with the Town of Ancaster) and the Rotary A.M. and the Rotary P.M. dated January 17, 2000, be deemed fulfilled and completed;
- (c) That any financial impact resulting from the forgiveness of the pledge be funded from reserve 108030 - Ancaster Reserve.

CARRIED

14. City of Hamilton/The Regional Municipality of Halton Supply of Water Agreement (FCS11035) (City Wide) (Item 8.4)

(Johnson/Pearson)

- (a) That the agreement between The Regional Municipality of Halton ("Halton") and the City of Hamilton ("Hamilton"), for the continued supply of potable water to the City of Burlington ("Burlington"), be approved on the following terms and conditions:
 - (i) for a period of 10 years, from the date of execution of the agreement, with a potential renewal of 10 years upon the same terms and conditions;

- (ii) at a rate of 1.5 times the water rate otherwise imposed by the City of Hamilton, from time to time, during the term of the agreement;
 - (iii) of a volume not to exceed 1,000,000 litres per day and a flow rate of not greater than 5,500 litres/minute; and,
 - (iv) for the three existing water supplies plus future water supplies where requested by Halton and agreed to by Hamilton in accordance with criteria set out in the agreement.
- (b) That the Mayor and City Clerk be authorized and directed to execute, on behalf of the City of Hamilton, all necessary documentation to implement subsection (a), all with content acceptable to the General Manager of Finance and Corporate Services and General Manager of Public Works, and in a form satisfactory to the City Solicitor.

CARRIED

15. 2010 Ward 11 Budget Deficit (FCS11052) (City Wide) (Item 8.5)

(Powers/Pearson)

- (a) That report FCS11052 respecting the 2010 Ward 11 Budget Deficit be received.
- (b) That staff be directed to fund \$1674 out of the Legislative budget towards the 2010 Ward 11 Budget Deficit and pay \$1645 to Mr. David Mitchell out of the Legislative budget in consideration of his remaining portion of mileage expenses.

CARRIED

16. Request for Balance of Deductible (RMS 009585) (FCS11060) (City Wide) (Added Item 12.1)

(Pearson/Powers)

- (a) That the request of Frank Cowan Company for reimbursement of the balance of the City of Hamilton's deductible in the amount of \$320,159.66 be approved;
- (b) That if approved, the aforementioned sum shall be paid by the City of Hamilton (from account number 23007-000100-Claims Reserve) to the Frank Cowan Company.
- (c) That Report FCS11060 not be released as a public document as the information relates to litigation.

CARRIED

FOR THE INFORMATION OF COMMITTEE:

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)

There Clerk advised of the following changes to the Agenda

- (i) Added as Item 4.1 – Delegation Request from Donna Lee Macdonald, Hamilton Artists Inc., requesting waiver of \$1,489 charged by the City for real estate assessment of 161 James Street North. (referred by Council, June 15, 2011)
- (ii) Added as Item 8.6 - Council referral, Sub-Sections (b)(i) and (c)(iv) of Item 7 of the Audit, Finance and Administration Report 11-008, respecting Grants Sub-Committee Report 11-003.
- (iii) Added as Item 12.1 - Request for Balance of Deductible (RMS 009585) (FCS11060) (City Wide)
- (iv) Added as Item 4.2 – Delegation Request by David Mitchell respecting agenda Item 8.5, Report FCS 11052, 2010 Ward 11 Budget Deficit.

(Johnson/Pearson)

That the agenda for the June 22, 2011 meeting of the Audit, Finance & Administration Committee be approved, as amended.

CARRIED

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)

There were no declarations of interest.

(c) APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS (Item 3)

(i) June 8, 2011 (Item 3.1)

(Morelli/Powers)

That the Minutes of the June 8, 2011 meeting of the Audit, Finance & Administration Committee be approved, as presented.

CARRIED

(d) DELEGATION REQUEST (4.1)

- (i) **Delegation Request from Donna Lee Macdonald, Hamilton Artists Inc., requesting waiver of \$14,89 charged by the City for real estate assessment of 161 James Street North. (referred by Council, June 15, 2011)(Added Item 4.1)**

(Pearson/Johnson)

That the Request from Donna Lee Macdonald, Hamilton Artists Inc., requesting waiver of \$1,489 charged by the City for real estate assessment of 161 James Street North, be approved.

CARRIED

(ii) Delegation Request from David Mitchell respecting agenda Item 8.5, Report FCS 11052, 2010 Ward 11 Budget Deficit (Added Item 4.2)

(Pearson/Johnson)

(a) That the Request from David Mitchell respecting agenda Item 8.5, Report FCS 11052, 2010 Ward 11 Budget Deficit, be approved.

(b) That the rules of order be waived to allow the delegation from David Mitchell respecting, agenda Item 8.5, 2010 Ward 11 Budget Deficit, to be heard today.

CARRIED

(e) PUBLIC HEARINGS/DELEGATIONS (Item 6)

(i) Luigi Cino, Cino Auto Repair Inc. respecting Concerns regarding Tenders C12-1109 - for the Provision of Various Car and Light Duty Truck Auto Service for Central Fleet and Transit Services; and, C90509 - For Provision of Vehicle Maintenance and Repair Service for Hamilton Police Service Vehicles (Item 6.1)

Mr. Cino addressed Committee, respecting his concerns regarding Tenders C12-1109 - for the Provision of Various Car and Light Duty Truck Auto Service for Central Fleet and Transit Services; and, C90509 - For Provision of Vehicle Maintenance and Repair Service for Hamilton Police Service Vehicles. Mr. Cino's comments included, but were not limited to, the following:

- Discussed that his only concern with the Hamilton Police Service Vehicle tender relates to the extra cost required to meet the increased insurance demands of the tender.
- Mr. Cino indicated that insurance has cost him around an extra \$900 because his contract was not continued past the one year term
- Discussed that the City car and light fleet tender, indicating Cino Auto Repair Inc. was the lowest bid in several districts for this contract
- Indicated the tender was for issued for one year there were provisions to extend it to two and three years and this is what he expected the City of Hamilton would do
- Discussed a meeting he had with City staff and eight vendors that prequalified for the tender

- Indicated that while the meeting was set up to suggest improvements to the tender he felt ambushed and was not pleased
- Indicated that he hadn't received complaints about his service
- Indicated he should have been given a chance to continue with the tender even if he would no longer be providing parts

Committee members asked several questions of Mr. Cino. Highlights included but were not limited to the following:

- Councillor Pearson asked past work for the City of Hamilton stretching back to prior to amalgamation in Stoney Creek
- Mr. Cino indicated that he had a long history of doing work for the City and has been servicing the vehicles before and ever since amalgamation
- Councillor Johnson asked what reason Mr. Cino was given for his contract not be continued
- Mr. Cino indicated that he was told off the record that Council was taking a hard line on tenders
- Councillor Johnson asked about Mr. Cino's meeting with staff and the other qualified bidders
- Mr. Cino indicated that he was invited in by staff to discuss ways to improve the tender process however that is not what he felt occurred indicating he felt ambushed
- Councillor Johnson asked if Mr. Cino had received any correspondence indicating the quality of his work was not acceptable
- Mr. Cino indicated that he hasn't received complaints about his service but has received compliments
- Chair Clark asked about Mr. Cino's written submission that suggested a tender should not be considered in other districts where they do not have a garage
- Mr. Cino clarified that this was a suggestion made by the other pre-approved vendors at the meeting held by City staff

Committee members asked several questions of staff. Highlights included but were not limited to the following:

- Councillor Pearson asked if there wasn't a more comprehensive way than sending out a tender request to prevent changes after the tender goes out
- Staff responded that there were actually 13 changes to this tender after it was released

- Staff indicated that in tenders the majority of changes are made because of suggestions or comments received by the vendors which are then sent through staff for consideration
- Staff suggested that the specifications in the tender need to be as accurate as possible to start with in order to address this

- Councillor Pearson asked how many vendors applied for this tender
- Staff indicated that 30 vendors applied and 20 prequalified

- Councillor Pearson asked about the policy for posting tenders online for public viewing
- Staff indicated that it is the policy to post the tenders after awarded for public viewing and is following with Council direction and standard provincial practices

- Councillor Pearson asked about the insurance cost related to the Police service tender
- Staff indicated that the practice is to tentatively award the tender and at that time request the insurance documentation
- Staff indicated that at that time the proponent can arrange and provide the insurance
- Staff indicated that Police are working with Mr. Cino to address his specific issue

- Councillor Johnson asked about why the contract wasn't continued for three years
- Staff indicated that the removal of parts from the tender was a material change that requires the City to issue another tender

- Councillor Johnson asked about complaints about the service provided by Mr. Cino
- Staff indicated that there was a delegation to the Committee earlier this by De Feo Auto which raised the question that the City was paying too much for auto repairs. This led to a decision to review the contract and the decision and exercise the City's option to not extend the term.

- Chair Clark indicated that the Committee had requested a review of the tender process and asked for clarification when it came forward
- Staff indicated that an information report came forward to the Audit Finance and Administration Committee on this matter on June 8, 2011.
- Staff indicated that the tender is being reissued for the Light Duty Truck Auto Service because savings has been shown with the Heavy Duty tender where they provide the parts rather than the vendor

- Chair Clark asked if there was anything involved in the contract limiting the areas where a vendor can provide services based on the location of garages
- Staff indicated that there is not however there is a less need for air quality testing and this would mean that less garages are needed
- Councillor Whitehead asked what the storage costs for the automotive parts would be.
- Staff indicated that they have not yet fully examined this aspect however they are going to be preparing a report on this to bring forward to Committee.

(Pearson/Johnson)

That presentation, from Luigi Cino, Cino Auto Repair Inc., respecting Concerns regarding Tenders C12-1109 - for the Provision of Various Car and Light Duty Truck Auto Service for Central Fleet and Transit Services; and, C90509 - For Provision of Vehicle Maintenance and Repair Service for Hamilton Police Service Vehicles, be received.

CARRIED

(ii) David Sa, Saco Insurance & Real Estate, respecting Abnormal Water Consumption at 600 Main Street East, Hamilton (Item 6.2)

Mr. Sa, of Saco Insurance & Real Estate, addressed Committee, respecting Abnormal Water Consumption at 600 Main Street East, Hamilton. Mr. Sa's comments included, but were not limited to, the following:

- Discussed the issue of water consumption
- Indicated that he had a water a water issue at his residence and which caused his water bill to spike
- Discussed how he was unaware of the spike until he was billed
- Indicated that he would like to have been informed of his options to address this issue sooner

Committee members asked several questions of Mr. Sa. Highlights included but were not limited to the following:

- Councillor Pearson asked Mr, Sa to clarify that it wasn't the water meter that caused the problem
- Mr. Sa indicated the meter was working properly
- Mr. Sas indicated that he was unaware until he received bills that were in vast excess of the normal amounts he was charged
- Councillor Pearson asked if Mr. Sa if he had called a plumber
- Mr. Sa indicated that he had two plumbers inspect the problem and they were unable to identify what was wrong

Committee members asked several questions of Mr. Sa. Highlights included but were not limited to the following:

- Councillor Morelli asked staff if they had notified Mr. Sa or assisted him in addressing the problem
- Staff indicated that they have a process of sending out a letter to advise residents when they see a spike in water consumption
- Staff indicated that this letter was sent to Mr. Sa and the water consumption
- Staff discussed how Mr. Sa's water rates spiked only for one month so there was no indication that there was a need for follow-up on this letter
- Staff indicated that seven months after the month of the increase in water usage Mr. Sa requested rebate for water consumption which is past the 120 days for applying for a rebate mention several times in the letter sent to him

- Chair Clark requested that staff provide the brochure and information sent to resident about this rebate program to Councillors

(Pearson/Morelli)

The presentation, from Mr. Sa, of Saco Insurance & Real Estate, addressed Committee, respecting Abnormal Water Consumption at 600 Main Street East, Hamilton, be received.

CARRIED

(iii) Delegation by David Mitchell respecting Item 8.5 on the agenda, Report FCS11052, 2010 Ward 11 Budget Deficit (FCS11052) (Added Item 6.3)

David Mitchell addressed the Committee. Highlights included but were not limited to the following:

- Discussed the past history of the policy on Councillor expenses
- Indicated that in the past he averaged between \$4,000-\$5,000 for mileage that he submitted at the end of the year, not monthly
- Discussed how the current policy was introduced because at one time Councillors were part time and occasionally held other jobs
- Indicated that he feels that the policy should be addressed and reviewed
- Indicated that if he billed the City monthly he probably would have received half of the amount of his personal expenses
- Discussed how the Ward 11 office had always hired a summer student at \$12 an hour however in the summer of 2010 the rate of pay for that position increased

- Asked the Committee to cover off his direct expenses from 2010 that were over budget
- Indicated that he felt if it he held a union position these expenses would be covered
- Indicated that he would even be pleased with even half of the money being paid back

Committee members asked the several questions of Mr. Mitchell. Highlights included but were not limited to the following:

- Chair Clark asked when Mr. Mitchell submitted his expense request
- Mr. Mitchell indicated that he thought it was sent in by his Administrative Assistant sometime around the end of December
- Chair Clark asked about the approval of the Ward budget
- Mr. Mitchell indicated that since he was not returning as a Councillor he could not return to request an increase to cover the difference during the budget process
- Chair Clark asked why Mr. Mitchell didn't submit a request to the previous Council
- Mr. Mitchell indicated that he didn't expect to loose the election
- Chair Clark asked if he thought he should have requested reimbursement prior to vacating office
- Mr. Mitchell indicated that there is a 60 to 90 day delay between the submission of expenses and reimbursement
- Councillor Powers indicated that this issue of Councillor Office budgets is before the Governance Review Sub-committee, he indicated that the accounting is improving in this respect and one issue still to be addressed is that Councillors don't have a final budget until the City of Hamilton budget process is finalized.

Committee members asked several questions of staff. Highlights included but were not limited to the following:

- Councillor Powers asked if the mileage claims submitted by the former Councillor were valid
- Staff indicated that they are valid however and would be paid if there were still funds available in the Ward 11 budget.
- Councillor Whitehead asked if there was a change to the amount of salary required for summer students
- Staff indicated that there was a change in the middle of the year when the job was reclassified and the result was an increased pressure of Councillors budgets

- Councillor Whitehead asked how Councillors should deal with variances requiring more funds
- Staff indicated that Councillors can come to committee and request more money in circumstances.
- Staff indicated that the downtown wards and ward eight budgets have had their budgets increased because of the issues those wards address, however aside from that there hasn't been much change in Councillors budgets.

- Councillor Morelli asked if in the past if there has ever been any non-returning Councillor who went over budget
- Staff indicated that they are not aware of any departing or remaining Councillor requesting reimbursement for being over budget

- Councillor Morelli asked what would happened if the money was reimbursed
- Staff indicated that the money would be paid out of the common legislative budget

- Chair Clark asked for details related to the Ward 11 budget
- Staff indicated that the total budget for Ward 11 in 2011 is \$181,741 which includes the councillors salary

- Chair Clark asked for specifics on what the bills were paid for
- Staff indicated that they did not have the detailed list of expenses however all the bills were verified and would have been paid if there was enough money in the budget

- Chair Clark asked for more details about the end of the year reconciliation of billing from Councillors offices
- Staff indicated that Councillors often hold onto bills and they often reconcile expenses at the end of the year.
- Staff also indicated that Councillors sometimes do not submit bills if they are in excess of their budget

- Chair Clark commented that he knows there are Councillors who have exceeded their budgets and they don't submit bills in excess of this, other Councillors try to work frugally within this budget

- Chair Clark commented that approval of this could result in more councillors coming forward with requests that exceed their budget.

- Chair Clark suggested that there should be review of the policy as well as an examination of legal costs that Councillors have to cover themselves

- Councillor Pearson asked if the Mr. Mitchell was re-elected would these claims have been reimbursed
- Staff indicated that all of the expenses were legitimate expenses; however the process would have been the same regardless of re-election
- Staff indicated that the budget was prorated for an eleven month period because the final month of funding went to the new Ward 11 Councillor

- Chair Clark asked what happened at the end of November whereas Mr. Mitchell had a positive amount of \$4,300 during at start of the month however was forecasted a deficit of negative \$5,000 at the end of the month
- Staff indicated that essential what happened was in the last couple weeks of November the Ward 11 Office submitted around \$9,000 in expenses.

- Councillor Whitehead asked about the common Legislative budget
- Staff indicated that there was an overage of around \$109,000 in the budget which was accumulated through money not used utilized by Councillors

(Powers/Pearson)

That staff be directed to fund \$1674 out of the common Legislative budget towards the 2010 Ward 11 Budget Deficit and pay \$1645 to Mr. David Mitchell out of the Legislative budget in consideration of his remaining portion of mileage expenses.

The Motion **CARRIED** on the following recorded vote.

Yeas: R. Powers, M. Pearson, B. Morelli
Total: 3
Nays B. Clark, B, Johnson
Total: 2

(Pearson/Powers)

That the Delegation by David Mitchell respecting, Report FCS11052, 2010 Ward 11 Budget Deficit, be received.

CARRIED

- (f) **Council referral, Sub-sections (b)(i) and (c)(iv) of Item 7 of the Audit, Finance and Administration Report 11-008, respecting Grants Sub-Committee Report 11-003. (Added Item 8.6)**

(Pearson/Johnson)

That Sub-sections (b)(i) and (c)(iv) to Item 7 of Audit, Finance and Administration Report 11-008 be referred to the Grants Sub-Committee.

CARRIED

- (g) **GENERAL INFORMATION/OTHER BUSINESS (Item 11)**

- (i) **Amendments to the Outstanding Business List (Item 11.1)**

(Pearson/Johnson)

That the following proposed new due date, be approved:

- (a) Item "D" - Sky Dragon Community Cooperative – Partnership Opportunities
Current Due Date: June 22, 2011
Proposed New Due Date: September 8, 2011

CARRIED

- (ii) **Monthly meeting Schedule (Added Item 11.2)**

Chair Clark suggested that the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee could switch to one meeting a month and assign their second meeting date to the General Issues Committee.

Staff discussed this possible change and indicated that it should be sent onto the Governance Review Sub-committee. This approach was supported by Committee members.

Councillor Pearson indicated that she prefers having General Issues Committee meetings as currently scheduled and keeping a separate week for the other standing Committee meetings

Councillor Pearson suggested that there have been a lot of General Issues Committee meetings recently and hopefully this trend is brought under control as matters are settled.

Councillor Johnson suggested that too many matters are being sent to the General Issues Committee rather than the appropriate standing committees.

For clarification purposes Councillor Powers indicated that the Committee members were not expressing a Committee position on the Audit Finance

and Administration meeting schedule, just making comments for review at the Governance Review Sub-committee.

(Powers/Johnson)

That the comments expressed by the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee be sent onto the Governance Review Sub-committee for consideration.

CARRIED

(h) PRIVATE AND CONFIDENTIAL

(i) Request for Balance of Deductible (RMS 009585) (FCS11060) (City Wide) (Item 12.1)

(Powers/Pearson)

That the Committee move into Closed Session at 11:58 a.m. to consider item 12.1 on the agenda pursuant to Section 239 subsection (e) of the Municipal Act and the City of Hamilton's Procedural By-law as the matter pertains to litigation or potential litigation, including matters before administrative tribunals, affecting the municipality or local board.

CARRIED

Chair Clark advised those in attendance that the Committee would reconvene in Open Session to deliver their recommendations.

The Committee reconvened in Open Session at 12:04 p.m.

For further disposition on this Item refer to Item 16

(i) AJOURNMENT (Item 13)

(Pearson/Powers)

There being no further business, the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee adjourned at 12:06 p.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully submitted,

Councillor B. Clark, Chair
Audit, Finance and Administration Committee

Andy Grozelle
Legislative Assistant
June 22, 2011