



**BOARD OF HEALTH
MINUTES 12-003
1:30 p.m.
April 16, 2012
Council Chambers
Hamilton City Hall**

Present: Mayor B. Bratina, Chair
Councillors B. McHattie, J. Farr, B. Morelli, C. Collins, T. Jackson,
S. Duvall, T. Whitehead, M. Pearson, R. Pasuta, J. Partridge

Absent: Councillor S. Merulla – City Business
Councillor B. Clark – Personal Business
Councillor B. Johnson – City Business
Councillor L. Ferguson – Personal Business
Councillor R. Power – City Business

Also Present: Dr. E. Richardson, Medical Officer of Health
Dr. C. Mackie, Associate Medical Officer of Health
Dr. N. Tran, Associate Medical Officer of Health
D. Barr-Elliott, Director; S. Brown, Healthy Living Division
R. Hall, Director; E. Mathews, Health Protection Branch
G. McArthur, Director; Clinical and Preventative Services
D. Sheehan, Director; Family Health Division
T. Bendo, Director; Planning and Business Improvement
C. Newman, Legislative Coordinator

THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REFERRED TO COUNCIL FOR CONSIDERATION:

- 1. Communicable Diseases and Health Hazard Investigations Quarterly Report (Q3) (July 1, 2011 to September 30, 2011) BOH11019(b) (City Wide) (Item 5.1)**

(Pearson/Morelli)

That Report BOH11019(b) respecting Communicable Diseases and Health Hazard Investigations Quarterly Report (Q3) (July 1, 2011 to September 30, 2011), be received.

CARRIED

2. Communicable Diseases and Health Hazard Investigations Quarterly Report (Q4) (October 1, 2011 to December 31, 2011) BOH11019(c) (City Wide) (Item 5.2)

(Pearson/Morelli)

That Report BOH11019(c) respecting Communicable Diseases and Health Hazard Investigations Quarterly Report (Q4) (October 1, 2011 to December 31, 2011), be received. **CARRIED**

3. Water Fluoridation: New Data and Recent Developments BOH08024(c) (City Wide) (Item 7.1)

(Collins/Jackson)

That report BOH08024(c), respecting Water Fluoridation: New Data and Recent Developments, be received. **CARRIED**

4. Water Fluoridation: New Data and Recent Developments BOH08024(c) (City Wide) (Item 7.1)

(McHattie/Pearson)

That the General Manager of Public Works, and Legal Services, report to the Public Works Committee respecting the pending changes to the *Safe Drinking Water Act*. **CARRIED**

FOR THE INFORMATION OF THE BOARD:

(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)

1. ADDED DELEGATION REQUESTS

- (i) Terry Wilson respecting the social and economic problems associated with water fluoridation (Added as Item 4.10)
- (ii) Peter Ormond representing the Green Party of Canada, Hamilton Centre Riding, respecting fluoridation in other jurisdictions and requesting that Hamilton remove fluoride from Hamilton's water (Added as Item 4.11)
- (iii) Sheldon Thomas representing the Clean Water Legacy respecting the chemical fluorosilicic acid in the practice of water fluoridation, with specific attention to the health effects of certain contaminants that are known to accompany the fluorosilicic acid product (Added as Item 4.12)

- (iv) Bob Green Innes respecting concurs of potential health and environmental hazards associated with water fluoridation (Added as Item 4.13)
- (v) Tim Burton respecting how water fluoridation discriminates against those living in poverty (Added as Item 4.14)
- (vi) Victoria Wondergem respecting health concerns with respect to fluoride in the City of Hamilton's water supply (Added as Item 4.15)
- (vii) Gerald Cooper representing People for Safe Drinking Water respecting the safety and legality of fluoridating Hamilton's drinking water (Added as Item 4.16)
- (ix) Simon J Kiss representing Wilfrid Laurier University respecting research into the politics and public options towards fluoridation in the City of Waterloo (Added as item 4.17)

2. ADDED CORRESPONDENCE WITH RESPECT TO WATER FLUORIDATION

- (i) Correspondence from Mary Pearson respecting concerns with water fluoridation (Added Item 7.1(b)(viii))

3. ADDED GENERAL INFORMATION

(i) CORRESPONDENCE

- (a) Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care Public Health Accountability Agreement with the City of Hamilton dated January 1, 2011 (Added Item 11.1(a))

(Pasuta/Partridge)

That the agenda be approved, as amended.

CARRIED

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

None

(c) MINUTES (Item 3)

(i) March 5, 2012 (Item 3.1)

(Morelli/Collins)

That the minutes from the March 5, 2012 Board of Health Meeting, be approved.

CARRIED

(d) DELEGATION REQUESTS (Item 4)

- (i) Lorna Moreau respecting health concerns related to neighbourhood air quality (Item 4.1)

(Morelli/Whitehead)

That the delegation request by Lorna Moreau respecting health concerns related to neighbourhood air quality, be approve to speak at the May 5, 2012 meeting of the Board of Health. **CARRIED**

- (ii) Dr. Peter Cooney representing Health Canada, Office of the Chief Dental Officer, respecting Health Canada's position on water fluoridation (Item 4.2)
- (iii) Dr. Ron Yarascavitch representing the Royal College of Dental Surgeons of Ontario (RCDSO), respecting the RCDSO's support of the use of fluoridation as a method for good oral health (Item 4.3)
- (iv) Peter Van Caulart representing the Environmental Training Institute respecting new information regarding drinking water fluoridation (Item 4.4)
- (v) Paul Connett representing the Fluoride Action Network respecting the stopping of water fluoridation as it unnecessary, unethical, ineffective and potentially dangerous (Item 4.5)
- (vi) Anthony Matthews representing the Council of Canadians – Hamilton Chapter respecting water fluoridation in Hamilton (Item 4.6)
- (vii) Dr. Raymond Ray respecting his research on water fluoridation in Europe (Item 4.7)
- (viii) George Pastoric representing Hydro-Logic Environmental respecting concerns about water fluoridation in Hamilton (Item 4.8)
- (ix) Heather Dawn Gingerich representing the International Medical Geology Association (Canada) respecting the presentation of recent peer-reviewed research concerning municipal water fluoridation and maternal child health outcomes (Item 4.9)
- (x) Terry Wilson respecting the social and economic problems associated with water fluoridation (Added as Item 4.10)
- (xi) Peter Ormond representing the Green Party of Canada, Hamilton Centre Riding, respecting fluoridation in other jurisdictions and requesting that Hamilton remove fluoride from Hamilton's water (Added as Item 4.11)

- (xii) Sheldon Thomas representing the Clean Water Legacy respecting the chemical fluorosilicic acid in the practice of water fluoridation, with specific attention to the health effects of certain contaminants that are known to accompany the fluorosilicic acid product (Added as Item 4.12)
- (xiii) Bob Green Innes respecting concurs of potential health and environmental hazards associated with water fluoridation (Added as Item 4.13)
- (xiv) Tim Burton respecting how water fluoridation discriminates against those living in poverty (Added as Item 4.14)
- (xv) Victoria Wondergem respecting health concerns with respect to fluoride in the City of Hamilton's water supply (Added as Item 4.15)
- (xvi) Gerald Cooper representing People for Safe Drinking Water respecting the safety and legality of fluoridating Hamilton's drinking water (Added as Item 4.16)
- (xvii) Simon J Kiss representing Wilfrid Laurier University respecting research into the politics and public options towards fluoridation in the City of Waterloo (Added as item 4.17)

(Pearson/Pasuta)

- a) That delegation request 4.2 through to 4.17 be approve to speak at today's meeting, as they are respecting a matter on today's agenda;
- b) That the delegations be renumbered 7.1(a)(iii) through 7.1(a)(xvii) respectively.

CARRIED

(e) CONSENT ITEMS

- (i) **Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes (Item 5.3):**
 - (a) **Community Food Security Stakeholder Advisory Committee meeting of October 5, 2011**
 - (b) **Community Food Security Stakeholder Advisory Committee meeting of November 2, 2011**
 - (c) **Community Food Security Stakeholder Advisory Committee meeting of December 7, 2011**
 - (d) **Community Food Security Stakeholder Advisory Committee**

meeting of January 4, 2012

- (e) **Community Food Security Stakeholder Advisory Committee meeting of February 1, 2012**
- (f) **Community Food Security Stakeholder Advisory Committee meeting of March 7, 2012**

(Pearson/Morelli)

That the advisory Committee Meeting Minutes be received.

CARRIED

(f) PRESENTATIONS (Item 7)

- (i) **Water Fluoridation: New Data and Recent Developments BOH08024(c) (City Wide) (Item 7.1)**

Dr. Mackie addressed the Board with the assistance of a PowerPoint presentation. His Comments included but were not limited to the following:

Dr. Mackie indicated that Health Services (PHS) have completed a review of recent studies on water fluoridation. The results of the review continue to show that fluoridating water lowers the risk of tooth decay, and contributes to better oral health.

The Clerk retained a copy of Dr. Mackie's presentation.

Dr. Arlene King, Chief Medical Officer of Health, for the Province of Ontario, gave a presentation to the Board. Her Comments included but were not limited to the following:

Dr. King spoke to the Board respecting fluoridation as a safe, effective, economical, and equitable means of preventing dental decay.

The Clerk retained a copy of Dr. King's presentation.

The Board asked questions of the presenters. Their questions included but were not limited to the following:

The Board inquired on the safety and alternative means to delivering safe oral health. The Board expressed some concern with the polarized views on fluoridation, and the variations in available literature on the topic.

(Morelli/ Farr)

That delegation requests by Dr. Peter Cooney representing Health Canada, Office of the Chief Dental Officer, and Dr. Yarascavitch representing the Royal College of Dental Surgeons of Ontario, be reorder

and permitted to speak as 7.1(a)(i) and 7.1(a)(ii) respectively. **CARRIED**

(i)(a) Delegates respecting water fluoridation (Item 7.1(a)):

- (i) Dr. Peter Cooney representing Health Canada, Office of the Chief Dental Officer, respecting Health Canada's position on water fluoridation (Item 4.2)**

Dr. Cooney gave a presentation in support of water fluoridation. A copy of his presentation was retained for the record.

- (ii) Dr. Ron Yarascavitch representing the Royal College of Dental Surgeons of Ontario (RCDSO), respecting the RCDSO's support of the use of fluoridation as a method for good oral health (Item 4.3)**

Dr. Ron Yarascavitch gave a presentation supporting water fluoridation. A copy of his presentation was retained for the record.

At 3:10 p.m., the Board of Health lost quorum.

- (iii) Shane Coleman respecting issues surrounding fluoridation of water, City of Calgary vote to remove fluoride and new information on the effects of fluoride on children (Item 7.1(a)(i))**

- (iv) Cindy Mayor respecting new information on water fluoridation and water fluoridation in Hamilton (Item 7.1(a)(ii))**

At 3:27 p.m., the Board of Health attained quorum.

- (v) Peter Van Caulart representing the Environmental Training Institute respecting new information regarding drinking water fluoridation (Item 4.4)**

Mr. Van Caulart was not in attendance at the meeting.

- (vi) Paul Connett representing the Fluoride Action Network respecting the stopping of water fluoridation as it unnecessary, unethical, ineffective and potentially dangerous (Item 4.5)**

Mr. Connett gave a presentation in opposition of water fluoridation. A copy of his presentation was retained for the record.

(vii) Anthony Matthews representing the Council of Canadians – Hamilton Chapter respecting water fluoridation in Hamilton (Item 4.6)

Mr. Matthews spoke to the Committee in opposition of water fluoridation. A copy of his speaking notes was retained for the record.

A copy of speaking notes was requested by the Board members.

(viii) Dr. Raymond Ray respecting his research on water fluoridation in Europe (Item 4.7)

Dr. Ray was not intendance at the meeting.

(ix) George Pastoric representing Hydro-Logic Environmental respecting concerns about water fluoridation in Hamilton (Item 4.8)

Mr. Pastoric gave a presentation in opposition to water fluoridation. A copy of his presentation was retained for the record.

(x) Heather Dawn Gingerich representing the International Medical Geology Association (Canada) respecting the presentation of recent peer-reviewed research concerning municipal water fluoridation and maternal child health outcomes (Item 4.9)

Ms. H.D. Gingerich gave a presentation in opposition to water fluoridation. A copy of her presentation was retained for the record.

(xi) Terry Wilson respecting the social and economic problems associated with water fluoridation (Added as Item 4.10)

Mr. Wilson gave a presentation in opposition to water fluoridation. Mr. Wilson indicated his concern with fluoridation and submitted a petition to the Board requesting that Hamilton water not be treated with hydrofluorosilicic acid.

(Whitehead/duvall)

That the Committee recess at 4:30 p.m. for a fifteen minute break.

CARRIED

- (xii) Peter Ormond representing the Green Party of Canada, Hamilton Centre Riding, respecting fluoridation in other jurisdictions and requesting that Hamilton remove fluoride from Hamilton's water (Added as Item 4.11)**

Mr. Ormond gave a presentation in opposition to water fluoridation. A copy of his presentation was retained for the record.

- (xiii) Sheldon Thomas representing the Clean Water Legacy respecting the chemical fluorosilicic acid in the practice of water fluoridation, with specific attention to the health effects of certain contaminants that are known to accompany the fluorosilicic acid product (Added as Item 4.12)**

Mr. Thomas gave a presentation in opposition to water fluoridation. A copy of his presentation was retained for the record.

- (xiv) Bob Green Innes respecting concurs of potential health and environmental hazards associated with water fluoridation (Added as Item 4.13)**

Mr. Innes gave a presentation in opposition to water fluoridation. His concerns surrounded fluoridated drinking water and osteoporosis.

- (xv) Tim Burton respecting how water fluoridation discriminates against those living in poverty (Added as Item 4.14)**

Mr. Burton gave a presentation in opposition to water fluoridation. His concerns surrounded those living in poverty and the effects of fluoridation.

- (xvi) Victoria Wondergem respecting health concerns with respect to fluoride in the City of Hamilton's water supply (Added as Item 4.15)**

Ms. Wondergem gave a presentation in opposition to water

fluoridation. Her concerns surrounded fluoridated drinking water and osteoporosis.

(xvii) Gerald Cooper representing People for Safe Drinking Water respecting the safety and legality of fluoridating Hamilton's drinking water (Added as Item 4.16)

Mr. Cooper gave a presentation in opposition to water fluoridation. A copy of his presentation was retained for the record.

(xviii) Simon J Kiss representing Wilfrid Laurier University respecting research into the politics and public options towards fluoridation in the City of Waterloo (Added as item 4.17)

Mr. Kiss gave a presentation in support of water fluoridation and displayed his research findings with respect to Waterloo's decision to take fluoride out of their water supply. A copy of his presentation was retained for the record.

(Whitehead/Farr)

That the delegates respecting BOH08024(c), respecting Water Fluoridation: New Data and Recent Developments, be received.

CARRIED

(i)(b) Correspondence respecting water fluoridation 7.1(b):

- (i) Correspondence from Sheldon Thomas representing the Clean Water Legacy's opposition to water fluoridation in Hamilton**
- (ii) Correspondence from Gideon Forman representing the Canadian Association of Physicians for the Environment (CAPE) requesting the City of Hamilton to cease the practice of water fluoridation**
- (iii) Correspondence from Robert Fleming representing the Canadians Opposed to Fluoridation (COF) respecting the harms of water fluoridation**
- (iiii) Correspondence from The Council of Canadians respecting their opposition to the use of fluoride in drinking water**
- (v) Correspondence from James Beck respecting Canadian**

Water Fluoridation Deputation

- (vi) **Correspondence from Diane Sprules respecting her Critique of Health Canada's 2010 Technical Guideline on Fluoride**
- (vii) **Correspondence from Peter Ormond respecting concerns with respect to the continued use of inorganic fluorides as a public health policy**
- (viii) **Correspondence from Mary Pearson respecting concerns with water fluoridation (Added Item)**

(Partridge/Pearson)

That the correspondence respecting BOH08024(c) respecting Water Fluoridation: New Data and Recent Developments, be received. **CARRIED**

(g) NOTICES OF MOTION (Item 10)

Councillor Whitehead introduced the following notice of motion:

- (i) **Water Fluoridation: New Data and Recent Developments BOH08024(c) (City Wide)**
 - a) That Health Canada be requested to regulate the fluorosilicate hexafluorosilicic acid (H_2SiF_6) and sodium Silicofluoride (Na_2SiF_6), used as a treatment for dental cavities in drinking water, as drugs under the *Food and Drug Act*;
 - b) That all chemicals, especially fluorosilicates, added to drinking water for the purpose of treating dental decay undergo new drug applications and be assigned drug numbers by Health Canada;
 - c) That classification of fluorosilicates as a drugs shall be based on at least one long term toxicology study to determine health effects in humans;
 - d) That at least one properly conducted, double blinded, randomized placebo controlled clinical trial be used to provide effectiveness as the basis for a new drug classification;
 - e) That staff contact Dr. Satish Deshpande, Team Leader, Water Standards Section, Ontario Ministry of the Environment, to request a copy of the NSF Standard 60 required toxicology studies of the

product used for fluoridation in Hamilton, to ensure its safety at the maximum use level, including effects from any potential contaminants in the product;

- f) That the City of Hamilton make the above recommendations to Health Canada, to reassure the citizens of Hamilton that the use of fluorosilicates added to drinking water for the purpose of treating dental decay is safe and what the health effects are;
- g) That a copy of this resolution be sent to the Federal and Provincial Minister of Health, and Hamilton area MPs and MPPs;
- h) That Hamilton area MPs and MPPs be requested to follow up on this issue with the Minister of Health and report back to the Hamilton Board of Health with a response.

Councillor Jackson introduced the following notice of motion:

(ii) Oral Health Reports to the Board of Health

That the Medical Office of Health and Public Health Services be directed to provide written "Oral Health" reports, beginning in 2013 and thereafter once per term of City Council or as required or requested by the Board of Health.

(h) GENERAL INFORMATION (Item 11)

CORRESPONDENCE (Item 11.1)

(i) Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care Public Health Accountability Agreement with the City of Hamilton dated January 1, 2011 (Added Item 11.1(a))

Dr. Richardson stated that the Ministry of Health has responded and accepted the amendments made to the targets outlined in the Public Health Accountability Agreement.

(Partridge/Pearson)

That the correspondence from the Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care respecting the Public Health Accountability Agreement with the City of Hamilton, be received. **CARRIED**

(g) ADJOURNMENT (Item 13)

(Pearson/Partridge)

That the Board of Health be adjourned at 6:15 p.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully submitted,

Mayor R. Bratina
Board of Health

Christopher Newman
Legislative Coordinator
April 16, 2012