



**BOARD OF HEALTH
MINUTES 12-004
1:30 p.m.
Monday, May 7, 2012
Council Chambers
Hamilton City Hall**

Present: Mayor B. Bratina, Chair
Councillors B. Clark, C. Collins, S. Duvall, J. Farr, L. Ferguson,
T. Jackson, B. McHattie, S. Merulla, B. Morelli, J. Partridge,
R. Pasuta, M. Pearson, T. Whitehead

Absent with
regrets: Councillor R. Powers – City Business
Councillor B. Johnson – City Business

Also Present: Dr. E. Richardson, Medical Officer of Health
Dr. C. Mackie, Associate Medical Officer of Health
Dr. N. Tran, Associate Medical Officer of Health
D. Barr-Elliott, Director; S. Brown, Healthy Living Division
R. Hall, Director; E. Mathews, Health Protection Branch
G. McArthur, Director; Clinical and Preventative Services
D. Sheehan, Director; Family Health Division
T. Bendo, Director; Planning and Business Improvement
C. Newman, Legislative Coordinator

THE FOLLOWING ITEMS WERE REFERRED TO COUNCIL FOR CONSIDERATION:

1. Neighbourhood Air Quality in Hamilton's Industrial Core

(Merulla/Collins)

- (a) That, staff bring forward the Terms of Reference, and Action Plan to the Board of Health, and a funding request be submitted to the Ministry of the Environment to assist with the costs of a pollution study;
- (b) That staff be directed to establish an Air Quality Task Force, which is to include key stakeholders to determine whether pollution in neighbourhoods near Hamilton's industrial core is impacting human health, and report to the Board of Health.

CARRIED

2. Photovoice: Engaging Students In School/Neighbourhood Planning (BOH12007) (Wards 2, 3 and 4) (Item 7.1)

(Whitehead/Morelli)

That Report BOH12007, respecting Photovoice: Engaging Students in School/Neighbourhood Planning, be received. **CARRIED**

3. Options for Funding a Model Program for Nutritious Food (BOH12005/CS12015) (City Wide) (Item 8.1)

(Clark/Whitehead)

That Report BOH12005/CS12015, respecting Options for Funding a Model Program for Nutritious Food, be received. **CARRIED**

4. Issues Response and Service Standards (BOH12006) (City Wide) (Item 8.2)

(Clark/Whitehead)

That Report BOH12006 respecting, Issues Response and Service Standards, be received. **CARRIED**

5. Communication Policy Between Medical Officer of Health and Board of Health (PH06038(a)) (City Wide) (Item 8.3)

(Clark/Pearson)

That the policy regarding communication between the Medical Officer of Health and the Board of Health, as described in Appendix A attached to Report PH06038(a) be approved. **CARRIED**

6. Water Fluoridation (Item 9.1)

(McHattie/Whitehead)

(a) That Health Canada be requested to regulate the fluorosilicate hexafluorosilicic acid (H₂SiF₆) and sodium Silicofluoride (Na₂SiF₆), used as a treatment for dental cavities in drinking water, either as:

(i) A drug under the Food and Drug Act, or as

(ii) An additive and/or supplement through the Bureau of Chemical Safety;

(b) That all chemicals, especially fluorosilicates, added to drinking water for the purpose of treating dental decay undergo:

- (i) New drug applications and be assigned drug numbers by Health Canada; and/or,
 - (ii) Assessment by the Bureau of Chemical Safety for inclusion in the Food Additive Dictionary;
- (c) That classification of fluorosilicates as a drugs and/or additives/supplements shall be based on at least one long term toxicology study to determine health effects in humans;
- (d) That at least one properly conducted, appropriately controlled trial be used to provide effectiveness as the basis for a new drug classification, and/or inclusion in the Food Additive Dictionary;
- (e) That staff contact Dr. Satish Deshpande, Team Leader, Water Standards Section, Ontario Ministry of the Environment, to request a copy of the NSF Standard 60 required toxicology studies of the product used for fluoridation in Hamilton, to ensure its safety at the maximum use level, including effects from any potential contaminants in the product;
- (f) That the City of Hamilton make the above recommendations to Health Canada, to reassure the citizens of Hamilton that the use of fluorosilicates added to drinking water for the purpose of treating dental decay is safe and what the health effects are;
- (g) That Health Canada support municipalities on this issue by undertaking peer reviewed studies on municipal jurisdictions who have recently removed fluoride from drinking water;
- (h) That a copy of this resolution be sent to the Federal and Provincial Minister of Health, and Hamilton area MPs and MPPs;
- (i) That Hamilton area MPs and MPPs be requested to follow up on this issue with the Minister of Health and report back to the Hamilton Board of Health with a response.

CARRIED

7. Oral Health Reports to the Board of Health (Item 9.2)

(Jackson/Whitehead)

That the Medical Officer of Health and Public Health Services be directed to provide written "Oral Health" reports, beginning in 2013 and thereafter once per term of City Council or as required or requested by the Board of Health.

CARRIED

FOR THE INFORMATION OF THE BOARD:**(a) CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)**

The Clerk advised of the following changes to the agenda:

1. ADDED DELEGATION REQUEST

- (i) Craig Foye representing the Hamilton Community Legal Clinic respecting their support of a "Model Program for Nutritious Food" (Added as Item 4.5)
- (ii) Cindy Mayor to provide information to the Board of Health regarding the motion on water fluoridation on the May 7, 2012 Board of Health Agenda (Added as Item 4.6)

(Pearson/Ferguson)

That the May 7, 2012 Board of Health agenda be approved, as amended.

CARRIED

(b) DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

None.

(c) MINUTES (Item 3)**(i) April 16, 2012 (Item 3.1)****(Pearson/Pasuta)**

That the minutes from the April 16, 2012 Board of Health meeting, be approved.

CARRIED

(d) DELEGATION REQUESTS (Item 4)**(Clark/Merulla)**

- (a) That delegation request 4.1 through to 4.6 be approve to speak at today's meeting, as they are respecting a matter on today's agenda;
- (b) That the delegations be renumbered 8.1(i) through 8.1(vi) respectively.

CARRIED

- (i) **Elizabeth McGuire, representing the Campaign for Adequate Welfare and Disability Benefits (CAWDB) respecting their support of a “Model Program for Nutritious Food” (Item 4.1)**
- (ii) **Marg Harris and Bill Medeiros, representing the Hamilton Organizing for Poverty Elimination (HOPE) formerly Hamilton 25 respecting their support of a “Model Program for Nutritious Food” (Item 4.2)**
- (iii) **Maureen Leyland, representing the Social Action Committee, Ontario, Association of Social Workers, Hamilton & District Branch respecting their support of a “Model Program for Nutritious Food” (Item 4.3)**
- (iv) **Anne Newbigging, representing the Canadian Federation of University Women, Hamilton Chapter respecting their support of a “Model Program for Nutritious Food” (Item 4.4)**
- (v) **Joanna Laranjo, representing the Registered Nurses Association of Ontario respecting a “Model Program for Nutritious Food” (Item 4.5)**
- (vi) **Craig Foye, representing the Hamilton Community Legal Clinic respecting their support of a “Model Program for Nutritious Food” (Added as Item 4.6)**
- (vii) **Cindy Mayor to provide information to the Board of Health regarding the motion on water fluoridation (Added as Item 4.7)**

The approval of delegation request 4.7 was differed to section 9 of the Agenda, as the motion has to be moved and seconded before a delegate could speak to the item.

(e) PUBLIC HEARINGS/DELEGATIONS (Item 6)

- (i) **Lorna Moreau respecting health concerns related to neighbourhood air quality (Item 6.1)**

Ms. Moreau spoke to her concerns related to neighbourhood air quality. Her comments included, but were not limited to, the following:

Ms. Moreau spoke to the air quality in the McAnulty neighbourhood; her focus was on the air pollutants emitted by industries located in Hamilton’s north end of the City. She suggested that the City undertake studies to investigate if pollution in Hamilton’s industrial core is influencing human health.

(Whitehead/Ferguson)

That the delegation by Lorna Moreau respecting health concerns related to neighbourhood air quality, be received. **CARRIED**

(f) PRESENTATIONS (Item 7)**(i) Photovoice: Engaging Students In School/Neighbourhood Planning (BOH12007) (Wards 2, 3 and 4) (Item 7.1)**

Kelly Scott, of the Health Living Division, spoke to the Board respecting the Photovoice program. Ms. Scott introduced students Rhonda and Jane, from Holy Name of Jesus Catholic School to present their Photovoice presentation. Photovoice was designed to allow students to discuss and identify issues in their communities.

(Whitehead/Morelli)

That the presentation, respecting Photovoice: Engaging Students In School/Neighbourhood Planning be received. **CARRIED**

(g) DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 8)**(i) Options for Funding a Model Program for Nutritious Food (BOH12005/CS12015) (City Wide) (Outstanding Business List Item) (Item 8.1)**

Dr. Richardson gave an overview of Report. Her comments included, but were not limited to the following:

Dr. Richardson indicated that the Board requested staff to seek out alternative funding sources to implement a nutritious food program. Staff indicated that funding sources were not available at the provincial level. Staff also assessed ways to make such a program available to more individuals.

(a) Elizabeth McGuire, representing the Campaign for Adequate Welfare and Disability Benefits (CAWDB) respecting their support of a “Model Program for Nutritious Food”

Ms. McGuire spoke to the benefits of implementing a Model Program for Nutritious Food for single individuals receiving Ontario Works Benefits.

- (b) **Marg Harris and Bill Medeiros, representing the Hamilton Organizing for Poverty Elimination (HOPE) formerly Hamilton 25 respecting their support of a “Model Program for Nutritious Food”**

Ms. Harris and Mr. Medeiros spoke to the importance of the proposed program on those single individuals who are receiving Ontario Works benefits.

- (c) **Maureen Leyland, representing the Social Action Committee, Ontario, Association of Social Workers, Hamilton & District Branch respecting their support of a “Model Program for Nutritious Food”**

Ms. Leyland spoke to the benefits of implementing a Model Program for Nutritious Food for single individuals receiving Ontario Works Benefits.

- (d) **Anne Newbigging, representing the Canadian Federation of University Women, Hamilton Chapter respecting their support of a “Model Program for Nutritious Food”**

Ms. Newbigging spoke to the benefits of implementing a Model Program for Nutritious Food for single individuals receiving Ontario Works Benefits.

- (e) **Joanna Laranjo, representing the Registered Nurses Association of Ontario respecting a “Model Program for Nutritious Food”**

Ms. Laranjo spoke to the benefits of implementing a Model Program for Nutritious Food for single individuals receiving Ontario Works Benefits.

- (f) **Craig Foye, representing the Hamilton Community Legal Clinic respecting their support of a “Model Program for Nutritious Food”**

Mr. Foye spoke to the benefits of implementing a Model Program for Nutritious Food for single individuals receiving Ontario Works Benefits.

(Whitehead/Merulla)

That the delegate presentations, respecting Report BOH12005/CS12015), Options for Funding a Model Program for Nutritious Food, be received.

CARRIED

The following motion LOST on a standing recorded vote, as follows:

Yeas: S. Duvall, J. Farr, S. Merulla, B. Morelli

Total: 4

Nays: R. Bratina, B. Clark, C. Collins, L. Ferguson, T. Jackson,
J. Partridge, M. Pearson, T. Whitehead

Total: 8

Absent: B. Johnson, B. McHattie, R. Pasuta, R. Powers

Total: 4

(Merulla/Farr)

- (a) That a pilot program to give a \$20.00 gift certificate to single individuals receiving Ontario Works Benefits, for Hamilton farmers markets, be approved for a five month term spanning from June 2012 until October 2012
- (b) That Public Health Staff report back to the Board of Health upon the completion of the pilot program.

(h) MOTIONS (Item 9)

(i) Water Fluoridation (Item 9.1)

(McHattie/Whitehead)

Whereas the Supreme Court of Canada ruled in the City of Toronto that fluoride was being used as a drug in the water system;

Therefore be it resolved:

- (a) That Health Canada be requested to regulate the fluorosilicate hexafluorosilicic acid (H_2SiF_6) and sodium Silicofluoride (Na_2SiF_6), used as a treatment for dental cavities in drinking water, either as:
 - (i) A drug under the Food and Drug Act, or as
 - (ii) An additive and/or supplement through the Bureau of Chemical Safety;
- (b) That all chemicals, especially fluorosilicates, added to drinking water for the purpose of treating dental decay undergo:
 - (i) New drug applications and be assigned drug numbers by Health Canada; and/or,
 - (ii) Assessment by the Bureau of Chemical Safety for inclusion

in the Food Additive Dictionary;

- (c) That classification of fluorosilicates as a drugs and/or additives/ supplements shall be based on at least one long term toxicology study to determine health effects in humans;
- (d) That at least one properly conducted, appropriately controlled trial be used to provide effectiveness as the basis for a new drug classification, and/or inclusion in the Food Additive Dictionary;
- (e) That staff contact Dr. Satish Deshpande, Team Leader, Water Standards Section, Ontario Ministry of the Environment, to request a copy of the NSF Standard 60 required toxicology studies of the product used for fluoridation in Hamilton, to ensure its safety at the maximum use level, including effects from any potential contaminants in the product;
- (f) That the City of Hamilton make the above recommendations to Health Canada, to reassure the citizens of Hamilton that the use of fluorosilicates added to drinking water for the purpose of treating dental decay is safe and what the health effects are;
- (g) That Health Canada support municipalities on this issue by undertaking peer reviewed studies on municipal jurisdictions who have recently removed fluoride from drinking water;
- (h) That a copy of this resolution be sent to the Federal and Provincial Minister of Health, and Hamilton area MPs and MPPs;
- (i) That Hamilton area MPs and MPPs be requested to follow up on this issue with the Minister of Health and report back to the Hamilton Board of Health with a response. **CARRIED**

9.1(a) Cindy Mayor to provide information to the Board of Health regarding the motion on water fluoridation on the May 7, 2012 Board of Health Agenda (Added as Item 4.6)

(Clark/Whitehead)

That the delegation request by Cindy Mayor to provide information to the Board of Health regarding the motion on water fluoridation on the May 7, 2012 Board of Health Agenda, be approved. **CARRIED**

Ms. Mayor spoke to the importance of the motion that was before the Board.

(Whitehead/Clark)

That the delegation by Cindy Mayor regarding the motion on water fluoridation, be received. **CARRIED**

(i) ADJOURNMENT (Item 13)

(Clark/Pearson)

That the Board of Health be adjourned at 5:15 p.m.

CARRIED

Respectfully submitted,

Mayor R. Bratina
Chair, Board of Health

Christopher Newman
Legislative Coordinator
May 7, 2012