

**CITY OF HAMILTON**

**CORPORATE SERVICES DEPARTMENT**  
**Customer Service, Access & Equity Division**

<b>TO:</b> Mayor and Members General Issues Committee	<b>WARD(S) AFFECTED:</b> CITY WIDE
<b>COMMITTEE DATE:</b> November 21, 2012	
<b>SUBJECT/REPORT NO:</b> Committee Against Racism's Anti-Racism Final Report Recommendations (Report FCS12095) (City Wide) (Outstanding Business List Item)	
<b>SUBMITTED BY:</b> Roberto Rossini General Manager Finance & Corporate Services Department	<b>PREPARED BY:</b> Maxine Carter, 905 546-2424, ext. 6419 Jane Lee, 905 546-2424, ext. 2654
<b>SIGNATURE:</b>	

**RECOMMENDATION**

- (a) That the Committee Against Racism be thanked for their presentation, submission and recommendations;
- (b) That the matter of language translation on the city's website be referred for review and consideration to the Web Redevelopment project;
- (c) That the Committee Against Racism be invited to present their findings regarding the gaps and obstacles and potential partnerships with respect to the feasibility study to establish a resource centre and telephone help line in Hamilton;
- (d) That the item respecting, the Anti-Racism Final Report Recommendation, be considered complete and removed from the General Issues Committee's (Corporate Services) Outstanding Business List.

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

At the February 1, 2012 meeting of the General Issues Committee, the Committee Against Racism presented an overview of their findings from their latest Anti-Racism

**SUBJECT: Committee Against Racism's Anti-Racism Final Report  
Recommendations (Report FCS12095) (City Wide) (Outstanding  
Business List Item) - Page 2 of 15**

---

Symposium, as well as their research and deliberations. At that meeting, staff were directed to report back to the General Issues Committee respecting the recommendations put forth by the members of the Committee Against Racism. The recommendations submitted by the Committee Against Racism are as follows:

- (a) That Council direct the Access & Equity Office to release a report that details the number of total staff, Councillors, senior managers, and managers who has completed the Racial Equality training;
- (b) That Council request on behalf of CAR, a copy of Hamilton Police Service's Equity Policy;
- (c) That all Councillors and their staff take Racial Equity training within one year of taking office;
- (d) That Council approve the formation of an Access and Equity Standing Committee of Council;
- (e) That Council direct Senior managers, included Human Resources, to develop and implement a plan of action with the outcome of making the City's workforce more reflective of the City's diverse population;
- (f) That Council direct Human Resources to actively consult with CAR in the recruitment, hiring, promotion and retention process and that they report back regarding outcomes and updates every 6 months to CAR;
- (g) That Council approve the City's website to be translated into multiple languages to increase access to diverse communities, similar to the Cities of Mississauga and Toronto;
- (h) That Council approve a feasibility study regarding the establishment of a resources centre that includes partners and will have a staffed telephone line, including anti-racism resources, education, and training for the community;
- (i) That Council direct the Access and Equity office to work in collaboration with the CAR on the development of a public awareness campaign that will focus on the impact of racism, how to address it, as well as the purpose of the resource centre and help telephone line.

***Alternatives for Consideration – Not Applicable***

**FINANCIAL / STAFFING / LEGAL IMPLICATIONS** (for Recommendation(s) only)

**Financial:** The next phase of funding for the Racial Equity Training will be considered by Council during the 2013 Capital Budget deliberations. Funding for an Employment Systems Review will also be considered by Council during the 2013 Capital Budget deliberations.

Any further specific financial implications resulting from further work on the website translation or the suggested resource centre will be considered when those projects are being considered.

**Staffing:** N/A

**Legal:** N/A

**HISTORICAL BACKGROUND** (Chronology of events)

The Committee Against Racism has hosted three symposiums over the past 9 years focussing on the issue of racism in the City of Hamilton and what is being done to address it by agencies, organizations, institutions and communities. The symposiums were held in order to give individuals and representatives from community agencies, grassroots organizations, the health sector, funding agencies, Hamilton Police Services, Hamilton Spectator, outreach workers, researchers, students, teachers and management from the Hamilton Wentworth District School Board and Hamilton Wentworth Catholic District School Board, Mohawk College, McMaster University, the City of Hamilton and many more sectors, an opportunity to discuss and make recommendations regarding the impact of racism and the reality of anti-racism work in the City of Hamilton. Some of the key objectives were to identify the gaps and obstacles to addressing racism and to develop an anti-racism agenda for the city in partnership with the agencies, institutions and grassroots communities. The symposium called for the participation of everyone including those who are involved in anti-racism work whether paid or unpaid, to discuss the impact of racism and what needs to be done to address these issues in the community and in organizations.

The symposium participants identified gaps in the existing initiatives in the city and obstacles to accomplishing anti-racism work and then formulated recommendations that they wanted the Committee Against Racism to present to Council.

The Committee Against Racism presented their findings and made recommendations to Council after each symposium. The most recent presentation was made to the General Issues Committee on February 1, 2012 where the Committee Against Racism provided

an overview of their accomplishments over the past six years and made nine recommendations that were then referred to staff for a report back.

### **POLICY IMPLICATIONS**

The recommendations from the Committee against Racism are consistent with the Equity and Inclusion Policy and the Racial Equity Policy and the stated desired outcomes, as well as several recommendations from the Workforce Census. The recommendations will advance the City's implementation of the policies.

### **RELEVANT CONSULTATION**

Discussions took place or information was obtained from the following:

- Committee Against Racism has provided feedback and justification for each of the recommendations. They have also continued to gather further input from the broader community, agencies and institutions with a specific focus on the feasibility of a resource centre and telephone helpline.
- Corporate Services, Clerks Division – feedback about the possibility of Racial Equity Training as part of Council Orientation; discussion about the current standing committee structure and recommendation for an Access and Equity Standing Committee of Council
- Corporate Services, Financial Planning and Policy Division – discussion about the capital budget requests for the Racial Equity Training and the Employment Systems Review project
- City Managers Office, Human Resources – discussion about the Employment Systems Review and recommendations from the committee with respect to achieving an outcome of having a workforce that reflects the diversity of the community, and about the ongoing consultation with the Committee Against Racism related to employment
- Hamilton Police Services – request for a copy of the Hamilton Police Services Equity Policy and response from the Hamilton Police Services

### **ANALYSIS / RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION**

(include Performance Measurement/Benchmarking Data, if applicable)

Comments on each recommendation from the Committee against Racism are addressed below.

The Committee Against Racism put forward 9 recommendations [(a) to (i)] to the General Issues Committee following their presentation of February 1, 2012. General Issues Committee directed staff to investigate the recommendations and report back.

**SUBJECT: Committee Against Racism's Anti-Racism Final Report  
Recommendations (Report FCS12095) (City Wide) (Outstanding  
Business List Item) - Page 5 of 15**

---

The General Issues Committee Report 12-003 was approved by Council in its entirety on February 8, 2012.

- (a) That Council direct the Access & Equity Office to release a report that details the number of total staff, Councillors, senior managers, and managers who have completed the Racial Equality training;**

One of the recommendations that came out of the 2003 Anti-racism Symposium hosted by the Committee Against Racism, recommended to Council that the City of Hamilton provide mandatory and ongoing anti-racism and other anti-oppression training to the staff and elected officials to foster and nurture a respectful and inclusive work place. This recommendation is also reflected in the policy commitment of the Racial Equity Policy (approved by Council August 10, 2010) that states:

“The Racial Equity Policy aims to build and nurture a respectful and inclusive workforce and civic environment that reflects diversity, equity, inclusion, and public engagement for all the City’s racialized communities in all programs, services, processes and outcomes.”

One of the Council directives that was included in the terms of reference for the Access and Equity Office was to make anti-racism a priority for the organization hence the development of the training program for staff. The Access and Equity Office subsequently developed, in collaboration with the community, advisory committees and staff the Racial Equity training program, “Equipping to Serve”. The office coordinates the training and maintains employee training records using the PeopleSoft database system.

The Racial Equity training is a mandatory training program for all staff and has been in place since 2008. The objective of the program is to assist all staff in understanding the intent of the policy, how to implement the key policy commitments, and to develop competencies for working and serving in a diverse environment. It is best, as with most types of training, that management attend first and then their staff, so that managers are equipped to address questions and concerns from their staff and to learn how to implement the principles and intended outcomes into their departmental strategies and work plans. A brief outline of the program can be found in Appendix A.

Staff supports the recommendation to release the report which details the attendance of participants from each department who has attended the training program to date.

The total number of staff that participated in the training since the launch of the program in 2008 is 1,624.

The total number of managers that have participated in the program are as follows:

**SUBJECT: Committee Against Racism's Anti-Racism Final Report  
Recommendations (Report FCS12095) (City Wide) (Outstanding  
Business List Item) - Page 6 of 15**

---

Level One Modules A B	270
Level Two Modules D, C, E	136

Total number of Councillors who have participated:

Module AB:	1
Module C:	1
Module D:	1

Appendix D to this report provides the details of participation by departmental including the staff who has participated from Hamilton Entertainment and Convention Facilities Inc., Hamilton Public Library and Hamilton Police Services.

**(b) That Council request on behalf of CAR, a copy of Hamilton Police Service's Equity Policy;**

A request was made by staff to Police Chief De Caire for a copy of the Hamilton Police Services (HPS) Equity Policy. The Chief responded that "the Hamilton Police Service does not release our Policies and Procedures to outside agencies, except pursuant to a request made under the *Municipal Freedom of Information Act* or as otherwise required by law." The Chief recognized the importance of the work being done by the Committee Against Racism, and offered to have a Hamilton Police Service representative attend at the next meeting of the Committee to discuss the HPS policy and to respond to questions from the Committee.

The Municipal Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act (the Act) governs the process and release of information from policing services, as well as municipalities and other agencies. The purpose of the Act is to ensure that information that should be available to the public is made available by institutions, allows for limited and specific exemptions from disclosure, provides for independent review of decisions about disclosure and lack of disclosure, and addresses the protection of privacy with respect to personal information about individuals held by institutions. The section of the Act which addresses access to information does provide several exclusions to the release of information, including a specific section related to law enforcement. Law enforcement is defined in the Act as follows:

“law enforcement” means,

- (a) policing,
- (b) investigations or inspections that lead or could lead to proceedings in a court or tribunal if a penalty or sanction could be imposed in those proceedings, or
- (c) the conduct of proceedings referred to in clause (b)”

The exemptions for refusal to disclose a police record are quite specific; some of which are geared to avoid interference in an investigation, revealing investigative techniques, or endangering the life or safety of a law enforcement officer or any person as well as the security of premises. A brief review of Information and Privacy Commission orders related to the disclosure or failure to disclose police policies seems to indicate that the Commission takes a limited view of exempting policies and procedures from disclosure.

However, given the possible exemptions in the Act, the most expeditious matter of addressing this recommendation would be for staff to make the request for the Equity Policy pursuant to the Municipal Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act through the Hamilton Police Services Records Business Centre at the Central Police Station. The Committee Against Racism will also be advised of the offer from the Police Chief to have a representative attend at a Committee Against Racism meeting to discuss the HPS Equity Policy.

**(c) That all Councillors and their staff take Racial Equity training within one year of taking office;**

Staff are supportive of this recommendation from the committee. As our growing population becomes more diverse, the training would be beneficial to all Councillors and their staff. Staff will ensure that following each Municipal Election, the Equity and Inclusion Policy, as well as the Racial Equity Policy is made available to the members of Council, and that the members of Council and staff are informed of the Racial Equity Training as it is scheduled. The next phase of funding for the Racial Equity Training will be considered by Council during the 2013 Capital Budget deliberations.

**(d) That Council approve the formation of an Access and Equity Standing Committee of Council;**

Staff have considered the request for the formation of an Access and Equity Standing Committee of Council and discussed the possible implications and alternatives with the Clerks Division staff. The Mandate of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee includes the following (in part, noting the relevant sections applicable to access and equity and possible related functions):

**Audit, Finance and Administration Committee**

Mandate:

*General:* To report and make recommendations to Council on matters relating to:

- Access & Equity

*Specific duties shall include:*

- To consider and make recommendations to Council on:
  - matters of policy respecting human resources, including health and

- safety, union/management relations, organizational planning and development and compensation administration
- matters of policy involving communications issues
  - matters of policy involving general policies and procedures and administrative By-laws
  - matters of policy and direction related to Access and Equity, including the annual corporate accessibility plan
  - To act as liaison to the Access & Equity volunteer advisory committees (with the exception of the Advisory Committee for Persons with Disabilities reporting to the General Issues Committee)

Staff recognize the importance of focusing on equity, diversity and inclusion from the community's perspective and the workforce. However, there are insufficient reports concerning Access and Equity policy matters and direction to warrant a separate Access and Equity Standing Committee. The current Mandate of the Audit, Finance and Administration Committee addresses this area of focus.

**(e) That Council direct Senior managers, including Human Resources, to develop and implement a plan of action with the outcome of making the City's workforce more reflective of the City's diverse population;**

There are a number of City documents that identify the desired outcome of making the City's workforce reflective of the community we serve, so the recommendation from the Committee against Racism is consistent with City policies. The Equity and Inclusion Policy (approved August, 2010) notes the following short term outcomes:

- Bias-free hiring, recruiting, selection, promotion and retention processes have been developed and implemented.
- Departmental managers make special efforts to recruit and hire members from the under-served communities in order to build a workforce that reflects the diversity of the communities served.

It also notes the following long term outcomes:

- Managers ensure the environment is inclusive, safe and welcoming to all members of staff and the diverse communities.
- Staff is reflective of the community we serve.

The Racial Equity Policy, revised and approved by Council in 2010, notes as the purpose of the policy:

"The Racial Equity Policy aims to build and nurture a respectful and inclusive workforce and civic environment that reflects diversity, equity, inclusion, and public engagement for all the City's racialized communities in all programs, services, processes and



outcomes.” It also notes as an intended outcome that “the City’s workforce reflects the ethno-racial diversity of communities it serves.”

In addition, the Workforce Census completed in 2011 notes a number of areas where the city workforce is under represented and, therefore, not reflective of the community we serve. The Workforce Census notes the following recommendations:

Recommendation 4: The City must conduct a qualitative assessment of the work environment focused on diversity and inclusion issues. The assessment should cover the current climate for diversity and inclusion, including opportunities for selected groups as well as perceptions of harassment and discrimination by group. The survey should also assess employees' perceptions of the fairness of policies and practices related to promotion, selection and development opportunities. This assessment needs to examine recruitment and selection practices to ensure they do not include systemic bias against under-represented groups.

Recommendation 6: The City should identify key target areas based on the Workforce Census data, set goals and develop a roadmap for closing gaps and evolving with the changing composition of the region. Particular attention should be paid to visible minority and immigrant representation gaps. It is recommended that representation goals for these critical areas are set using the most recent Statistics Canada population projections for Hamilton.

The Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act (AODA) Integrated Accessibility Standard (O. Reg. 191/11) requires municipalities to review processes and remove barriers in order to implement the Employment Standard in terms of recruitment processes, accommodation during the recruitment process, return to work processes, performance management, career development and advancement, and redeployment as well as individual accommodation plans for employees.

To initiate action on the Workforce Census recommendations and to accomplish the above requirement of the AODA Employment Standard, which is required to be implemented by January 1, 2014, it is proposed that an Employment Systems Review be undertaken to identify the barriers faced by people with disabilities in our recruitment, retention, redeployment services, etc. In completing this review, the employment process and policies will also be reviewed from the perspective of all underserved communities, so that all barriers will be identified for removal. The Employment Systems Review will identify barriers in our employment processes, including consultation with advisory committees and stakeholders and will recommend changes to address the barriers. In addition to assisting the City in meeting its AODA obligations, it will assist the city in working towards achieving outcomes of the Equity and Inclusion Policy and the recommendations of the Workforce Census concerning making the City’s workforce more reflective of the City’s diverse population. The

Committee against Racism will be part of the consultation. A funding request for the funds to complete the Employment Systems Review will be considered as part of the 2013 Capital Budget process. The majority of the funding is available from an AODA capital account.

The completion of an Employment Systems Review will be the first step in identifying the actions to be taken to ensure that City processes do not create barriers for members of our diverse communities.

- (f) That Council direct Human Resources to actively consult with CAR in the recruitment, hiring, promotion and retention process and that they report back regarding outcomes and updates every 6 months to CAR;**

The Committee Against Racism will be consulted during the Employment Systems Review, to provide feedback about the recruitment, hiring, promotion and retention process. Current systems of collecting employee information do not provide detailed demographics of our staff complement, so ongoing changes cannot be collected. The Human Resources Division will update the Committee against Racism following subsequent updates to the Workforce Census, anticipated to be completed every 5 years to coincide with Census Canada data collection, and with capital budget approval.

- (g) That Council approve the City's website to be translated into multiple languages to increase access to diverse communities, similar to the Cities of Mississauga and Toronto;**

Staff recommends that language translation on the city's web site be referred for review and consideration by the web redevelopment project team.

The possibility of providing for translation of information on the City's website has come up in previous discussions and would be helpful to the public given the diversity of our community. There are some translation tools that are available for public use for translation of documents and content and that are in use on other websites. However, there are also concerns about the accuracy of some of the material translated. This matter would benefit from further review.

There are a number of areas in the Equity and Inclusion Policy that supports the principles of providing equitable access to city services and programs for diverse communities. For example these principles state that:

"Governance decisions made in the interests of under-served communities enhance the outcomes of all Hamiltonians."

"All members of the City of Hamilton's communities must have equitable access to its services, programs and opportunities."... and that

“The principles of Equity and Inclusion are embedded in the City's business processes and opportunities and in the supports that the City provides to businesses, creating a level playing field and benefiting all the City's stakeholders”

There are numerous benefits for the City of Hamilton if language translation technology is provided as part of the City's website. Some of these benefits are:

- There are numerous instances where someone whose first language is not English misinterprets information that is given to them whether in writing (English) or verbally (English).
- Many potential newcomers, such as business class or entrepreneur class who plan to migrate to Canada will visit the website of the cities that they are interested in migrating to, where they research the various amenities, services and programs that are offered.
- Having access to the website in their own language better equips a newcomer in understanding what Hamilton has to offer, and what services are available to them;
- it is empowering and builds ones confidence if you get information first hand because it decreases your vulnerability due to lack of understanding;
- Being familiar with the information before coming to City Hall reduces the feeling of intimidation and anxiety;
- Knowledge of services can be shared with other community members more readily,
- Improved service quality and a happier customer/resident;
- The website can become a great promotional tool, locally, nationally and internationally;
- Reduces frustration for both the newcomer and the service provider if there is some level of understanding;
- Departments can build this feature into their business plans.

As a result of the direction from General Issues Committee to report back respecting this recommendation put forth by the Committee Against Racism, staff reviewed several municipalities' websites to investigate options and practices of other municipalities that also have diverse populations. These municipalities included City of Toronto, City of Mississauga, Town of Milton, Region of Durham and City of Vancouver. A table highlighting the information found on their websites is attached as Appendix B.

It is recommended that the matter of translation of the City's website be referred to the Web Redevelopment project for consideration.

**(h) That Council approve a feasibility study regarding the establishment of a resources centre that includes partners and will have a staffed telephone**

**line, including anti-racism resources, education, and training for the community;**

This recommendation, that a resource centre be established in Hamilton devoted to supporting individuals and communities who experience racism, came out of the first symposium in 2003 and was revisited and validated in the second symposium in 2006.

Over the past several months, the Committee Against Racism, in collaboration with the Access and Equity Office, has put greater emphasis on analyzing the data collected and is in the process of developing a strategic framework to present to Committee in the near future. From the data collected, the Committee Against Racism has been able to draft the mandate, goals, objectives and some preliminary activities and short and long term outcomes of the Resource Centre and a telephone help line. The resource centre will document and prepare a yearly report card, provide anti-racism research, education, and counseling, capacity-building for individuals and communities, an up to date directory of anti-racism and other anti-oppression trainers and practitioners, as well as accreditation services.

Currently there are no resource centres and telephone help line in Hamilton that focuses on supporting and providing referrals to individuals who experience racism.

The Committee Against Racism is presently conducting additional community consultations to gather data regarding the gaps and obstacles faced by individuals who experience racism and to get validation from service providers and community agencies that this initiative is absolutely needed in Hamilton. Another key objective of the consultations is to source out potential partnerships with agencies and community groups for this initiative that can provide support and long term sustainability for the centre.

If this resource centre and telephone help line were to be approved and implemented it would provide a central location for members of the public to go when they need support and information regarding racism and discrimination and it would also support much of the anti-racism and other anti-oppression training, professional development and relevant research needs of many organizations including the City of Hamilton.

The centre is envisioned as a friendly and supportive community meeting place to help promote a sense of belonging for Hamiltonians experiencing racism, discrimination and other forms of oppression. It is envisioned as a place where opportunities, services and resources can be accessed by all members of the community. Progressive ideas and initiatives can be nurtured collaboratively among diverse groups.

To this end, the committee has engaged various sectors of the community including City Council, educational institutions, businesses, community agencies, cultural and religious

groups to participate in a consultation process to provide input into the development of a strategic framework for the anti-racism resource centre. The centre will have community oversight as it is being proposed that it be governed by a Board of Directors representing various sectors within the community.

Over the long term, the resource centre will benefit the City because collaborative partnerships will have emerged, many individuals will have had the opportunity to learn more about how to address racism, newcomers will want to stay because they may feel more welcomed and included and in the end more productivity and synergy for the City. This will further complement the work of the Access and Equity office, as well as minimize the time and resources staff spends investigating and addressing complaints regarding racism, and discrimination from the community.

With respect to funding, the proposed funding model that has been emerging to date, entails seeking ongoing funding and logistical support from the municipal, provincial and federal levels of government, local universities, other institutions, and donors, in addition to seeking partnerships with community agencies, cultural and religious groups. For example, some potential options include utilizing existing City facilities and resources. The anticipated staff resource for the centre is one full-time paid staff, supported by volunteers and interns. The Committee against Racism will also provide ongoing support and advice to the resource centre Board and staff.. Subsequently, this could ease the financial burden on the City, as well as ensure long term sustainability of the resource centre, due to the fact that it has a high level of inclusive community ownership and stakeholder involvement.

The next steps will be to scope out the potential partnerships at the institutional level, for consideration of the development and sustainability of such a Resource Centre and telephone help line.

Staff recommends that the Committee Against Racism make a presentation to Committee in the near future once their consultations are complete.

- (i) That Council direct the Access and Equity office to work in collaboration with the CAR on the development of a public awareness campaign that will focus on the impact of racism, how to address it, as well as the purpose of the resource centre and help telephone line.**

The Equity and Inclusion Policy was approved by Council on August 10 2010. As noted in the policy, the next steps in implementation will include a communications strategy which will address the organizational understanding of the need for and relevance of the policy and development of the tools which will assist staff and Council in implementing the policy. The Access and Equity office is in the process of working with a communications consultant developing a communications strategy and

**SUBJECT: Committee Against Racism's Anti-Racism Final Report  
Recommendations (Report FCS12095) (City Wide) (Outstanding  
Business List Item) - Page 14 of 15**

---

accompanying messages that reflect the intent of the Equity and Inclusion policy and commitment statements. Although a greater percentage of the messages are directed internally to staff there is a component that will be directed externally to the public.

The Access and Equity Coordinator plans to work in collaboration with the advisory committees including the Committee Against Racism and the communications consultant to develop appropriate and relevant messages that will be utilized in a public awareness campaign. Committee Against Racism will play a pivotal role in providing input and feedback regarding the messages aimed at addressing racism and its impacts.

The messaging will also focus on the city's commitment to equity and inclusion and to meeting the needs of all members of the community by addressing the needs of underserved communities. The messaging campaign will be designed to foster ongoing integration of the Equity and Inclusion Policy and the Racial Equity Policy into the fabric of the city's business.

The public awareness campaign aimed at promoting the resource centre and telephone help line will be developed at a later date, once more definitive information is known, and as those initiatives move forward.

**ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION**

(include Financial, Staffing, Legal and Policy Implications and pros and cons for each alternative)

None.

**CORPORATE STRATEGIC PLAN (Linkage to Desired End Results)**

Focus Areas: 1. Skilled, Innovative and Respectful Organization, 2. Financial Sustainability, 3. Intergovernmental Relationships, 4. Growing Our Economy, 5. Social Development, 6. Environmental Stewardship, 7. Healthy Community

***Skilled, Innovative & Respectful Organization***

- ◆ A culture of excellence
- ◆ A skilled, adaptive and diverse workforce, i.e. more flexible staff
- ◆ More innovation, greater teamwork, better client focus
- ◆ An enabling work environment - respectful culture, well-being and safety, effective communication

**SUBJECT: Committee Against Racism's Anti-Racism Final Report  
Recommendations (Report FCS12095) (City Wide) (Outstanding  
Business List Item) - Page 15 of 15**

---

- ◆ Council and SMT are recognized for their leadership and integrity

***Growing Our Economy***

- ◆ Competitive business environment
- ◆ An improved customer service
- ◆ A visitor and convention destination

***Social Development***

- ◆ People participate in all aspects of community life without barriers or stigma

***Healthy Community***

- ◆ An engaged Citizenry

**APPENDICES / SCHEDULES**

Appendix “A” to Report FCS12095 – Racial Equity Training Program

Appendix “B” to Report FCS12095 – Municipal Website Translation and Language Comparisons

Appendix “C” to Report FCS12095 – City of Toronto and City of Mississauga’s Websites

Appendix “D” to Report FCS12095 – Racial Equity Training Attendance Summary

## **Racial Equity Training Program**

### **Level 1: Modules A and B**

An overview of the policy is presented. These modules are designed to equip City leaders, management, staff and volunteers to reflect and serve diverse ethno-racial and ethno-cultural communities equitably and with cultural competence and to foster a racism free and inclusive environment. Six Competencies are introduced:

1. Create safe space for honest conversation.
2. Avoid rushed and stereotypical conclusions.
3. Keep the big picture in view.
4. Recognize and own your biases.
5. Know your real clientele.
6. Take ownership for service equity.

Modules A and B serves as a prototype for other equity and diversity training programs and the learning in Level One can be used to identify and understand other forms of discrimination. One such training program that is mandated by the Province regarding the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act, 2005 is the requirements for the Customer Service Standard training for staff, which has very similar requirements regarding terminology and human rights understanding as pertains to persons with disabilities be included.

### **Level Two: Modules C & D/E**

Level Two, Modules C & D/E are designed for Management.

1. Demonstrate the benefits of inclusion and cost of exclusion.
2. Focus on organizational, departmental and individual responsibilities.
3. Practice competence in discerning, analyzing and addressing challenges.
4. Identify organization points of contact for change.
5. Draft Departmental-level cultural competence plans involving change strategies in key operational areas: Agencies & Boards, Leadership/Management; Policies; Culture/Values/Attitudes; HR/Administration; Service; Outreach; Communication.



## Municipal Website Translation and Language Comparisons

### 1) Mississauga (Census Subdivision)

The City of Mississauga's website can be translated into 65 languages, such as Afrikaans, Lao, and Turkish, using an internal software program for translation. See

<http://www.mississauga.ca/portal/cityhall/languages> for details.

#### Top 10 Detailed Non-official Mother Tongues: Mississauga

	Total <sup>1</sup> -Single and Multiple Mother Languages	Percentage of Total Population (713, 443)
Urdu	39,640	5.5
Polish	30,315	4.2
Panjaba (Punjabi)	24,595	3.4
Arabic	24,450	3.4
Tagalog (Pilipino, Filipino)	23,400	3.2
Portuguese	18,925	2.6
Spanish	16,860	2.3
Chinese, not otherwise specified (n.o.s.)	16,320	2.2
Italian	15,285	2.1
Cantonese	12,430	1.7

Source: Statistics Canada, 2011 Census

### 2) Toronto (Census Metropolitan Area)

The City of Toronto's website can be translated into 51 languages, such as Indonesian, Maltese, and Estonian, using Google Translate. See <http://www.toronto.ca/> for details.

#### Top 10 Detailed Non-official Mother Tongues: Toronto

	Total <sup>2</sup> -Single and Multiple Mother Languages	Percentage of Total Population (5,583,064)
Italian	178,750	3.2
Cantonese	177,735	3.1
Panjabi (Punjabi)	164,855	3.0
Chinese, n.o.s.	162,890	2.9
Tagalog (Pilipino, Filipino)	140,010	2.5
Spanish	127,830	2.3
Urdu	124,110	2.2
Tamil	114,725	2.1
Portuguese	110,905	2.0
Mandarin	102,425	1.8

Source: Statistics Canada, 2011 Census

<sup>1</sup> Totals are based on single and multiple language responses. Single language responses refer to respondents who provide one language only and multiple language responses refer to respondents who provide two or more languages.

<sup>2</sup> Totals are based on single and multiple language responses. Single language responses refer to respondents who provide one language only and multiple language responses refer to respondents who provide two or more languages.

### 3) Town of Milton (Census Subdivision)

The Town of Milton's website can be translated into eight languages, such as Arabic, Chinese, and Polish, using Google Translate. See

<http://www.milton.ca/en/includes/googleTranslate/googletranslate.aspx?url=http%3A//www.milton.ca/en/index.asp> for details.

#### Top 10 Detailed Non-official Mother Tongues: Milton

	<b>Total<sup>3</sup>-Single and Multiple Mother Languages</b>	<b>Percentage of Total Population (84,362)</b>
Urdu	4,135	5.0
Polish	1,905	2.3
Spanish	1,890	2.2
Tagalog (Pilipino, Filipino)	1,485	1.8
Panjabi (Punjabi)	1,455	1.7
Italian	1,290	1.5
Arabic	1,275	1.5
Portuguese	1,270	1.5
Hindi	605	.7
Croatian	600	.7

Source: Statistics Canada, 2011 Census

---

<sup>3</sup> Totals are based on single and multiple language responses. Single language responses refer to respondents who provide one language only and multiple language responses refer to respondents who provide two or more languages.

#### 4) Durham Region

Durham Region consists of eight Area Municipalities of the Cities of Oshawa and Pickering, the Towns of Ajax and Whitby, the Municipality of Clarington, and the Townships of Brock, Scugog, and Uxbridge. This region's website can be translated into 23 languages, such as Finnish, Japanese, and Spanish, using Google Translate. See

<http://www.durham.ca/default.asp?nr=/departments/demo/alerting/alertinginside.htm> for details.

#### Top 3 Detailed Non-official Mother Tongues: Durham Region

	Total <sup>4</sup> -Single and Multiple Mother Languages	Percentage of Total Population (519,310)
<b>Ajax (Population of 109,600)</b>		
Tagalog (Pilipino, Filipino)	2,685	.5
Urdu	2,635	.5
Tamil	2,230	.4
<b>Oshawa (Population of 149,607)</b>		
Polish	2,010	.4
Italian	1,645	.3
Spanish	1,060	.2
<b>Whitby (Population of 122,022)</b>		
Italian	1,765	.3
Spanish	1,135	.2
Urdu	1,040	.2
<b>Brock (Population of 11,341)</b>		
German	130	.03
Dutch	80	.02
Portuguese	40	.008
<b>Clarington (Population of 84,548)</b>		
Dutch	735	.1
Polish	660	.1
Italian	645	.1
<b>Uxbridge (Population of 20,623)</b>		
German	285	.05
Italian	220	.04
Dutch	160	.03
<b>Scugog (Population of 21,569)</b>		
German	260	.05
Dutch	190	.04
Italian	90	.02

Source: Statistics Canada, 2011 Census

<sup>4</sup> Totals are based on single and multiple language responses. Single language responses refer to respondents who provide one language only and multiple language responses refer to respondents who provide two or more languages.

### 5) Vancouver (Census Metropolitan Area)

The City of Vancouver's website can be translated into over 50 languages, such as Tagalog, Persian, and German, using Google Translate. See <http://vancouver.ca/your-government/contact-the-city-of-vancouver.aspx> for details.

#### Top 10 Detailed Non-official Mother Tongues: Vancouver

	Total <sup>5</sup> -Single and Multiple Mother Languages	Percentage of Total Population (2,313,328)
Panjabi (Punjabi)	147,725	6.3
Cantonese	133,400	5.8
Chirinese, n.o.s.	115,635	5.0
Mandarin	92,415	4.0
Tagalog (Pilipino, Filipino)	68,290	3.0
Korean	45,300	2.0
Persian (Farsi)	35,725	1.5
Spanish	34,590	1.5
German	28,590	1.2
Hindi	26,165	1.1

Source: Statistics Canada, 2011 Census

### References

Focus on Geography Series, 2011 Census. 2012. Statistics Canada.

<http://www12.statcan.gc.ca/census-recensement/2011/as-sa/fogs-spg/Index-eng.cfm?LANG=Eng>  
Detailed Mother, Single and Multiple Responses by Census Divisions and Census Subdivisions, 2011 Census. 2012. Statistics Canada.

<http://www12.statcan.gc.ca/census-recensement/2011/dp-pd/tbt-tt/Rp-eng.cfm?LANG=E&APATH=3&DETAIL=0&DIM=0&FL=A&FREE=0&GC=0&GID=0&GK=0&GRP=1&PID=103252&PRID=0&PTYPE=101955&S=0&SHOWALL=0&SUB=0&Temporal=2011&THEME=90&VID=0&VNAMEE=&VNAMEF=>

Detailed Mother, Single and Multiple Responses by Census Divisions and Census Subdivisions, 2011 Census. 2012. Statistics Canada.

<http://www12.statcan.gc.ca/census-recensement/2011/dp-pd/tbt-tt/Rp-eng.cfm?LANG=E&APATH=3&DETAIL=0&DIM=0&FL=A&FREE=0&GC=0&GID=0&GK=0&GRP=1&PID=103251&PRID=0&PTYPE=101955&S=0&SHOWALL=0&SUB=0&Temporal=2011&THEME=90&VID=0&VNAMEE=&VNAMEF=>

<sup>5</sup> Totals are based on single and multiple language responses. Single language responses refer to respondents who provide one language only and multiple language responses refer to respondents who provide two or more languages.

The following are screen shots of 2 municipalities' web sites capable of language translations that were reviewed.

### City of Toronto Main Page



### City of Toronto main Page in Persian

The screenshot shows a Google Translate interface within a Windows Internet Explorer browser. The browser's address bar displays the URL: `http://translate.google.com/translate?js=n&prev=...&hl=en&ie=UTF-8&layout=2&eof=1&sl=auto&tl=fa&u=http://www.toronto.ca/`. The browser's title bar reads "Google Translate - Windows Internet Explorer provided by City of Hamilton".

The Google Translate interface is set to translate from "Detect language" to "Persian". The "View" options are "Translation" and "Original". The translated content of the City of Toronto website is visible, featuring a search bar and a navigation menu. A dropdown menu is open over the search bar, listing various services in Persian:

- داگن کی ره رهش تامهخ 31 - تورنتو نماس با ما
- نماس با دفتر شهردار
- نماس با انجمن شهر شما
- اتاق خبر
- مکان مرکز مدنی
- شرایط راه و ترافیک
- پیدا کردن کار
- برنامه تقریبی ثبت نام
- تقویم
- شهروستان بودجه
- امور مالی شهروستان
- راه ها و برنامه های TTC
- پرداخت بلیط پارکینگ
- تجدید مجوز پارکینگ
- زباله و بازیافت
- گزارشگری تورنتو

The main content area is divided into three columns:

- LIVING IN TORONTO**: Includes text about finding services and programs.
- VISITING TORONTO**: Includes text about visiting the city, mentioning the TTC and various services.
- ACCESSING CITY HALL**: Includes text about accessing city hall services, mentioning the Mayor's Office and various departments.

The browser's taskbar at the bottom shows the Start button, several open applications (Info for CAR Report.doc, Inbox - Microsoft Outlook, Google Translate), and the system clock showing 1:14 PM.

### City Of Mississauga Main Page (with up to 65 language options)

#### City of Mississauga main page with Language options

The screenshot shows the City of Mississauga website in Internet Explorer. The browser's address bar displays <http://www.mississauga.ca/portal/home>. The website header features the Mississauga logo with the tagline "Leading today for tomorrow" and "Ontario, Canada". Navigation links include "login", "register", "store", and "contact us". A search bar is present with the text "enter search term" and a magnifying glass icon, with "ADVANCED SEARCH" to its right. A "Select Language" dropdown menu is open, displaying a grid of 65 language options. Below the menu are sections for "TOP REQUESTS", "NEWS" (with a "NEWSROOM" button), and "WHAT'S ON" (with an "ALL EVENTS" button). The footer contains links for "Library Services", "Recreation, Swim, Golf, Get Fit", and "Jobs & Careers". The Windows taskbar at the bottom shows the Start button, several open applications, and the system clock at 1:18 PM.

Select Language	Chinese (Simplified)	Galician	Irish	Maltese	Swahili
Afrikaans	Chinese (Traditional)	Georgian	Italian	Norwegian	Swedish
Albanian	Croatian	German	Japanese	Persian	Tamil
Arabic	Czech	Greek	Kannada	Polish	Telugu
Armenian	Danish	Gujarati	Korean	Portuguese	Thai
Azerbaijani	Dutch	Haitian Creole	Lao	Romanian	Turkish
Basque	Esperanto	Hebrew	Latin	Russian	Ukrainian
Belarusian	Estonian	Hindi	Latvian	Serbian	Urdu
Bengali	Filipino	Hungarian	Lithuanian	Slovak	Vietnamese
Bulgarian	Finnish	Icelandic	Macedonian	Slovenian	Welsh
Catalan	French	Indonesian	Malay	Spanish	Yiddish

City of Mississauga main page in Persian

The screenshot shows the City of Mississauga website in Persian. The browser is Windows Internet Explorer, and the address bar shows <http://www.mississauga.ca/portal/home>. The page has a dark blue header with the Mississauga logo and the slogan "Leading today for tomorrow Ontario, Canada". A search bar is located in the top right of the header. Below the header is a navigation menu with links for HOME, CITY HALL, RESIDENTS, BUSINESS, DISCOVER MISSISSAUGA, SERVICES ONLINE, and HELP & FEEDBACK. The main content area features a large red banner for the "MISSISSAUGA BOOK FEST" on Saturday, October 27, from 11 AM to 4:30 PM at the Mississauga Central Library. To the left of the banner are three news items: "پاییز برنا" (Autumn Program), "کتاب جشنواره 2012" (2012 Book Festival), and "ساخت و ساز پروژه BRT" (BRT Project Construction). At the bottom of the page, there are three buttons: "درخواست ها بالا" (Request Up), "اخبار" (News), and "آنچه در همه رویدادها" (What's in all events). The footer contains the URL <http://www.mississauga.ca/portal/home#tab1> and the Windows taskbar shows the Start button, several open applications, and the system clock at 1:20 PM.



**RACIAL EQUITY TRAINING ATTENDANCE SUMMARY**

**PREPARED BY ACCESS AND EQUITY OFFICE**

**CORPORATE SERVICES**

**October, 2012**

**Racial Equity Training Attendance Summaries: By Department****City Council Racial Equity Training Summary**

	<b>Total Department Staff</b>	<b>Total Staff Completed</b>	<b>Total Managers Completed</b>	<b>Total</b>
		<b>#</b>	<b>#</b>	<b>#</b>
<b>Module A</b>		0	1	<b>1</b>
<b>Module AB</b>		4	1	<b>5</b>
<b>Module B</b>		0	1	<b>1</b>
<b>Module C</b>		2	1	<b>3</b>
<b>Module D</b>		0	0	<b>0</b>
<b>Module E</b>		0	0	<b>0</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>56</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>10</b>

**City Manager's Office Department Racial Equity Training Summary**

	<b>Total Department Staff</b>	<b>Total Staff Completed</b>	<b>Total Managers Completed</b>	<b>Total</b>
		<b>#</b>	<b>#</b>	<b>#</b>
<b>Module A</b>		0	3	<b>3</b>
<b>Module AB</b>		25	6	<b>31</b>
<b>Module B</b>		0	3	<b>3</b>
<b>Module C</b>		1	2	<b>3</b>
<b>Module D</b>		1	2	<b>3</b>
<b>Module E</b>		0	1	<b>1</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>114</b>	<b>27</b>	<b>17</b>	<b>44</b>

**Community Services Department Racial Equity Training Summary**

	Total Department Staff	Total Staff Completed	Total Managers Completed	Total
		#	#	#
Module A		12	4	16
Module AB		283	28	311
Module B		11	3	14
Module C		7	8	15
Module D		5	3	8
Module E		2	1	3
<b>Total</b>	<b>3,073</b>	<b>320</b>	<b>47</b>	<b>367</b>

**Corporate Services Racial Equity Training Department Summary**

	Total Department Staff	Total Staff Completed	Total Managers Completed	Total
		#	#	#
Module A		12	7	19
Module AB		97	10	107
Module B		10	9	19
Module C		8	13	21
Module D		0	7	7
Module E		0	3	3
<b>Total</b>	<b>313</b>	<b>127</b>	<b>49</b>	<b>176</b>

**Emergency Medical Services Department Racial Equity Training Summary**

	Total Department Staff	Total Staff Completed	Total Managers Completed	Total
		#	#	#
Module A		0	2	2
Module AB		7	3	10
Module B		0	1	1
Module C		0	2	2
Module D		0	0	0
Module E		0	0	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>1,097</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>15</b>

**Retirees Racial Equity Training Summary**

	Total Department Staff	Total Staff Completed	Total Managers Completed	Total
		#	#	#
Module A		4	1	5
Module AB		23	6	29
Module B		4	1	5
Module C		0	2	2
Module D		0	0	0
Module E		0	0	0
<b>Total</b>	n/a	<b>31</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>41</b>

**Planning & Economic Development Department Racial Equity Training Summary**

	Total Department Staff	Total Staff Completed	Total Managers Completed	Total
		#	#	#
Module A		14	8	22
Module AB		79	20	99
Module B		9	8	17
Module C		0	15	15
Module D		0	8	8
Module E		0	8	8
<b>Total</b>	<b>680</b>	<b>102</b>	<b>67</b>	<b>169</b>

**Public Health Department Racial Equity Training Summary**

	Total Department Staff	Total Staff Completed	Total Managers Completed	Total
		#	#	#
Module A		18	3	21
Module AB		73	8	81
Module B		11	1	12
Module C		1	2	3
Module D		1	2	3
Module E		0	1	1
<b>Total</b>	<b>469</b>	<b>104</b>	<b>17</b>	<b>121</b>

**Public Works Department Racial Equity Training Summary**

	<b>Total Department Staff</b>	<b>Total Staff Completed</b>	<b>Total Managers Completed</b>	<b>Total</b>
		<b>#</b>	<b>#</b>	<b>#</b>
<b>Module A</b>		42	20	<b>62</b>
<b>Module AB</b>		518	146	<b>664</b>
<b>Module B</b>		34	15	<b>49</b>
<b>Module C</b>		12	55	<b>67</b>
<b>Module D</b>		2	0	<b>2</b>
<b>Module E</b>		0	0	<b>0</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>2,238</b>	<b>608</b>	<b>236</b>	<b>844</b>

**Temporary Worker Pool Racial Equity Training Summary**

	<b>Total Department Staff</b>	<b>Total Staff Completed</b>	<b>Total Managers Completed</b>	<b>Total</b>
		<b>#</b>	<b>#</b>	<b>#</b>
<b>Module A</b>		0	0	<b>0</b>
<b>Module AB</b>		1	0	<b>1</b>
<b>Module B</b>		0	0	<b>0</b>
<b>Module C</b>		0	0	<b>0</b>
<b>Module D</b>		0	0	<b>0</b>
<b>Module E</b>		0	0	<b>0</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>1</b>

**HECFI Racial Equity Training Summary**

	Total Department Staff	Total Staff Completed	Total Managers Completed	Total
		#	#	#
Module A		1	2	3
Module AB		2	0	2
Module B		0	2	2
Module C		0	1	1
Module D		0	0	0
Module E		0	0	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>847</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>8</b>

**Hamilton Public Library Racial Equity Training Summary**

	Total Department Staff	Total Staff Completed	Total Managers Completed	Total
		#	#	#
Module A		1	3	4
Module AB		2	0	2
Module B		2	3	5
Module C		1	0	1
Module D		0	0	0
Module E		0	0	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>508</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>12</b>

**Police Services Racial Equity Training Summary**

	Total Department Staff	Total Staff Completed	Total Managers Completed	Total
		#	#	#
Module A		1	0	1
Module AB		1	0	1
Module B		1	0	1
Module C		1	0	1
Module D		0	0	0
Module E		0	0	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>1,213</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>4</b>