

# CITY OF HAMILTON CITY MANAGER'S OFFICE Audit Services Division

| то:                | Chair and Members Audit, Finance and Administration Committee                             |
|--------------------|---|
| COMMITTEE DATE:    | February 10, 2014   |
| SUBJECT/REPORT NO: | Audit Report 2013-12 - Public Works - Food Services (Golf Courses) (AUD14004) (City Wide) |
| WARD(S) AFFECTED:  | City Wide   |
| PREPARED BY:       | Ann Pekaruk 905-546-2424 x4469  |
| SUBMITTED BY:      | Ann Pekaruk Director, Audit Services City Manager's Office                                |
| SIGNATURE:         |   |

#### **RECOMMENDATION**

- (a) That the Management Action Plans as detailed in Appendix "A" of Report AUD14004 be approved; and
- (b) That the General Manager of Public Works be directed to instruct the appropriate staff to have the Management Action Plans (attached as Appendix "A" to Report AUD14004) implemented.

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

The 2013 Internal Audit work plan approved by Council included an audit of Food Services (Golf Courses). The audit included a review of cash collection, handling and balancing processes to ensure controls are adequate and revenue is properly accounted for. Segregation of duties, physical security over inventory and cash and their reconciliation processes were assessed. Recommendations were made to strengthen internal controls, safeguard assets and identify opportunities for administrative efficiencies.

The results of the audit are presented in a formal Audit Report (2013-12) containing observations, recommendations and management responses. Audit Report 2013-12 is attached as Appendix "A" to Report AUD14004.

Alternatives for Consideration – Not Applicable

FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS (for recommendation(s) only)

# SUBJECT: Audit Report 2013-12 - Public Works - Food Services (Golf Courses) (AUD14004) (City Wide) - Page 2 of 4

Financial: Tighter controls and management oversight over inventory may result in

lower costs.

Staffing: None. Legal: None.

## **HISTORICAL BACKGROUND (Chronology of events)**

The audit was scheduled as part of the 2013 Internal Audit work plan approved by Council. The audit fieldwork was completed in November 2013. The results of this audit are attached as Appendix "A" of Report AUD14004.

The Audit, Finance and Administration Committee receives and approves final audit and review reports as part of its responsibilities for the oversight of governance and control.

#### POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENTS

City of Hamilton Procurement Policy (By-law 12-255)

#### **RELEVANT CONSULTATION**

Appendix "A" to Report AUD14004 includes action plans which reflect the responses of management responsible for the administration of food services at the City's golf courses, i.e. the Corporate Assets and Strategic Planning Division of the Public Works Department.

# ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION (Include Performance Measurement/Benchmarking Data if applicable)

The Corporate Assets and Strategic Planning Division of Public Works administers and maintains food services at the City's two golf courses.

Revenue is generated through food services provided through the clubhouse restaurants, course food and beverage carts (Chedoke also has a snack bar on the course), vending machines and special events catering. For the period April 1 – August 31, 2013, the revenue earned totalled approximately \$388,000 (\$180,450 at Chedoke and \$207,410 at King's Forest).

Both golf courses accept payment in the form of cash, cheques, debit and credit cards, with cash accounting for the largest portion of the receipts. Sales are recorded through Jencess registers at each location. Revenues from the clubhouse are recorded as transactions occur while food and beverage cart revenues are entered into Jencess at the end of the shift.

# SUBJECT: Audit Report 2013-12 - Public Works - Food Services (Golf Courses) (AUD14004) (City Wide) - Page 3 of 4

The Chief Cook of each golf course orders all inventory directly to the golf club on a weekly basis. Inventory includes food, alcoholic and non-alcoholic beverages and confectionary items such as candy and chips.

The audit focused on controls relating to revenue received from food services, reconciliation of inventory expenditures and the catering billing and collection processes.

The audit identified opportunities to improve controls, strengthen managerial oversight, enhance physical security over funds and inventory and increase the effectiveness of various reconciliation processes.

A formal Audit Report (2013-12) containing observations, recommendations and resulting management action plans was issued. Twenty-three recommendations were included in Audit Report 2013-12 (attached as Appendix "A" of Report AUD14004).

Among the recommendations are:

- Developing and implementing cash handling and inventory management procedures;
- Implementing time or dollar value thresholds to trigger timely deposits;
- Maintaining adequate records to support cash and revenue reconciliations;
- Complying with the City's procurement policies in the purchase of alcohol inventory;
- Controlling and reconciling inventories with adequate follow up of reported waste and variances and signing-off of documentation by management;
- Accounting for inventory and sales recorded by the food and beverage carts and snack bar; and
- Formalizing catering agreements and tracking catering activity.

Audit Services conducted this audit in conformity with the *Internal Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing*. These standards require that Audit Services plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to support the findings and conclusions based on the audit objectives. Audit Services believes that the work performed provides a reasonable basis for the audit findings and conclusions.

#### **ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION**

(Include Financial, Staffing, Legal and Policy Implications and Pros and Cons for each alternative)

Not applicable.

# SUBJECT: Audit Report 2013-12 - Public Works - Food Services (Golf Courses) (AUD14004) (City Wide) - Page 4 of 4

#### **ALIGNMENT TO THE 2012 – 2015 STRATEGIC PLAN**

## Strategic Priority #2

Valued & Sustainable Services

WE deliver high quality services that meet citizen needs and expectations, in a cost effective and responsible manner.

## **Strategic Objective**

2.1 Implement processes to improve services, leverage technology and validate cost effectiveness and efficiencies across the Corporation.

### Strategic Priority #3

Leadership & Governance

WE work together to ensure we are a government that is respectful towards each other and that the community has confidence and trust in.

### **Strategic Objective**

3.4 Enhance opportunities for administrative and operational efficiencies.

#### APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix "A" to Report AUD14004

ap:jg

# CITY OF HAMILTON INTERNAL AUDIT REPORT 2013-12 PUBLIC WORKS – FOOD SERVICES (GOLF COURSES)

| #  | OBSERVATIONS OF EXISTING SYSTEM   | RECOMMENDATION FOR STRENGTHENING SYSTEM   | MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN   |
|----|---|---|--|
| 1. | Procedures There are no documented policies and procedures in place to provide detailed instruction regarding how cash, revenue and inventory should be handled and reconciled at the City's golf courses.  When written procedures are lacking documentation on current practices, employees use personal understanding and experience to carry out duties which could result in incorrect, incomplete or inconsistent application. It would | That management develop, approve and implement cash handling and inventory management procedures. The procedures should be reviewed annually by management and bear evidence of such review (sign-off). | Agreed. There is an older Cash Handling Procedures document from when Golf was part of Recreation. The Cash Handling policy is currently being revised at the corporate level. Once completed, the policy will be adopted by the golf course management.  Golf course management will also develop inventory management procedures and will review them yearly for any necessary |
|    | also be problematic and inefficient for the successor to commence his/her duties within a short period of time.   |   | changes. The expected completion date is mid 2014.   |

| #  | OBSERVATIONS OF EXISTING SYSTEM   | RECOMMENDATION FOR STRENGTHENING SYSTEM | MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN   |
|----|---|---|--|
| 2. | <ul> <li>Timely Deposit of Funds</li> <li>Daily deposits of cash and cheques from revenues collected are retained in the safe at the golf courses until deposited at the bank. A review of deposits from June 2013 identified:</li> <li>Average deposits of \$9,400, including four days sales at King's Forest;</li> <li>Average deposits of \$7,500 including five days sales at Chedoke; and</li> <li>Two instances at King's Forest of daily deposits exceeding \$10,000 and taking six days to be deposited in the City's bank account.</li> </ul> | That time or dollar value thresholds    | Agreed. The normal days to do deposits have always been on Monday and Friday. Wednesday will be added as a third deposit                   |
|    | Cash kept on site for long periods before being deposited in the bank provides the opportunity for misappropriation, lapping or theft of funds.   |   |  |
|    | In addition, at Chedoke, deposit slips were not used in sequential order. When deposit slips are not used in sequence, there is no ready confirmation that all deposits have been accounted for and the time spent accounting for missing or outstanding deposits increases.  |   | Agreed. Deposits slips will be watched to make sure the next deposit book selected is in the correct order. It will begin January 1, 2014. |

| #  | ODSEDVATIONS OF EVICTING SYSTEM  | RECOMMENDATION FOR   | MANACEMENT ACTION DI ANI  |
|----|--|--|---|
| 3. | Safeguarding Cash The Clubhouse Supervisor and two Servers at Chedoke have access to the top portion of the safe. In addition to the extra change float to which the Servers require access when the Clubhouse Supervisor is not present, the revenues awaiting deposit and the petty cash are also stored in the top portion of the safe.  When unnecessary staff have access to reconciled revenues awaiting deposit or petty cash funds, the risk of misappropriation is increased. | in a locked box in the bottom portion of the safe. Access to revenues awaiting deposit and petty cash should be restricted to the Clubhouse Supervisor.    | Agreed. To be implemented beginning January 1, 2014.  |
| 4. | Void / Refund Documentation Refund and void transactions are not being reviewed by management. No reason is provided by staff who enter void and refund transactions. The risk of fictitious refunds or voids is increased as there is no documentation to support the transaction. An opportunity exists to process a void or refund for cash to offset misappropriated funds.  | and implement a refund policy. All voids and refund transactions should be supported with adequate documentation and reasons and approved by the Clubhouse | Agreed. Refunds are minimal in golf operations (\$165 during the 2013 test period at King's Forest). Tighter controls will be implemented by requiring staff to include a copy of the refund in the deposit envelope along with a reason for the refund. These will be attached to the copy of the Pay Type Summary and reviewed when the daily balancing is completed by the supervisor. To be completed by March 1, 2014. |

|    |  | RECOMMENDATION FOR               |   |
|----|--|----------------------------------|---|
| #  | OBSERVATIONS OF EXISTING SYSTEM                  | STRENGTHENING SYSTEM             | MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN  |
|    | Records Retention / Review - Cash and            |                                  |   |
| 5. | Revenues   |                                  |   |
|    | Documents used by staff to record and            | _                                | , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,   |
|    | reconcile cash and revenues are not              | adequate records to support the  |   |
|    | consistently retained or signed off by           | cash and revenue reconciliations |   |
|    | management. The following documents are          | processes and ensure adequate    | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·   |
|    | not consistently retained and it could not be    |                                  | the entire year.  |
|    | determined if they were signed off by staff and  | documentation.                   | Deposit anyelenes which are used by the   |
|    | reviewed by management: - Daily Cash Envelopes   |                                  | Deposit envelopes, which are used by the supervisor to verify the deposit, will also be |
|    | - Beverage Cart Daily Inventory Control          |                                  | kept for a period of one year. This will begin  |
|    | Sheets   |                                  | March 1, 2014.  |
|    | - HW (Halfway House) Daily Inventory             |                                  | 19101111, 2014.   |
|    | Control Sheets                                   |                                  | The Pay Type Summary Report is  |
|    | G 0.1.1. G. 1.3.3.1.                             |                                  | completed after the fact by the Supervisor  |
|    | In addition, the Pay-Type Summary Report         |                                  | in order to balance the day's sales which is  |
|    | does not bear evidence of management review      |                                  | evidence of review. At that time, the   |
|    | of cash and revenues reconciliation.             |                                  | completed and initialed deposit slip is   |
|    |  |                                  | attached to the summary. Moving forward,  |
|    | Audit Services could not fully test the accuracy |                                  | the Pay Type Summary Report will also be  |
|    | and completeness of cash and revenues as         |                                  | initialed. This report is sent downtown to the  |
|    | supporting documentation was not available.      |                                  | FA. This report is run after the day being  |
|    | Without proper supporting records and sign-off,  |                                  | reviewed and cannot be altered in any way.  |
|    | there is no adequate evidence of management      |                                  | Management does review the Pay Type   |
|    | review of key cash and revenue reconciliations   |                                  | Summary on a daily basis.   |
|    | for accuracy and completeness.                   |                                  |   |

|    |  | RECOMMENDATION FOR                |  |
|----|--|-----------------------------------|--|
| #  | OBSERVATIONS OF EXISTING SYSTEM  | STRENGTHENING SYSTEM              | MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN   |
|    | Alcohol Purchasing   |                                   |  |
| 6. | Three alcohol inventory purchases were   |                                   | Agreed. This has been addressed by a PO  |
|    | identified as violations to the City of Hamilton's   |                                   | system put in place this year for the first  |
|    | Procurement Policy By-Law No. 12-155 as they   |                                   | time ever in golf operations where   |
|    | were made through unauthorized vendors.  |                                   | purchases are tracked within the business  |
|    |  | vendors.                          | unit.  |
|    | In addition, alcohol inventory purchases are not tracked and amounts are not applied against the purchase order in PeopleSoft. | tracked to ensure they are within | Agreed. The FA will deplete all POs as purchases are made in order to ensure purchases are within the POs' limits. To be completed by March 1, 2014. |
|    | Without proper tracking of alcohol inventory   |                                   |  |
|    | purchases, the risk of inventory ordered in  |                                   |  |
|    | excess of authorized PO limits is increased.   |                                   |  |

| #  | OBSERVATIONS OF EXISTING SYSTEM  | RECOMMENDATION FOR STRENGTHENING SYSTEM  | MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN   |
|----|--|--|--|
| 7. | Inventory Reconciliation The City's golf courses currently use Jencess to process sales of various food and beverage inventory items. Golf course inventory is being counted regularly for reordering purposes but is not reconciled against usage. Audit Services prepared a reconciliation of beer inventory from April 1 – September 29, 2013 at Chedoke Golf Course. Sales in Jencess were higher than expected by 387 premium cans and lower than expected by 407 domestic cans. This was explained as a result of Servers incorrectly selling a domestic brand but recording it as premium in error. This error went undetected as inventory reconciliations were not performed. | That inventory reconciliations be prepared regularly and thresholds set for acceptable variances. Variances beyond this level should be followed up by management with required corrections or explanations of differences documented. | Agreed. As suggested during the audit, the Jencess PO system will be used to receive pre-packaged ready sale items into the on hand counts. During the weekly physical counts, these counts will be compared to the Jencess on hand counts and any areas of concern will be identified and dealt with. To be completed by March 1, 2014.   |
|    | Records of counts are not consistently retained and individual items are not always counted (i.e. beer is counted by the case at King's Forest) making inventory reconciliations of other items not possible. Counts are not signed off by staff performing them to provide accountability.  The City's risk of misappropriation of inventory going undetected increases when inventory is not reconciled to usage. The completeness and accuracy of inventory counts cannot be confirmed and variances are not investigated.  | That individual inventory items be counted, counts be signed off and all count records be retained by the Clubhouse Supervisor.  | Agreed. Inventory items are counted weekly for new orders to be placed, to compare purchases vs sales and to verify that the margin is within an acceptable tolerance which will be formally established in the inventory management procedures being developed in #1. The count sheets will be modified to include a column for initials of the person counting and retained by the Supervisor. To be completed by March 1, 2014. |

|    |   | DECOMMENDATION FOR  |  |
|----|---|---|--|
| #  | OBSERVATIONS OF EXISTING SYSTEM   | RECOMMENDATION FOR STRENGTHENING SYSTEM   | MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN   |
| 8. | Jencess Inventory Reconciliation The Jencess System used at the City's golf courses to process transactions is not being fully utilized. This system has the ability to track single sale inventory items (i.e. canned beer, chips, pop) and provide on hand totals to be used in performing inventory counts.  In addition to Jencess sales not being reconciled to amounts used (as noted in #7), inventory received is not entered into Jencess. Without fully utilizing the Jencess system, it cannot be used to monitor inventory and review items quickly to determine if reordering is required instead of performing a full count. Utilizing capabilities in Jencess will also make the inventory counts and reconciliation processes more efficient. | That all single sale inventory items be recorded in Jencess upon receipt. Inventory counts should be compared to Jencess and variances and waste adjusted regularly in Jencess by the Clubhouse Supervisor. | Agreed. All single sale items are already in the Jencess system but the system has not been utilized as a perpetual inventory system, (its PO System). Instead, the system has been allowed to count the quantities sold and these amounts have been used to compare against the purchases in order to ensure our margins within an acceptable tolerance. Moving forward, all purchases of pre-packaged supplies will be input into Jencess for single sale items which will allow management to see, at any given time, what on hand inventories should be when physical counts are conducted. The on hand inventory will be adjusted for items, like waste, as required. To be completed by March 1, 2014. |
|    | Bulk inventory (i.e. draft beer, liquor, various ingredients in restaurant meals – chicken, French fries) cannot be reconciled in Jencess. These items are not being reconciled against usage increasing the risk of misappropriation of inventory going undetected   | inventory items be reviewed and documented regularly to determine that bulk inventory usage is  | Agreed. A sample of higher value bulk inventory items will be reviewed and documented regularly to determine that bulk inventory usage is plausible and in line with yield expectations which will be determined in the inventory management procedures being developed in #1. To be completed by March 1, 2014.   |

| #  | OBSERVATIONS OF EXISTING SYSTEM  | RECOMMENDATION FOR STRENGTHENING SYSTEM  | MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN   |
|----|--|--|--|
| 9. | Inventory Waste Clubhouse Waste Sheets at King's Forest require a reason for the waste to be provided. However, they are not consistently signed by staff incurring the waste. No reasons were provided for waste from the food and beverage carts at King's Forest and Chedoke and no documentation was available for review from the halfway house at Chedoke. | That Inventory Waste Sheets, Beverage Cart Daily Inventory Control Sheets and HW Daily Inventory Control Sheets be modified to include an area for providing a reason for the waste. These documents should consistently be signed off by staff incurring the waste. | reason will be added to the control sheets and the documents will be checked to verify they are signed off by staff. Where ever possible, the evidence of the waste will be presented to a second staff to verify. To be completed by March 1, 2014. |
|    | For waste sheets that were available, there was no evidence that they had been reviewed or that significant waste had been authorization by management. For example, at Chedoke 49 domestic beer cans were indicated as moldy and disposed of without evidence of authorization.   | That management develop guidelines for when management authorization and signoff is required for significant waste.  | added for waste sheets to be signed at the   |
|    | When all inventory waste is not adequately tracked or reviewed, efforts cannot be made to identify and minimize waste. Without management monitoring and authorizing unusual or significant instances, recording of variances as waste can mask misappropriation of inventory items.   | That inventory waste be regularly monitored by the Clubhouse Supervisor.   | ,  |

|     |  | RECOMMENDATION FOR   |  |
|-----|--|--|--|
| #   | OBSERVATIONS OF EXISTING SYSTEM  | STRENGTHENING SYSTEM   | MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN   |
| 10. | Inventory Oversight Inventory removed from stock for sale on the food and beverage carts and amounts returned at the end of the shift require the initials of the Servers and a second staff member on the Beverage Cart Daily Inventory Control Sheet as verification of the amounts taken / returned. During the month of August, there were three instances at Chedoke and ten instances at King's Forest of inventory being taken or returned without proper control sheet signoff by a second staff member. | That all inventory taken for sale on the food and beverage carts have a second staff initial for verification on the Beverage Cart Daily Inventory Control Sheet. Management should follow up on non-compliance. | required and will be closely monitored by the Supervisor/Chief Cook to ensure initialing is always happening. To be  |
|     | Inventory removed for sale through the halfway house at Chedoke did not require signoff of the control sheet by a second staff for verification until September 2013. There was insufficient information available to verify if this requirement is currently being met.  When a second staff member does not verify inventory taken and returned, the Server has the opportunity to manipulate documentation, conceal shortages and misappropriate inventory.   | the halfway house be recorded on<br>the HW Daily Inventory Control<br>Sheet and a second staff initial the<br>sheet as verification. Management<br>should follow up on non-compliance.                           | Chedoke has already adopted the same method used for the beverage carts for inventory taken for sale. Compliance with the procedure will be routinely checked. |

|    |   | RECOMMENDATION FOR   |  |
|----|---|--|--|
| #  | OBSERVATIONS OF EXISTING SYSTEM   | STRENGTHENING SYSTEM   | MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN                   |
| 11 | Inventory Sales Inventory sales calculated by Servers on the Beverage Cart Daily Inventory Control Sheets for amounts sold from the cart do not match sales recorded in Jencess. This is primarily the result of the cost of items charged to the customer not including HST, including HST at the wrong rate or the prices of items in Jencess not matching prices on the Control Sheets. These differences are offset by Servers' tips. At Chedoke, the sale quantities of four items over a one week period were input into Jencess at a lower amount by Servers so that there would not be an effect on tips earned.  When all sales are not recorded in the register as determined/reconciled on the Control Sheets, revenues in the financial records will not be appropriately reflected and inventory will not reconcile. | customer and costs in Jencess be adjusted as required to match the price of all items sold through the cart and halfway house.  That the Jencess transaction receipt be included in the DCE, matched to the calculated sales on the Beverage Cart / HW Daily Inventory Control Sheets and be reviewed by | be matched as closely as possible to the |

|     |   | RECOMMENDATION FOR   |  |
|-----|---|--|--|
| #   | OBSERVATIONS OF EXISTING SYSTEM   | STRENGTHENING SYSTEM   | MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN   |
| 12. | Catering Agreements There is no formal document or contract signed by a customer entering into a catering agreement. All correspondence regarding costs and services to be provided are agreed to via email.  When there is no signed agreement in place, the City is at risk of financial loss if there are disputes or the customer decides to cancel the event at the last minute. Any terms may become unenforceable. | implement the use of a catering contract. This contact should detail the services to be provided and the cost and be signed by both the customer and Food Services management. | contract has already been created and will be used in 2014 with both parties signing it. |

|     |   | RECOMMENDATION FOR   |  |
|-----|---|--|--|
| #   | OBSERVATIONS OF EXISTING SYSTEM   | STRENGTHENING SYSTEM   | MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN                       |
| 13. | Catering Revenue The Clubhouse Supervisor prepares the invoice for catering events, collects payment from the customer, processes the payment through Jencess and deposits the payment in the City bank account. Catering revenue is not recorded until payment is received. In reviewing seven functions, two had revenues recorded in a period subsequent to when they occurred and payment was received for one that no invoice had been prepared. In addition, billings and collection do not flow through the City's Accounts Receivable process.  The lack of segregation of duties and the non-recording of amounts owing for catering services in the City's financial records increase the risk of catering revenue being misappropriated, being incorrectly reflected in the City's financial reports or its collection being missed. | That pre-numbered catering contracts, invoices and details of payments be provided to a secondary staff member for review to ensure all events have been billed and payments collected. This individual should maintain a listing of all events, outstanding amounts and follow up with the Clubhouse Supervisor, as required. In this manner, a record of catering activity and accounts receivable would be maintained by a party other than the Clubhouse Supervisor, providing a better segregation of duties. | Agreed. The FA will track catering activity. |

# CITY OF HAMILTON INTERNAL AUDIT REPORT 2013-12 PUBLIC WORKS – FOOD SERVICES (GOLF COURSES)

The following items were noted during the course of the audit. Although they do not present internal control deficiencies, they are indicated in this Addendum so management is aware of the issues and can address them appropriately.

#### Floats

 Cash floats are not regularly reconciled to the ledger and amounts are not confirmed with the cash custodian to ensure floats are still intact. Cash floats differed from the general ledger by \$209.10 as HST was taken on the cheque to issue the Chedoke floats in error. This was not identified as floats are not regularly reconciled.

#### It is recommended:

That cash floats be reconciled and confirmed to be intact at least quarterly.

## Management Response:

Agreed. While the section was previously under Recreation, quarterly float reports were prepared and submitted. This practice will resume again with the FA in Public Works. Implementation date: January 2014.

#### **Petty Cash**

2. Petty cash floats of \$500 at Chedoke and \$200 at King's Forest were not used during the 2013 season indicating the petty cash floats at each course may be too large. More cash is on hand than required for daily operations, increasing the risk of misappropriation.

#### It is recommended:

That petty cash floats be reduced and funds deposited back into the City bank account.

#### Management Response:

Agreed. The amount of petty cash will be reduced moving forward into 2014.