



Hamilton

## **MINUTES**

### **Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee**

**Thursday, January 20, 2011**

**12:00 noon, Room 816**

**Hamilton City Hall**

**71 Main Street West**

---

**Present:**

A. French (Chair)

A. Denham-Robinson (Vice Chair)

Councillors L. Ferguson, B. McHattie and M. Pearson

M. Adkins, A. Charlton, M. Kirk, S. Nowak, R. Simpson,

S. Stewart-Greene, K. Wakeman, S. Wray

**Absent with**

**Regrets:**

G. Zajac (personal commitment)

**Also Present:**

D. Cuming, Senior Project Manager, Heritage and Urban Design

M. House, Cultural Heritage Planner

J. Muller, Cultural Heritage Planner

R. Tanna, Assistant Cultural Heritage Planner – Student

A. Rawlings, Legislative Coordinator

C. Newman, Legislative Assistant, City Clerk's Office

Chair French acknowledged co-op student Rahul Tanna's first meeting with the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee. Mr. Tanna gave a brief introduction and thanked the Chair for welcoming him.

#### **1. CHANGES TO THE AGENDA (Item 1)**

The Clerk advised of the following changes to the agenda:

- (i) Additional information respecting item 8.1; Draft Copy of HMHC Annual Report.
- (ii) Additional information respecting item 9.2 (a)
  - Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.
  - Draft Motion from the Chair.
- (iii) OMB decision regarding Hatt-Cooley cemetery item 10.5

The documents have been distributed to all members of the committee today.

**(Kirk/Charlton)**

That the agenda be approved, as amended.

**CARRIED**

**2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST (Item 2)**

None declared.

**3. DELEGATION REQUESTS/DELEGATIONS/PRESENTATIONS (Item 3)**

- (a) Presentation by Robin McKee, respecting his request for heritage designation of his property. (Delegation approved by Committee on December 16, 2010) (Item 3.1)**

Mr. McKee gave a presentation to the Committee respecting his designation requests for two heritage properties. His points included but were not limited to the following;

- Mr. McKee is a local historian who owns two heritage properties in the City.
- His priority today is to discuss the heritage designation application respecting 262 MacNab Street North.
- Mr. McKee would like to have the priority list of designation amended in order to have 262 MacNab Street North given a higher priority than 2014
- The process for designation is very long. He indicated that it will take six years for designation from the time the application was submitted.
- Mr. McKee felt that privately owned locations should be expedited

- in comparison with publicly owned or City owned properties.
- Mr. McKee indicated that he had tried to expedite the process but had been unsuccessful.

In Mr. McKee's concluding remarks, he stated that the list of properties was to be amended. Staff member Meghan House indicated that Mr. McKee's property would be eligible for designation in 2013 as two properties above his request (Chedoke House and RCAF 447) will have to be removed from the designation list.

Committee members inquired about the following;

Ms. Wakeman enquired if using research provided by Mr. McKee or volunteers would help to expedite the process. Ms. House stated that research had already been compiled on 262 MacNab Street North.

Councilor McHattie asked staff if the Committee has a role in developing the designation list or revising it. Ms. House stated that staff does develop the list and that they currently have criteria in place for developing the priority list. With respect to City owned properties, Ms. House indicated that if they were not in distress they were lower down on the list. Ms. House thanked the Committee for their suggestions as staff is always looking to improve their procedures. Councilor McHattie felt it was dangerous precedent to move properties up and down the priority list considering the current policy gives importance to threatened properties.

For Clarification Chair French indicated that the Committee can advise staff, not tell them what to do.

Ms. Wakeman asked if the students could perform research to expedite the process. Mr. Cuming stated that co-op students do not have the historical research background to assist in the process. Mr. Cuming stated that it is staff's responsibility to establish the working process and work with the funds and resources available. The research involved is very specific. Many designations from the 1980's, for instance, are composed of three lines which would not be acceptable today. To comply with the current Act and regulations some cultural heritage assessment reports that support designations can be 40 or more pages in length.

Ms. Stewart-Green stated to Committee that the designation process is very slow and can become quite discouraging for applicants. This was followed up by Councilor McHattie stating that the list for designation was quite long.

**(Pearson/Stewart-Greene)**

That Robin McKee's presentation, be received.

**CARRIED**

**4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item 4)**

- (a)** Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee Minutes, dated December 16, 2010 (Item 4.1)

**(Kirk/Nowak)**

That the Minutes of the December 16, 2010 meeting, of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee be approved, as presented.

**CARRIED**

**5. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES (Item 5)**

None

**6. HERITAGE PERMIT APPLICATIONS (Item 6)**

**(a) Delegated Approvals (Item 6.1):**

- (i) Heritage Permit Application (temporary roofing and chimney removal) 25 Tecumseh Street, Hamilton, Gardener's Cottage (Ward 1) (Item 6.1.1)
- (ii) Heritage Permit Application (front hall walls and ceiling restoration) 600 York Boulevard, Hamilton, Dundurn Castle (Ward 1) (Item 6.1.2)
- (iii) Heritage Permit Application (removal of vinyl siding, refinishing existing wood siding, and installation of new cedar shingles) 93 Mill Street South, Waterdown, Mill Street Heritage Conservation District (Ward 15) (Item 6.1.3)
- (iv) Heritage Permit Application (window and door replacement or retrofit and replacement of cedar shingles) 268 James Street South, Hamilton, Charles Counsell House, By-law No. 86-313 (Ward 2) (Item 6.1.4)

**(Adkins/Stewart-Greene)**

That Items 6(a)(i) to 6(a)(iv) be received.

**CARRIED**

**7. HERITAGE PROPERTY DESIGNATIONS**

None

**8. DISCUSSION ITEMS (Item 8)**

**(a) Draft Copy of HMHC Annual Report. (no copy) (A. French) (Item 8.1)**

Chair French deferred the issue to Ms. Denham-Robinson who presented the HMHC Annual Report in principle to Committee. The purpose of the document is to give an idea of the scope of work done by Committee. Ms. Denham-Robinson indicated that this is a report in principle and that suggestions and minor revisions are welcomed.

**(Denham-Robinson/Wray)**

That the HMHC Annual Report be approved in principle and subject to minor revisions.

**CARRIED**

**(b) Update on 2010 Heritage Property Awards. (verbal update) (A. French) (Item 8.2)**

Chair French let Committee know that the Heritage Property Awards were scheduled for February 15, 2011 at 6:30 p.m. at City Hall. Chair French indicated that invitations have gone out to the Mayor, City Councillors and property owners. The Mayor has confirmed his attendance and will assist with the handing out of awards. Invitations will be going out shortly to attendees, which include the Hamilton Historical Board, other historical and cultural organizations, and to the Culture Department at the City of Hamilton. Seven awards will be handed out covering locations in all areas of the City. Mr. French acknowledge that all locations are very deserving, but would like more resources to expand the number of awards given.

**(Wray/Nowak)**

That the update respecting the Heritage Property Awards be received.

**CARRIED**

**(c) Heritage Permit respecting 183 St Clair Blvd. (verbal update)  
(J. Muller) (Item 8.3)**

Mr. Muller stated that no fruitful outcome has occurred with the parties involved. In December the property owner was issued a summons to appear for a February court date.

**(Adkins/Wray)**

That the update respecting Heritage Permit respecting 183 St Clair Blvd be received.

**CARRIED**

**(d) Selection process. (no copy) (A. Rawlings) (Item 8.4)**

Ms. Rawlings, Legislative Coordinator with the Office of the City Clerk spoke to Committee regarding the Agencies, Boards and Committees selection process. Ms. Rawlings deferred to Councillor McHattie on the matter. Councillor McHattie indicated that committees have not gotten involved in the process of member selection. He stated that selection can be a hit and miss process but wants to put in measure to insure that the best candidates are selected. Councillor McHattie suggested that he would like the Committee to assist with the development of questions that may be used for the selection process.

Ms. Rawlings indicated that all members of Committee were somewhat familiar with the interview and selection process. A new term of Council means that all subcommittees will have new membership. Ms. Rawlings explained that the City places advertisements in newspapers, and on the Cities website to notify people about the application process. Interested parties are required to fill out application forms. We have received a great number of applications in this recruitment. Ms. Rawlings indicated that this was a positive sign. After amalgamation the City had put out advertisements for citizen involvement in committees but only received a small number of applications. Clerk's staff provides the necessary administration to organize the applications for the selection process.

Ms. Rawlings stated that the selection process will not take place until March and that everyone is still being considered. The goal is to have an open and transparent process while still maintaining a level of confidentiality. The purpose of Committees is to make recommendations which are then put through the legislative process.

Mr. Nowak asked if all applicants receive an interview. Ms. Rawlings indicated that the Selection Committee decides who will be interviewed based on a number of factors.

Councillor McHattie proposed that a subcommittee be formed to assist in the developing of questions for the Selection Subcommittee and indicated that he would be a member. Mr. Cuming indicated that current HMHC members that are not reapplying would be best to assist, because anyone reapplying could be writing their own questions. Chair French approved of the idea but felt that only a small number of individuals would be necessary.

Mr. Nowak asked Ms. Rawlings if the proposed sub committee would have access to previous questions asked of members. Ms. Rawlings indicated that yes the questions would be made available.

Chair French put his name forward to be a part of the proposed subcommittee. He indicated that he has not reapplied He concluded that the formation of this subcommittee makes good sense.

The floor was opened up to other members that were not reapplying, the following were interested in joining:

Councillor McHattie  
Chair French  
Ms. Stewart-Greene  
Ms. Wray  
Ms. Charlton

**(Adkins/Kirk)**

That an advisory committee of retiring HMHC members be formed to develop recommendations with respect to selection questions for the consideration of the Selection Committee and report back to the Office of the City Clerk with recommendations.

**CARRIED**

**9. Buildings and Landscapes**

**(a) Endangered Buildings and Landscapes:**

**(i) Treble Hall, 6-12 John Street North, Hamilton (L) –  
Councillor B. McHattie**

Councillor McHattie stated that the property was purchased two months ago by a restoration architect who has plans to restore the building.

**(ii) Auchmar Gate House, 71 Claremont Drive, Hamilton (L)(R) –  
M. Adkins**

Mr. Adkins stated that the building was in bad shape.

- (iii) **St. Marks, 120 Bay Street South, Hamilton (D) – S. Stewart-Greene**

No update

- (iv) **Tivoli, 108 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – Councillor B. McHattie**

No update

- (v) **Book House, 167 Book Road East, Ancaster (L) – A. Charlton**

Councillor Ferguson indicated that the Mr. Mark Rudolf wanted to move the home from its current location to an alternate property owned by Mr. Rudolf. Councillor Ferguson stated that a zoning change would have to take place for this to happen but did not see this as being a problem. The proposed land is currently zoned for an oil depot.

- (vi) **The Royal Connaught Hotel, 112 King Street East, Hamilton (L) – M. Adkins**

Mr. Adkins has heard rumours but nothing concrete.

- (vii) **Andrew Sloss House, 372 Butter Road West, Ancaster (D) – A. Charlton**

No update

- (viii) **(Thomas Building) – 46 – 52 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – S. Stewart-Greene**

Ms. Stewart-Green stated the façade is currently being stored.

- (ix) **All Saints Church, 15 Queen Street South, Hamilton (L) - (A. Charlton)**

No update



**(x) Grove Hall, Hickory House, Gateview, Century Manor and surrounding landscape, 100 West 5<sup>th</sup> Street, Hamilton (L)(R)(D)– (A. French)**

Chair French indicated that a great deal of change has occurred on the property. A number of trees have been cut down and a chain link fence has been put up. He indicated that he does not know what the plans are moving forward and has no comment regarding the trees being removed.

**(b) Buildings and Landscapes of Concern**

**(i) Federal Building, 150 Main Street West (L) – M. Adkins**

Art French introduced the matter and spoke to the draft Motion which had been provided to the Committee. His points included but were not limited to the following;

- the item has been on the HMC Agenda under “Buildings and Landscapes of Concern” for awhile. Main visible heritage features are Elizabeth Holbrook’s bas relief sculptures on Main Street façade.
- Owner has now applied for a demolition permit, so there is urgency here.

Committee discussed the matter, and raised various questions. The staff responses included the following:

- Owner initially applied for a site plan approval, now has requested a demolition permit. These two applications do not need Council approval
- General Manager of Planning and Development Department had advised Planning Committee on January 18, 2011, that the proposed development on the site looked very positive, good news for the Downtown, was in favour of it
- Designation under the Ontario Heritage Act could be viewed as a management tool, the most effective tool to protect the historical aspects of the building
- Main challenge in designating is carefully describing the heritage attributes of the building
- how the Holbrook carvings are tied into the building is not known

- Gave example of William Thomas Building on James Street South, engineer's report was provided, described stabilization requirements, information used in preservation of heritage features

Councillor McHattie said he had heard that the owner was willing to preserve the artwork.

**(Adkins/Wakeman)**

**Whereas** the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee is aware that a demolition permit has been applied for in order to permit the demolition of the former Revenue Canada Building located at 150 Main Street West, Hamilton; and

**Whereas** the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee has identified the former Revenue Canada Building as a building of concern; and

**Whereas** the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee agrees with the findings of Building Report 93-110, prepared by Parks Canada for the Federal Heritage Buildings Review Office which conferred upon the property its second highest heritage rating of a "recognized building"

**Whereas** the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee has reviewed the requirements of Ontario Regulation 9/06, Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest for the purposes of designating property under Clause 29(1)(a) of the Ontario Heritage Act; and

**Whereas** the former Revenue Canada Building located at 150 Main Street West meets specified criteria in Ontario Regulation 9/06 including but not limited to:

- the design value being a representative example of Department of Public Works design embodying elements traditional to the 1950s, combined with elements of contemporary avant-garde practice according to plans drawn up by Hamilton architect Hugh D. Robertson of Husband, Robertson and Wallace with construction being undertaken by the local firm of Pigott Construction Company Limited; and,
- the incorporation of artistic works displaying a high degree of artistic merit notably bas-relief sculptures by renowned Canadian sculptor Elizabeth Bradford Holbrook depicting iconic images of

Canadian economic life (fishing, farming, lumber and industry) and Canadian wildlife (bears, caribou, beaver and geese); and

- the direct historical associations with the theme of post-war construction in Canada and the growth of 1950s government operations, activities and programs in response to population growth and public demand; and
- the associations with persons and institutions during the 1950s notably the new Minister of the Federal Department of Public Works, Robert Winter, and the new Deputy Minister, Major General H.A. Young; and
- the associations with work, career and achievements of local Hamilton architect Hugh D. Robertson of Husband, Robertson and Wallace, construction by the local firm of Pigott Construction Company Limited and the artist Elizabeth Bradford Holbrook; and
- contextual value as a landmark on Main Street West and in maintaining visual and historical linkages to its surroundings and other public buildings on Main Street West.

**And Whereas** the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee is mandated under Subsection 28(1) of the Ontario Heritage Act “to advise and assist the council on matters relating” to Part IV of the Act; and

**Whereas** Subsection 29 (1) of the Ontario Heritage Act enables the Council of a municipality to designate by by-law property that is of cultural heritage value or interest if such property satisfies the prescribed criteria; and

**Whereas** the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee is of the opinion that the property satisfies the prescribed criteria; and

**Whereas** the urgency of the current situation requires the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee to act immediately and with due diligence the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee respectfully advises as follows:

**That** the Notice of Intention to Designate 150 Main Street West, a designating by-law under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act and all other supporting documentation available within this period and any

other recommendations that may be reasonable and suitable in such circumstances be approved

**That** Council be advised that for the purposes of consultation with the Municipal Heritage Committee prior to the giving of notice of Council's intention to designate as required under Subsection 29(2) of the Ontario Heritage Act that this motion and advice shall be deemed to constitute such consultation and be in compliance with such requirement; and

**That** the Planning Committee support and direct such a designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act to be initiated and executed at the earliest opportunity and without delay; and

**That** the City Solicitor be directed to take appropriate action to designate the former Revenue Canada Building, 150 Main Street West, Hamilton, under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, in accordance with the Notice of Intention to Designate, attached as Appendix "B" to Report 11-001.

**CARRIED**

**(ii) Desjardins Canal, Dundas, Hamilton (R) – S. Nowak**

No update

**(c) Heritage Properties Update**

**(i) Auchmar, 88 Fennell Avenue West, Hamilton (D) – G. Zajac**

No update

**(ii) Lister Block, 28-44 James Street North, Hamilton (D) – Councillor B. McHattie**

Ms. House indicated that not much has changed since the last update. The building has been fully enclosed and is heated. The entrances do not have doors but are currently secured. The plaster reconstruction has been underway since the holidays. Interior store fronts have been sanded and repaired. Work has begun on the exterior store fronts as well. The location has full time security to prevent any problems on the site.

**(Charlton/Denham-Robinson)**

That the updates respecting item 9(a)(i) through 9(c)(ii) be received.

**CARRIED**

**10. GENERAL INFORMATION**

- (a) Year end summary regarding Heritage Application Permits. (J. Muller) (Item 10.1)**
- (b) Formal Membership of the Heritage Permit Review Subcommittee (PED102862) (D. Cuming) (Item 10.2)**
- (c) Request to Repeal Former Town of Ancaster By-law No. 89-88, Being a By-law to Designate 1051 Old Mohawk Road (Ancaster), Under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act (PED10239) (verbal update – M. House) (Item 10.3)**

Ms. House indicated that Council elected not to de-designate the property.

- (d) Correspondence regarding Erland Lee Home and Museum closure. (D. Cuming) (Item 10.4)**

Mr. Cuming indicated that the report sent from the last HMHC meeting will be sent to Council next week.

- (e) Hatt-Cooley Cemetery OMB Update. (J. Muller) (Item 10.5)**

Mr. Muller indicated that the cemetery is to be preserved as indicated through the OMB hearings conclusion.

- (f) Correspondence from Riverside Brass & Aluminum Foundry Ltd. (for information) (Item 10.6)**

Ms. Wakeman ask that Item 10.6 be forwarded to the Plaquing sub-committee

- (g) Information update – Notice of demolition of the building known as Hickory House and partial demolition of the Auchmar complex, B-wing located at 100 West 5<sup>th</sup> Street, Hamilton (St. Joseph's Healthcare Mountain Campus), being a property included in the City's Register of Property of Cultural Heritage Value of Interest**

**(M. House) (Item 10.7)**

**(h) Heritage Caledon Art Show (D. Cuming) (Item 10.8)**

**(i) Cootes Paradise Archaeology and Cultural History Open House  
(J. Muller) (Item 10.9)**

**(Kirk/ Wray)**

That Items 10(a),thru to 10(i) be received for information.

**CARRIED**

**11. NEW BUSINESS**

**12. ADJOURNMENT**

**(Charlton/Wray)**

That the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee meeting be adjourned at  
1:25 p.m.

**CARRIED**

Respectfully submitted,

Art French, Chair  
Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee

Christopher Newman  
Legislative Assistant,  
City Clerk's Office  
January 20, 2011