



CITY OF HAMILTON
PLANNING AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
Planning Division

TO:	Chair and Committee Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee
COMMITTEE DATE:	April 26, 2024
SUBJECT/REPORT NO:	Recommendation to Designate 2 Dartnall Road, Hamilton (Former Harris Grain Elevator), under Part IV of the <i>Ontario Heritage Act</i> (PED24057) (Ward 6)
WARD AFFECTED:	Ward 6
PREPARED BY:	Scott Dickinson (905) 546-2424 Ext. 7167 Alissa Golden (905) 546-2424 Ext. 1202
SUBMITTED BY:	Anita Fabac Acting Director, Planning and Chief Planner Planning and Economic Development Department
SIGNATURE:	

RECOMMENDATION

That the City Clerk be directed to give notice of Council's intention to designate 2 Dartnall Road, Hamilton (Former Harris Grain Elevator), shown in Appendix "A" attached to Report PED24057, as a property of cultural heritage value pursuant to the provisions of Part IV, Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, in accordance with the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED24057, subject to the following:

- (a) If no objections are received to the notice of intention to designate in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, City Council directs staff to introduce the necessary by-law to designate the property to be of cultural heritage value or interest to City Council;
- (b) If an objection to the notice of intention to designate is received in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, City Council directs staff to report back to Council to allow Council to consider the objection and decide whether or not to withdraw the notice of intention to designate the property.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This Report recommends designation of the significant built heritage resource located at 2 Dartnall Road, Hamilton, known as the Former Harris Grain Elevator, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The subject property, which is part of the Hamilton Conservation Area's Chippewa Trail, is currently listed on the City's Municipal Heritage Register. Staff have completed an evaluation of the subject property using Ontario Regulation 9/06 and determined that it has sufficient Cultural Heritage Value or interest to warrant designation, as per the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes attached as Appendix "B" to Report PED24057.

Alternatives for Consideration – See Page 7

FINANCIAL – STAFFING – LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial: N/A

Staffing: N/A.

Legal: The designation process will follow the requirements of the *Ontario Heritage Act* and provide for adequate notice of Council's intention to designate the property. Formal objections may be made under the *Ontario Heritage Act* and considered by Council before either withdrawing the notice of intention to designate or passing a designation by-law. Once a designation by-law has been passed, any further objection would be heard before the Ontario Land Tribunal.

Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* allows municipalities to recognize a property's cultural heritage value or interest, and to conserve and manage the property through the Heritage Permit process enabled under Sections 33 (alterations) and 34 (demolition or removal) of the Act.

Where alterations to designated properties are contemplated, a property owner is required to apply for, obtain, and comply with a Heritage Permit, for any alteration that "is likely to affect the property's heritage attributes, as set out in the description of the property's heritage attributes" (Sub-section 33(1)).

The City of Hamilton also provides financial incentive programs, including development charge exemption and heritage grants and loans, to assist in the adaptive re-use and continued conservation of properties once they are designated.

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The subject property located at 2 Darnall Road, Hamilton, shown in Appendix “A” attached to Report PED24057, is comprised of a three-storey concrete silo complex constructed in 1943, known as the Former Harris Grain Elevator. The subject property was first surveyed for potential heritage interest by the Inventory and Research Working Group of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee, who discussed the property at their meeting on January 24, 2022. As an outcome of that meeting, the Working Group recommended to the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee that the subject property be added to the Municipal Heritage Register and be reviewed as a candidate for designation under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. On April 27, 2022, Council directed staff to list the property on the Municipal Heritage Register and the property was added to the staff’s designation workplan for further research and assessment.

As a result of the recent *Bill 23* changes to the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the former staff workplan for designation was rescinded and replaced with a new public list of Candidates for Designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (see Report PED22211(a)), at which time 2 Darnall Road, Hamilton was reprioritized for review for designation by January 1, 2025. In a letter dated July 26, 2023, Cultural Heritage Planning staff notified the property owner, the Hamilton Conservation Authority, of the changes to the City’s heritage designation process and the reprioritization of staff’s review of the property for designation. On November 16, 2023, staff met on site with representatives from the Hamilton Conservation Authority to photograph the property and discuss the potential designation of the property. On January 30, 2024, staff provided the owner with a copy of the proposed Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest for their feedback and advised them of the Hamilton Municipal Heritage Committee meeting date that the recommendation would be considered. On February 16, 2024, representatives from the Hamilton Conservation Authority responded to staff, stating that they had no comments on the proposed Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS AND LEGISLATED REQUIREMENT

The Recommendations of this Report are consistent with Provincial and Municipal legislation, policy and direction, including:

- Determining the cultural heritage value or interest of a property based on design/physical value, historical/associative value and contextual value criteria (*Ontario Heritage Act*, Ontario Regulation 9/06);
- Ensuring significant built heritage resources are conserved (Provincial Policy Statement, 2020, Sub-section 2.6.1); and,
- Designating properties of cultural heritage value under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (Urban Hamilton Official Plan, Section B.3.4.2.3).

RELEVANT CONSULTATION

External

- Property Owner (Hamilton Conservation Authority); and,
- Rymal Station Heritage Group.

In addition, Planning staff have emailed the Ward Councillor (Councillor T. Jackson) for Ward 6 and provided an overview of the reasons for designation and the process for designating a property.

ANALYSIS AND RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDATION

The intent of municipal designation, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, is to enable a process for the management and conservation of significant cultural heritage resources. Once a property is designated, the municipality can manage change to a property through the Heritage Permit process to ensure that the significant features of the property are maintained.

Section 29(1) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* permits the Council of a municipality to designate property to be of cultural heritage value or interest where property meets two or more of the Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest prescribed in Ontario Regulation 9/06, as amended by Ontario Regulation 569/22, which identifies nine criteria in three broad categories: Design / Physical Value, Historical / Associative Value; and Contextual Value. The evaluation of cultural heritage value or interest of the subject property was completed by Cultural Heritage Planning staff based on a site visit of the exterior of the property conducted on November 16, 2023 (see photographs attached as Appendix “C” to Report PED24057) and available secondary and primary research sources (attached as Appendix “D” to Report PED24057). As outlined below, based on staff’s cultural heritage evaluation, it was determined that the subject property meets six of the nine criteria contained in Ontario Regulation 9/06 in all three categories.

Design / Physical Value

1. The three-storey concrete structure located at 2 Dartnall Road, Hamilton, known as the Former Harris Grain Elevator, was constructed in 1943. It has design and physical value as it is a representative example of a small Ontario grain elevator. It comprises three poured concrete circular silos in a triangular formation, attached together by a rectangular concrete central structure. A metal-sheathed, wood-frame, truncated-hipped roof covers the silos, with a gable roof extension covering the third. A small metal-sheathed, wood-frame “headhouse” structure projects upward from the hipped roof.

2. The property does not display a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit.
3. The property does not appear to demonstrate a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.

Historical / Associative Value

4. The property has historic value due to its direct associations with William Harris, the Binbrook Feed Mill, the Ontario home front during the Second World War, and the Historic Hamilton and Port Dover Railroad.

During the Second World War (1939-1945), Ontario livestock farmers were encouraged to greatly expand their operations to supply a large portion of Great Britain's demand for meat and animal products. At the same time, Western farmers were encouraged to switch from wheat production to the cultivation of 'coarse grains' suitable for livestock feed. As much of the demand for feed was during the winter months, transporting this Western feed to Eastern farmers represented a serious bottleneck to the already overstressed Canadian rail network. To help reduce this bottleneck, farmers and grain dealers were encouraged to purchase feed grains during the summer months to build up a stockpile as insurance against freight car shortages.

In 1943, grain dealer William Harris (1888-1959), proprietor of the successful Binbrook Feed Mill since 1924, responded to this encouragement to stockpile feed. Mr. Harris decided to construct a grain elevator that could insure a steady supply of coarse grain to local farmers. Although this feed mill was located at the corner of Binbrook Road and Highway 56, a lack of local rail connections convinced Mr. Harris to build his feed elevator more than eight kilometres away, at Rymal Station. Animal feed shipped by rail could be unloaded, stored, then loaded into trucks for delivery to farmers with only a small staff. The Harris elevator was used by Mr. Harris until his death, and then his son Arthur (1921-1985) until the 1970's.

A rail line running south from Hamilton to Port Dover had been considered since 1835, but issues in financing, as well as the technical difficulties of running rails up the Niagara Escarpment, meant that the line was only completed in 1878. Serious financial issues would also be behind the repeated merger and purchase of the rail line. Chartered in 1835, as the Hamilton and Port Dover Railroad by famed Hamilton politician and railroad booster Sir Allan Napier MacNab (1798-1862), little construction took place even after an 1853 attempt to revive the company and solicit investment. Serious construction would wait until the railroad was reorganized and renamed, first as the *Hamilton and Lake Erie Railroad* (1869) and later the *Hamilton and North Western Railroad* (1875).

Continued difficulties would require sequential takeovers by the *Northern* Railroad (1879) and the Grand Trunk Railroad (1884), until the line became part of the Canadian National Railroad in 1923.

Though it had gone by many different names, under Canadian National the rail line was known as the Hagersville subdivision, a branch line which ran local freight and passenger services to businesses and communities from Rymal to Port Dover. By 1987, the rails north of Stone Church Road were out of service, making Rymal Station the end of the line. In 1994, the Hagersville subdivision north of Caledonia was closed and dismantled. By this time the Harris elevator had been long out of use. Canadian National sold the right of way to the Hamilton Conservation Authority for use as a rail trail, and the former grain elevator became the property of the Conservation Authority.

5. The property has the potential to yield information that contributes to an understanding of how Ontario Agriculture responded to the pressures of the Second World War. Grain elevators like the subject property were built to supply the feed grain necessary so that Ontario farmers could meet the wartime needs of Great Britain.
6. The property does not demonstrate or reflect the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer, or theorist who is significant to the community.

Contextual Value

7. The property is important in defining the historical agricultural character of the area. As the neighbourhood of Hannon North has rapidly industrialized and urbanized, this property stands as a reminder of rural lifeways. The farms which required its services, and the rail line and passenger station which justified its location have vanished, but this property remains as a reminder.
8. The property is visually, historically, functionally, and physically linked to its surroundings. It is located in what was once a primarily agricultural area, well situated to be accessible to the farmers who wished to buy feed. The proximity to the historic Hamilton and Lake Erie rail line was necessary to ensure continued deliveries of feed to the property.
9. The property is a large, unique structure well positioned along the Chippewa Trail. The distinctive design of 2 Dartnall Road is extremely visible to trail users and to travellers along Dartnall Road. It is considered a local landmark.

Staff have determined that 2 Dartnall Road, Hamilton, is of cultural heritage value or interest sufficient to warrant designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* and

SUBJECT: Recommendation to Designate 2 Dartnall Road, Hamilton (Former Harris Grain Elevator), under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (PED24057) (Ward 6) – Page 7 of 7

recommend designation according to the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes, attached as Appendix “B” to Report PED24057.

ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION

Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the designation of property is a discretionary activity on the part of Council. Council, as advised by the Municipal Heritage Committee, may decide to designate property or decline to designate property.

Decline to Designate

By declining to designate, the municipality would be unable to provide long-term, legal protection to this significant cultural heritage resource (designation provides protection against inappropriate alterations and demolition) and would not fulfil the expectations established by existing municipal and provincial policies.

Without designation, the property would not be eligible for the City’s financial incentives for heritage properties, including development charge exemption and grant and loan programs. Designation alone does not restrict the legal use of a property or been demonstrated to affect its resale value. However, designation does allow the municipality to manage change to the heritage attributes of a property through the Heritage Permit process. Staff does not consider declining to designate the property to be an appropriate conservation alternative.

APPENDICES AND SCHEDULES ATTACHED

Appendix “A” to Report PED24057 – Location Map

Appendix “B” to Report PED24057 – Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest and Description of Heritage Attributes

Appendix “C” to Report PED24057 – Photographs

Appendix “D” to Report PED24057 – Research Sources

SD:AG/sd